

DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

Date: February 8, 2023

Coleman A. Young Municipal Center, 13th Floor, Erma Henderson Auditorium

AGENDA (Actual time [audio recording time stamp])

I CALL TO ORDER (5:36 p.m. [00:00:00])

Chairperson Franklin called the meeting to order at 5:36 p.m.

II ROLL CALL (5:36 p.m. [00:00:30])

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION		PRESENT	ABSENT
Tiffany Franklin	Chair	X	
James Hamilton	Commissioner	X	
Roderick Hardamon	Commissioner	X	
Richard Hosey	Commissioner		X
Alan Machielse	Commissioner	X	
Dennis Miriani	Vice Chair	X	
STAFF			
Timothy Boscarino	PDD		X
Benjamin Buckley	PDD		X
Audra Dye	PDD		X
Garrick Landsberg (Director)	PDD		X
Daniel Rieden	PDD		X
Jennifer Ross	PDD		X

III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA (05:38 p.m. [00:02:00])

ACTION (5:38 p.m. [00:02:15])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that the agenda be approved.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES (5:39 p.m. [00:2:30])

Commissioner Machielse noted that he was not present on December 14.

ACTION (5:39 p.m. [00:02:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved that July 13, 2022 minutes be approved.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Miriani moved that December 14, 2022 minutes be approved.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: abstain

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Miriani moved that January 11, 2023, minutes be approved.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

V REPORTS (5:40 p.m. [00:4:30])

Director Landsberg provided an update on IT issues.

Director Landsberg provided an update on two new Historic District Commission appointees.

VI APPROVAL OF APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO CONSENT AGENDA (5:42 p.m. [00:06:00])

None

VII POSTPONED APPLICATIONS (5:42 p.m. [00:06:15])

None

VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS)

(5:43 p.m. [00:6:30])

None

IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (5:43 p.m. [00:06:45])

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8197 (5:44 p.m. [00:07:00])

ADDRESS: 15083 Minock

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Rosedale Park HD

APPLICANT: Evan Thomas

OWNER: Evan Thomas

SCOPE OF WORK: Demolish garage, erect garage, demolish addition, erect addition and deck, install vinyl windows, new entry door, gutters/downspouts, landscaping, wood siding

Staff provided a summary of the staff report.

Keith Bynum and Cheryl Bohren described the proposal.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (5:52 p.m. [00:16:15])

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (5:52 p.m. [00:16:30])

Commissioners Miriani, Hardamon, Machielse, and Hamilton discussed the importance of the front windows and suggested that the side windows and the garage were less important. Commissioner Machielse asked that the addition be inset from the corner of the house, and Commissioner Hamilton suggested the proposed addition is too large and out of proportion.

Commissioner Machielse suggested that the deck should not have a privacy screen.

Several commissioners said that new drawings would be needed to show the changes that have been discussed.

The applicant withdrew the application.

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-1310 (6:21 p.m. [00:45:00])

ADDRESS: 1310 Labrosse

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Corktown HD

APPLICANT: Josh Diverno

OWNER: Arturo Quiroz

SCOPE OF WORK: Construct Second Story on Approved Garage

Staff provided a summary of the staff report.

Josh Diverno, the applicant and builder, and Arturo Quiroz, the owner, described the proposal.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (6:22 p.m. [00:46:00])

Dorothy Bennick of 1406 Labrosse spoke in support of the wood grain siding.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (5:22 p.m. [00:46:30])

Commissioners Miriani, Machielse, and Hamilton pointed out that historic wood clapboard siding does not have a wood grain texture.

ACTION (6:23 p.m. [00:47:45])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8217 for 1310 Labrosse**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following condition:

The garage's cement fiber siding shall not display a textured/faux wood finish. Rather, the cement fiber siding shall have a smooth finish. Cement fiber siding with a textured/faux wood-grain finish is incompatible with the neighborhood's historic character as wood grain is typically not visible on painted historic-age, lapped wood siding. Rather, such siding would display a smooth finish due to application of multiple layers of paint over time.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8198 (6:25 p.m. [00:49:00])

ADDRESS: 1452 W Alexandrine

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Woodbridge Farm HD

OWNER: Edward Potas

APPLICANT: Infuz Architects Ltd.

SCOPE OF WORK: Rehabilitate building, install fencing, other site improvements

Commissioner Machielse stated that he is employed by the applicant, and recused himself, leaving the room.

Director Landsberg summarized the staff report, which stated that this is not a contributing building.

Joe Hudec, of Infuz Architects, noted that there are several support letters.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (6:28 p.m. [00:52:00])

Eric Waters of 4147 Lincoln spoke in support.

Brian Coe of 4104 Lincoln spoke in support.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (6:31 p.m. [00:55:15])

Commissioner Hardamon expressed support of the proposal.

ACTION (6:31 p.m. [00:55:30])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8198 for 1452 W. Alexandrine**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Machielse returned.

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8212 (6:32 p.m. [00:56:45])

ADDRESS: 4507 Amsterdam

HISTORIC DISTRICT: New Amsterdam HD

APPLICANT: Ross Hoekstra, McIntosh Poris Associates

OWNER: Sarah Pavelko, Greatwater Opportunity Capital

SCOPE OF WORK: Demolish addition and rehabilitate building

Staff summarized the staff report.

Ross Hoekstra, the applicant, explained the rationale for enlarging the historic window openings, noting that the proposed work was approved by the National Park Service.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (6:40 p.m. [01:04:30])

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (6:40 p.m. [01:04:30])

Commissioner Hamilton reiterated the staff recommendation, that it was acceptable to enlarge the window openings, but that the window openings should all be of a consistent size.

ACTION (6:41 p.m. [01:05:30])

Commissioner Machielse moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8212 for 450 Amsterdam**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The size of the window openings shall be consistent/regular at the building elevations that are visible from the public right-of-way (front and side elevations)
- HDC staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the final detail drawings and brick sample for the proposed rear/north elevation reconstruction. Should staff determine that the work item does not meet the SOI Standards, the item will be submitted to the Commission for review at a future meeting
- The applicant shall provide staff with the outstanding product cut sheets for the new single hinged doors which are proposed for installation at the side elevations

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8195 (6:45 p.m. [01:09:00])

ADDRESS: 849 Edison

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD

APPLICANT: Emily Sheeran

OWNER: Emily Sheeran

SCOPE OF WORK: Demolish rear porch, erect pergola, install aluminum-clad wood windows

Staff summarized the staff report.

Emily Sheeran and Thayer Morton stated that the pergola was erected by a prior owner, and noted the deteriorated and mismatched condition of the windows.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (6:58 p.m. [01:22:00])

None.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (6:58 p.m. [01:22:00])

Commissioner Miriani opined that the windows show deterioration, the storm windows are unsightly, and that one of the optional replacement windows would be appropriate and could be approved. Commissioner Miriani also suggested that the rear porch had been in poor condition and the demolition should be approved.

Several commissioners suggested that the window restoration quotes obtained by the applicant were high, and that it should be possible to find a more affordable estimate.

ACTION (ONE) (7:09 p.m. [01:33:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Regarding the demolition of the rear elevation two story porch and erection of the pergola on the rear elevation: Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8205 for 100 Longfellow**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed work **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (7:11 p.m. [01:35:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8195 for 849 Edison**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the installation of replacement windows **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that:

- The Commission must clearly understand the condition and repairability of the wood windows before replacement windows are considered.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Miriani: AYE
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0
MOTION CARRIED

X CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (7:16 p.m. [01:40:00])

None

XI PUBLIC COMMENT (7:17 p.m. [01:41:00])

None

XII APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (7:18 p.m. [01:42:00])

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8919 (7:18 p.m. [01:42:00])

ADDRESS: 1505 Chicago

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD

APPLICANT: Fred Hill

OWNER: Jaqueline F. Hill and Fred D. Hill, Jr.

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace fascia, gutters, rebuild porch

Staff noted that the applicant is not present.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (7:19 p.m. [01:43:00])

Commissioners Miriani and Machielse suggested that aluminum and vinyl were not appropriate historic materials.

ACTION (ONE) (7:20 p.m. [01:44:00])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8199 for 1505 Chicago**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the fascia and soffit replacement introduce non-historic materials that alter the appearance of a character-defining architectural feature.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the*

severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: not present

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes:4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (7:20 p.m. [01:44:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8205 for 100 Longfellow**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: not present

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8101 (7:21 p.m. [01:45:30])

ADDRESS: 94 E. Boston

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD

APPLICANT: Tarik Najib, Professional Contracting and Consulting

OWNER: We Buy Homes 123

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace terracotta roof tiles with asphalt shingles

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (7:22 p.m. [01:46:00])

Tarik Najib described the challenges with repairing or matching the existing tile.

Several commissioners stated that more evidence is needed; the tiles are important features and an asphalt shingle roof is not appropriate.

ACTION (7:29 p.m. [01:53:00])

Commissioner Machielse moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8200 for 94 E. Boston Boulevard**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work will destroy architectural features that characterize the property.

- The existing tile roof is a distinctive feature of the dwelling and garage. The historic roof tiles add a characteristic depth and color to the roof that help define the architectural character of the buildings that would be lost with the installation of asphalt shingles. As noted in Element 8 in the Elements of Design for Arden Park-East Boston *“Tile and slate roofing create textural interest, whereas asphalt shingles generally do not.”*
- The applicant has not demonstrated the roof is deteriorated beyond repair, nor that repair or in-kind replacement of limited areas of deterioration is not economically feasible.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8201 (7:31 p.m. [01:55:00])

ADDRESS: 761 Whitmore

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Palmer Park Apartment Buildings Local HD

APPLICANT: Kevin Brandon

OWNER: Robert Christoph Rci, 17664 Manderson LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Install vinyl windows, replace doors

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (7:31 p.m. [01:55:30])

Kevin Brandon and Joel Kiboski described the condition of the building when it was purchased in 2019 and described the rationale for the work that has already been completed. They suggested attaching false muntins rather than having to replace the windows.

Commissioners Miriani and Hardamon pointed out that the windows have already been installed without approval.

Commissioner Hamilton suggested that the windows are an appropriate color and muntin pattern, and said that it would be an improvement if the aluminum framing could be replaced with wood and brick mould. Commissioner Hamilton recommended that the applicant return with a different proposal.

ACTION (ONE) (7:46 p.m. [02:10:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8201 for 761 Whitmore**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of the original wood windows with vinyl windows **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work will destroy architectural features that characterize the property.

- The windows that were removed without approval were a distinct historic feature that characterized the property. The windows dated to the building's original construction and included divided light, 2/2 double-hung wood units.
- The application does not include documentation that the windows removed without approval were deteriorated beyond repair to an extent that merited their replacement.
- Vinyl material is not an appropriate material for the Palmer Park Apartment Buildings Historic District or this particular property.
- The introduction of between the glass muntins, which replaced the true divided light of the original wood windows, is not an adequate match for the original true divided light of the original windows.
- The current large aluminum brick moulds create a blocky appearance that destroys the refined dimensions and craftsmanship of the original wood brick moulds.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (7:49 p.m. [02:13:00])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8201 for 761 Whitmore**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The applicant provide HDC staff with a modified design for the four front entrance doors configuration for approval before installation.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8202 (7:51 p.m. [02:15:00])

ADDRESS: 15015 Ashton

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Rosedale Park HD

APPLICANT: Beverly J. Williams

OWNER: Lester M. Williams

SCOPE OF WORK: Install vinyl windows

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (7:51 p.m. [02:15:15])

Beverly Williams described the proposal.

Commissioner Hamilton said that the front of the house should not have vinyl windows as they would not match the wood windows on the first floor, and that the wood windows on the sides of the house should remain also.

Commissioner Hardamon asked if vinyl windows on the sides would be acceptable, as the commission has allowed this in other situations.

Brienne Williams, also representing the applicant, gave additional information on the condition of the windows, and read a statement from a contractor recommending replacement of the windows.

ACTION (ONE) (8:07 p.m. [02:31:30])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8202 for 15015 Ashton**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed replacement of the front façade wood windows **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that:

- The proposed work will remove historic features of the property and replace them with features of non-historic materials, dimensions, and appearance.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence*

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (8:09 p.m. [02:33:30])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8202 for 15015 Ashton**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed remaining work **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** replacement of the windows on the side facades of the home.

Commissioner Hardamon expressed the importance of consistency with prior approvals, noting that replacement of side windows has been approved or suggested with other properties in the past. Commissioner Miriani noted that each case is unique.

Staff pointed out that although the side windows are character-defining, they are minimally so, as they are few in number and not a component of a broader fenestration pattern.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Miriani: AYE
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8205 (8:15 p.m. [02:39:45])

ADDRESS: 100 Longfellow

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD

APPLICANT: Randy White

OWNER: Brandi Brown

SCOPE OF WORK: Renovate front porch and walkway, replace landscaping, repaint exterior

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (8:16 p.m. [02:40:00])

Commissioner Hamilton noted that there is masonry work that is not a part of the application; it will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. Staff confirmed that no application was submitted for the masonry work. The applicant stated that the balusters were removed and then will be put back in place.

Commissioner Hamilton noted that the deck is not visible from the street. Commissioners Hamilton and Franklin suggested that a change in brick color would help the new brickwork blend in.

Commissioner Machielse noted that the old brick that was removed was likely not a historic material.

ACTION (8:26 p.m. [02:50:00])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8205 for 100 Longfellow**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed work items in the application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The applicant provides a planting plan for review and approval by HDC staff.
- The light-colored band on the brickwork be stained to a more appropriate color submitted to staff for approval.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Miriani: AYE
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8206 (8:27 p.m. [02:51:30])

ADDRESS: 415 West Grand Boulevard

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Hubbard Farms HD

APPLICANT: Marcella Martinez-McNally

OWNER: Marcella Martinez-McNally

SCOPE OF WORK: Alter front and rear porch, replace walkways, install fence

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (3:27 p.m. [02:51:30])

Marcella Martinez-McNally stated that she was not aware of the Historic District Commission requirements when purchasing the house about a year ago. The applicant stated that rebuilding the porch would be prohibitively expensive.

Several commissioners suggested that adding landscaping in front of the porch would block the inappropriate work and would be better than painting the brick, and that concrete steps were acceptable.

ACTION (8:34 p.m. [2:58:00])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8206 for 415 W. Grand Boulevard**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed work **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following condition:

- A landscaping plan for foundation plantings be submitted prior to final approval of the new front yard paving, subject to staff review.
- Said landscape plan will include plantings around the extension of the brick porch/.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8207 (8:35 p.m. [02:59:00])

ADDRESS: 1405-1407 Bagley

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Corktown HD

APPLICANT: Kalissa Maxwell

OWNER: 1405 Bagley LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace vinyl siding

Staff noted that the report was revised today, and summarized the changes. Staff noted that the work was already completed without approval.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (8:37 p.m. [3:01:00])

Kalissa Maxwell, the applicant, and Bill Nouse, the property owner, introduced themselves and described the rationale for replacing the siding.

Commissioner Miriani asked about the type of siding under the new siding. Staff stated that there was some historic siding, and some non-historic siding, but the extent of each type was not known.

Commissioner Hamilton noted that this application is to replace vinyl siding with vinyl siding, and that no historic materials will be lost. Commissioner Hamilton also suggested that the vinyl siding has an appropriately narrow profile.

Chairperson Franklin left the room; Vice-Chair Miriani assumed the chair.

ACTION (8:43 p.m. [03:08:45])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8207 for 1405-1407 Bagley**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: not present

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8208 (8:45 p.m. [03:10:00])

ADDRESS: 4277 Leslie

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Russell Woods-Sullivan HD

APPLICANT: Heather Dell, Eyal Adler

OWNER: Vincent Fields

SCOPE OF WORK: Install vinyl windows

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (8:45 p.m. [03:10:00])

Heather Dell, the realtor and applicant, stated that the removed windows were in poor condition and the doors were non-historic, and that the owner was able to save some historic windows and other historic features. The realtor stated she was not aware that the house was in a historic district.

Commissioner Hamilton noted that several important leaded glass windows were lost. Commissioners discussed potential solutions.

Commissioners Miriani and Machielse suggested that the application be denied, and the applicant submit a new application with a fifteen-over-one and more appropriate color for the noted windows.

Chairperson Franklin returned.

ACTION (9:05 p.m. [03:29:00])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8208 for 4277 Leslie**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that:

- The windows that were removed without approval were a distinctive historic feature that characterized the property. The windows dated to the building's original construction and included true divide lite, double-hung and casement wood units. Each of these windows, which were removed at the front elevation also included lead coming at the top sash.
- The application does not include documentation that the removed windows were deteriorated beyond repair to an extent that merited their replacement.
- Vinyl material is not an appropriate material for the Russell Woods-Sullivan Historic District
- Between the glass muntins are not an appropriate replacement for the true divided light of the original wood windows.
- The meeting rails of the current vinyl windows do not meet.
- The stark bright white color of the new windows is not an appropriate color for the Tudor Revival style of architecture.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: abstain

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8209 (9:07 p.m. [03:31:30])

ADDRESS: 8469 E. Jefferson

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Indian Village HD

APPLICANT: John Biggar, Studio Zone Detroit

OWNER: Soaring Pine Capital, et al.

SCOPE OF WORK: Install fence, install french doors and windows

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (9:07 p.m. [03:31:45])

John Biggar, architect and applicant, expressed no disagreement with the staff recommendation.

Commissioner Hamilton expressed that he did not support a six foot front yard fence, as there are no other front yard fences in that area. The fence should adhere to the *Fence and Hedge Guidelines*.

ACTION (9:10 p.m. [03:34:45])

Commissioner Machielse moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8209 for 8469 E. Jefferson**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work with the condition that:

- Any front yard fence should conform to the *Fence and Hedge Guidelines*.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8210 (9:14 p.m. [03:38:00])

ADDRESS: 19515 Roslyn

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Sherwood Forest HD

APPLICANT: Kyle Phillips, Longtree Service LLC

OWNER: Robert Roos

SCOPE OF WORK: Remove mature shade tree

Staff observed that the applicant is not present.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (9:14 p.m. [03:38:30])

Commissioner Miriani stated that he agreed with the staff recommendation.

ACTION (9:14 p.m. [03:38:45])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8210 for 19515 Roslyn**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the removal of the honey locust destroys the historic character of this property and removes distinctive, character-defining features for the following reasons:

- The tree was identified in the historic designation slide and contributes to the historic landscape of the property and the neighborhood.
- There is no evidence that the tree is in poor health, poor condition, nor causing any damage to historic resources.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 4) *Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.*

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8211 (9:16 p.m. [03:40:00])

ADDRESS: 260 Arden Park

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Arden Park-East Boston HD

APPLICANT: Kellan Lee

OWNER: Kellan Lee

SCOPE OF WORK: Install new front entrance and fence

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION (9:16 p.m. [03:40:30])

Commissioner Hamilton left the room.

Jennifer Childs, representing the owner, described the proposal.

Commissioners Miriani and Hardamon expressed agreement with the staff recommendation.

ACTION (9:18 p.m. [03:42:30])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8211 for 260 Arden Park**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- HDC staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the final installation details for the new primary entry wood elements and door prior to the initiation of the work and issuance of the project's permit. Should staff determine that the work does not conform to SOI Standards for Rehabilitation, it will be forwarded to the Commission for review at a future meeting.

Commissioner Hamilton returned.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: abstain

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

XII CITY PROJECTS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (9:19 p.m. [03:43:45])

None

XIV OLD BUSINESS (9:19 p.m. [03:43:00])

None

XV NEW BUSINESS (9:19 p.m. [03:43:00])

RESOLUTION 23-02: DTE ELECTRICAL CONVERSION WORK IN HISTORIC DISTRICTS

Director Landsberg explained that DTE approached the staff regarding upcoming work in historic districts, but because of the broad nature of the work, a potential approval is best handled as a resolution rather than an application.

Julie Jozwiak, Danielle Browning, Alastair Smith, Andrea Ailer, Matt Smink, and Nicholas Lusk, of DTE, described upcoming work that will be in historic districts and citywide.

The representatives from DTE presented a plan to upgrade the power line infrastructure. All poles and wires will be replaced and tree trimming will be required.

Commissioner Franklin asked how the work could be done without damaging backyard surfaces and structures, and suggested that communities be adequately notified.

Director Landsberg said that staff has prepared a draft resolution addressing some of these issues. Staff mentioned that more direction would be needed regarding concerns such as staging areas, care for trees after they are cut, and replacement of trees that are lost.

Commissioner Franklin asked about wood debris being left behind.

Director Landsberg discussed conditions included in the draft resolution.

ACTION (10:10 p.m. [04:34:06])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

The Historic District Commission pass resolution 23-02.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Commissioner Miriani withdrew the motion.

Director Landsberg suggested that one or more commissioners form a committee and come back with a recommendation. Commissioners Hardamon and Franklin chose to join the committee.

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: N/A (10:13 p.m. [04:37:30])

ADDRESS: 3742 Cortland

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Russell Woods-Sullivan HD

OWNER: Grand Slam Property Group LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Demolition order/demolish fire-damaged building.

Staff described the emergency demolition order issued by BSEED for this property.

XVI ADJOURNEMENT (10:16 p.m. [04:40:00])

ACTION (10:16 p.m. [04:40:00])

Commissioner Machielse moved to adjourn the meeting.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

MOTION CARRIED

The Commission adjourned at 10:16 p.m.