

City Planning Commission Regular Meeting

NOTE: These minutes do not represent a verbatim transcription of the meeting.

CITY PLANNING COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
February 6, 2014

APPROVED

I. Opening

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Carr in the City Council Committee of the Whole Room on the 13th Floor of the Coleman A. Young Municipal Center at 5:20 p.m.

Roll Call

Commissioners Carr, Christensen, Goss-Andrews, Gage, Simons, Russell and Williams were present. Commissioner Whitmore-Davis was absent (excused).

Amendments to and Approval of the Agenda

Commissioner Williams motioned approval of the agenda with the Commission addressing Item B before Item A. Commissioner Simons second the motion. Motion carried.

II. Minutes

Approval of minutes of the Regular Meeting of December 5, 2013

The Commission agreed to bring back the minutes of December 5, 2013.

Approval of minutes of the Regular Meeting of January 9, 2013

Commissioner Christensen motioned to approve the minutes of the meeting of January 9, 2013. Commissioner Andrews second the motion. Motion carried.

III. Public Hearings and Presentations (none)

IV. Unfinished Business

- B.** Consideration of the request of Volunteers of America for site plan review and approval for the proposed Bradby Village housing development within an approved PD (Planned Development) zoning district in the Elmwood Park 3 Urban Renewal Area.

Present: Jim Pappas, Architect, Fusco, Shaffer & Pappas, Inc.
Elterro Trent Carroll, Volunteers of America (VOA)
Bruce Evans, Planning & Development Department (P&DD)
Greg Moots, Legislative Policy Division

Legislative Policy Division staff member, Greg Moots, gave a brief presentation on the report dated January 20, 2014, distributed along with the meeting materials. The design of the project has substantially changed from the CPC review of this development that took place at the Commission's

City Planning Commission Regular Meeting

October 3, 2013 meeting. Planning & Development Department (P&DD) recommended the suggested changes; larger apartment building, parking and elevation. What was previously presented was a 65 unit 3-story apartment building and 20 units in 4 "cottage"/single-family four and six-unit attached one-story buildings has been revised to a three-story independent senior living apartment building with a mix of 55 one-bedroom units and 27 two-bedroom units for a total of 82 units for independent living for seniors.

Commissioner Carr asked how you get to the walkway around Bradby Drive.

Greg Moots answered through the parking lot.

Jim Pappas added that pedestrians can also get through on the west side. There is a pedestrian gate on the west side and a pedestrian gate on the north and the northwest corner also has a gate.

Commissioner Williams said he was concerned about the amount of cars for the units.

Greg Moots responded that the Zoning Ordinance requires .5 per unit.

Commissioner Williams asked if the plan makes sense as it relates to the Urban Renewal Plan. With senior bedroom units, you can allow two people.

Greg Moots added that there are 27, 2-bedroom units.

Jim Pappas said that the original design would have more spaces for cars, $\frac{3}{4}$ cars per unit or .33 cars per unit. After discussion with the P&DD it was split in the middle at .5 per unit.

Commissioner Carr said that you need to have a driveway directly to the bus stop.

Jim Pappas responded that they are encouraging everybody to go through the main access.

Commissioner Russell asked if the covered parking is factored into the 43 spaces.

Greg Moots responded there are 20.

Commissioner Russell said that they may need to add a few parking spaces.

Commissioner Gage asked if there is enough parking with other developments they have completed.

Jim Pappas responded yes.

Greg Moots said that the parking could be evaluated with P&DD and could come back to you. LPD staff can talk to the architect. That would alter the site plan, of course.

Commissioner Andrews said that Mr. Moots expressed my sentiments.

Elterro Trent Carroll said the age of the seniors is 59 and above.

Commissioner Andrews asked if it is mostly single seniors or husband and wife.

Elterro Trent Carroll answered that the majority are single.

Commissioner Simons asked how many spaces are allowed for visitor parking.

City Planning Commission Regular Meeting

Jim Pappas responded that typically for one building there are .5 to $\frac{3}{4}$ parking spaces on site. VOA proposes .5 at this location.

Commissioner Carr asked how the number of spaces for car ports were decided.

Jim Pappas responded that there will be additional costs for residents if they desire a car port.

Commissioner Gage said that if the bus stop is off Lafayette there may be a need for an additional bus stop for seniors.

Commissioner Russell asked if on street parking is allowed along Robert Bradby Drive.

Jim Pappas responded that there are no signs prohibiting parking there.

Greg Moots said that staff could verify if parking is allowed.

Commissioner Andrews asked if LPD staff could find about the frequency of the bus routes.

Greg Moots said staff could look at the bus schedule and bring the information back to the next meeting.

Commissioner Andrews added, along with the parking discussion.

Greg Moots said that the Board of Zoning Appeals will review the minor deviation to the Urban Renewal Plan.

Commissioner Carr asked Mr. Evans to speak on the P&DD opinion.

Bruce Evans said that Kahlil Mogassabi, Planning & Development Department will work with the architect and point out different options.

Commissioner Carr asked if P&DD approves of the number of parking spaces.

Mr. Evans responded this number came at the department's recommendation.

Greg Moots said that staff recommendations approval acknowledging parallel approval from the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Commissioner Russell suggested that if VOA could add ten more spaces for parking that would come to .6 spaces per building, 10 more and you are over .75. Add 10-12 spots and that would give you 53-65 spaces. You never know how many guests people may have.

Jim Pappas said that VOA would be happy to work with the Commission.

ACTION: Commissioner Russell moved to approve staff recommendation with additional analysis of the parking needs of the development, DDOT schedule and to add at least eight (8) more but not go over .7 parking spaces per unit, giving at least 51 spots. Commissioner Williams second the motion. Motion carried.

City Planning Commission Regular Meeting

- A. Consideration of the request of Norstar Development USA, L.P (developer) and the Detroit Housing Commission to modify the plans for the existing PD (Planned Development) zoning district presently shown on land comprising the central portion of the former Herman Gardens Housing Complex now known as Gardenview Estates, which is generally bounded by Joy Road, Tireman Street, Asbury Park Avenue, and the Southfield Freeway. The request would modify the existing PD created by ordinance #15-10 of 2010 and amend Article XVII, District Map No. 40 of Chapter 61 of the 1984 Detroit City Code, Zoning.

Present: Brian Vossburg, Detroit Housing Commission (DHC)
Jeff Taggart, Norstar Development
Jim Pappas, Fusco, Shaffer & Pappas, Inc.
Marcell Todd, Legislative Policy Division

Legislative Policy Division (LPD) staff member, Marcell Todd, gave a brief presentation on the project background and referenced the staff recommendation dated, January 20, 2014, distributed at the table. Plans for this development were previously presented at November 21, 2013 public hearing. The primary issue expressed at the public hearing was concerns from the Commission regarding the design of the project. Norstar has since modified the plans. The Commission has received a copy of the modifications along with the previously distributed meeting materials.

Jim Pappas said that the development maintains the existing street configuration. There were previous concerns with the facades, particularly the rear elevation of the buildings. The façade was modified and Norstar will be adding some gables to break up the roof line, a different type of siding and colors. Covered porches were also added.

Commissioner Carr expressed past concern about the patios and the glass doors on the back entry.

Commissioner Russell asked what materials will be used for the siding.

Jim Pappas answered that vinyl siding would be used in a combination of styles and colors. The patios are to be set about level with the ground because Norstar needs to meet all requirements of the Fair Housing, so there are no steps, but they need to raise the buildings up so they are not right at the ground.

Commissioner Russell asked if the entry way in the units would change (there is no vestibule at entry or separation of entryway from living space).

Jim Pappas said that all the units have small porches and are covered. There is just a small change in the flooring at the entry because there is a limit in the floor space in the units. The development has affordable rentals, and there is a large group of houses as part of the overall community. This design is set into the existing road pattern. Phase IV is a continuation of the community.

Commissioner Russell asked if the construction fences will be taken down.

Brian Vossburg answered that the construction fences will be taken down and on Tireman and Fairfield they will be completely replaced with a more permanent fence. The Detroit Housing Commission (DHC) is working with the City to see what the fence will look like. DHC wants something better than just chain link fences.

Commissioner Russell asked if Norstar will maintain the development, including the care of vacant areas.

City Planning Commission Regular Meeting

Brian Vossburg responded that DHC will be planting Urban Meadow mix in the spring. The mix only requires maintenance 1 to 2 times a year. DHC will maintain the property.

Commissioner Carr asked where the community house is located.

Brian Vossburg replied that it is on VanBuren Street (northeast of Phase IV) and can be reserved for community meetings.

Commissioner Andrews asked about the security for the site.

Jim Pappas responded they have a closed circuit security system and it will be available for the Police Department. The data will be saved at the site. This type of system data is usually stored for 30 days.

Commissioner Andrews asked if there is any space for a mini-station for Police to use.

Brian Vossburg responded that DHC has an agreement with the Detroit Police Department where Police can do their reports on site. The mini-station would be located in one of the apartment units in a previous phase of development.

Marcell Todd said that Norstar is asking for approval to allow for townhouses or patio homes on the Phase IV parcels S and T and for approval of the site plan and elevations. In addition, for the balance of that land, the option of single-family attached or even multiple family homes to be considered. Norstar would still have to come to the Commission for approval of corresponding site plans.

Commissioner Carr asked if the parking stalls meet site requirements.

Marcell Todd said they would like to ensure that it does. This condition was also added on the previous development to the north in Phases 2, 3C and 3D.

Commissioner Russell stated that DHC has changed from what was previously approved single-family to multi-family, but they still come before the Commission.

Marcell Todd said that if the Commission agrees to approve the remainder of the development, it would give DHC a sense of direction they could head in.

Commissioner Carr said that the concern in the past has been for promotion of home ownership and it seems appropriate for DHC to return to the Commission for each phase of the development.

Brian Vossburg said this is a change of market and preferences of housing. It is also an economic model to spread cost of remediation of the property. We are looking at all options now.

Commissioner Russell said that DHC is asking for the right to change the type of the housing.

Commissioner Carr noted that the request would mean approving the entire project when it could be twelve years before it is completed and that sit should come to the Commission at each phase.

Brian Vossburg said that the recommendation to allow both single-family and rental units was suggested in order to expedite future activity at the site; but, DHC would still have to come before the Commission either way.

City Planning Commission Regular Meeting

Marcell Todd said that it is not necessary to avoid a step. Anything other than single-family detached has to come before the Commission (and would come for site plan approval regardless).

Commissioner Carr asked what the timeline is for Phase 4.

Brian Vossburg said that in May they will be signing to close on the project and construction will begin.

ACTION: Commissioner Russell moved to approve staff's recommendation to allow single-family attached houses as recommended for Phase IV. Commissioner Andrews second the motion.

ACTION: Commissioner Simons moved approval of the site plan with conditions. Commissioner Andrews second the motion.

The request for approval for single family attached and multi-family housing types for the balance of the project site previously approved for single-family detached housing only was withdrawn by the Housing Commission.

- C. Consideration of the request of Jacob Isaac and Marcus LLC, on behalf of US Ice Corp. to show a B4 (General Commercial District) where a B2 (Local Business and Residential District) zoning classification is shown on Map No. 61 of Chapter 61, Article XVII of the 1984 Detroit City Code, Zoning, for the properties on the south side of Eight Mile Road West between Manor and Pinehurst Streets.

Present: Assad Aboe, US Ice Corp.
Greg Moots, Legislative Policy Division

Legislative Policy Division staff member, Greg Moots, gave a brief presentation consistent with the report dated January 20, 2014, distributed along with the meeting materials.

Staff has found no violations of the City Code filed against the owner/address. Staff recommends approval of the proposed rezoning.

ACTION: Commissioner Andrews moved to accept staff recommendation to approve the proposed rezoning. Commissioner Williams second the motion. Motion carried, with one opposition, Commissioner Simons.

IV. New Business (none)

VI. Committee Reports (none)

V. Staff Report

Legislative Policy Division staff member Marcell Todd informed the Commission that the final schedule of meetings for the Commission in 2014 has been confirmed by the Council President's Office. Staff will invite City Council to participate in Commission meetings and will meet with Council President Jones on Monday to discuss the matter. City Council Internal Operations Standing Committee met last week and Council Member Scott Benson, District 3, recommended a candidate. Interviews will be conducted on February 12, 2014 and Commissioners whose appointment has expired are expected to be interviewed. Staff will follow-up at Monday's meeting. Expirations are as follows:

City Planning Commission Regular Meeting

6/2013	Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Andrews and Commissioner Gage
6/2014	Commissioner Christensen, Commissioner Whitmore-Davis and Commissioner Williams
Vacant	District 3 (term will expire in 2015)

Legislative staff member, Marcell Todd discussed the Wayne State Physicians Group Building (Carpenter Plaza site at 3800 Woodward Ave.) that came before you and was approved by the Commission on August 1, 2013 (Actual date August 1, 2013). The matter has not yet come before City Council for a public hearing. But, there has been a change in the design, parking, square footage and an additional floor has been added to office building. LPD staff received the revised drawings and is asking if the Commission is were comfortable with staff forwarding the revised drawings to the City Council.

Commissioner Carr said that adding a floor sounds like a major modification since it may result in more use or activity in the building which seems to be a major difference from what was approved.

Marcell Todd said that four (4) stories were originally approved and now there are five (5).

Commissioner Gage stated that the parking approved was more than required by the Zoning Ordinance.

Mike Kirk, Newman-Smith Architects, said that they are adding parking. Detroit Medical Center (DMC) will sub-lease the top floor and it will probably be some kind of clinic space. Because of the additional floor, Newman-Smith is proposing to add 110 parking spaces.

Marcell Todd said that staff is asking for direction from the Commission.

Commissioner Russell asked for the timeline.

Mike Kirk said that they would like to go to Council as soon as possible.

Commissioner Russell said that there are a lot of tall buildings in the area and the height of the building is not out of character with the area, but the parking is below requirements for five stories.

Marcell Todd said that it exceeds what is required.

Commissioner Carr suggested staff prepare a report on the new proposal and send both the report and ordinance (when it comes from the Law Department) to City Council.

Commissioner Russell asked that the report include the adding of floor, change of façade and height of the building, as it relates to the appearance for that area.

Commissioner Williams asked if the number of people on the top floor is the same as the other floors.

Marcell Todd said that the square footage is the same. He is unsure of what DMC is planning to do with the space.

Commissioner Carr said that the Commission will need more information and asked what will happen to the restaurant currently located in the building.

Mike Kirk said that the restaurant and other businesses have relocated.

City Planning Commission Regular Meeting

Commissioner Williams said that staff should send City Council a recommendation. The Commission will need comments on the change, parking, total space, etc. It seems like the Commission is comfortable but would be more comfortable having it in writing. The Commission should recommend what we think is best for the Council. The Commission gives suggestions. Staff can make a report and send it forward.

Marcell Todd said that the report will come back to the Commission. Staff will send ordinance to the Law Department for them to begin to process. During that time, LPD staff could bring both ordinance and report to the next Commission meeting. The ordinance references the development proposal.

ACTION: Commissioner Andrews moved to accept staff recommendation to come back with report and ordinance for further discussion. Commissioner Russell second the motion. Motion carried.

VI. Communications (none)

VII. Public Comment – (none)

VIII. Adjournment (meeting adjourned at 7:35 pm)

ACTION: Commissioner Simons moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Russell second the motion. Motion carried.

/ss

J:\COMMON\JOANN\CPC Minutes\2014\February 6, 2014 CPC Minutes.docx