May 15, 2024

## **NOTICE OF DENIAL**

Marc Grassi PUSH Design 2255 Wabash Detroit MI 48216

## **RE:** Application Number HDC2024-00170; 4428 Second; Willis Selden Local Historic District Project Scope: Replace windows, install fiber cement siding at rear

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on May 8, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission ("DHDC") reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on May 14, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the district's Elements of Design:

## Replace historic age wood windows, per the submitted documents and drawings.

Excepting the following items from denial:

• Replacement of non-historic windows, and installation of fiber cement siding at rear extension.

The Commission's reason for the denial is that:

- The wood windows, due to their thin sash profiles and deep setting within the openings, are distinctive character-defining features of this property.
- Standard Six states, "Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the
  severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the
  old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of
  missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence."
- Written estimate or testimonials from window repair companies confirming the existing windows are deteriorated beyond repair were not submitted. The submitted photos appear to show that most of the window sash are intact and in repairable condition.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards or Elements:

- Standard 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- Standard 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

## Standard 6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building 525 West Ottawa Street P.O. Box 30754 Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665 E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:

ander Dy

Audra Dye Detroit Historic District Commission