

DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

Date: December 14, 2022

Due to COVID-19 restrictions, this meeting was held jointly in person and electronically via Zoom Meeting Link and audio-recorded.

AGENDA (Actual time [audio recording time stamp])

I CALL TO ORDER (5:42 p.m. [00:26:30])

Chairperson Franklin called the meeting to order at 5:42 p.m.

II ROLL CALL (5:43 p.m. [00:27:00])

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION		PRESENT	ABSENT
Tiffany Franklin	Chair	X	
James Hamilton	Commissioner	X	
Roderick Hardamon	Commissioner	X	
Richard Hosey	Commissioner		X
Alan Machielse	Commissioner		X
Dennis Miriani	Commissioner	X	
STAFF			
Timothy Boscarino	PDD	X	
Benjamin Buckley	PDD	X	
Audra Dye	PDD	X	
Garrick Landsberg	PDD	X	
Daniel Rieden	PDD	X	
Jennifer Ross	PDD	X	

III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA (05:43 p.m. [00:27:30])

Director Landsberg mentioned the resolution shown under New Business was not ready yet.

ACTION (5:44 p.m. [00:28:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that the agenda be approved, modified to omit the item mentioned by Director Landsberg.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES (5:44 p.m. [00:28:30])

Commissioner Hardamon noted that he was not present at the February and June meetings and will abstain.

ACTION (5:47 p.m. [00:31:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved approval of the meeting minutes for the February 9, 2022, and June 22, 2022, meetings.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: ABSTAIN

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 3 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (5:47 p.m. [00:31:45])

Commissioner Hamilton moved approval of the meeting minutes for November 16, 2022.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

V REPORTS (5:48 p.m. [00:32:15])

Director Landsberg stated that a nomination for the vacant Historic District Commission seat is being processed by the Mayor's Office. The director also noted that the terms of Commissioner Franklin and Commissioner Miriani are expiring in February.

VI APPROVAL OF APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO CONSENT AGENDA (5:49 p.m. [00:33:00])

None

VII POSTPONED APPLICATIONS (5:49 p.m. [00:33:45])

None

VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS) (5:50 p.m. [00:34:00])

None

IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (5:50 p.m. [00:34:15])

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8150 (5:50 p.m. [00:34:30])

ADDRESS: 84 Edmund Place

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Brush Park HD

APPLICANT: Immersive Design Studio PLC; Pierre R. Roberson, AIA, NOMA

OWNER: Blue Star Property Investors, LLC.

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect new multi-family buildings

Director Landsburg described the proposal. This is a vacant parcel that formerly contained a building, demolished around 1999. The proposal is to develop a nine-unit housing development. Staff recommends approval, as the design adheres to the Elements of Design, with conditions pertaining to the non-primary elevations.

Pierre Roberson, representing the applicant, had no additional comments.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (5:55 p.m. [00:39:30])

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (5:55 p.m. [00:39:30])

Commissioner Miriani asked about the conditions proposed by staff. Pierre Robertson agreed to the conditions.

Commissioners and the applicant discussed the appearance of the parapet.

Commissioner Hamilton discussed the appearance of the projecting bays surrounding the balconies, and the height of the building and the lack of an eave line, suggesting that these aspects were out of character for the district.

Commissioners Miriani and Franklin discussed the white color, suggesting that a color closer to limestone would be more appropriate.

ACTION (6:15 p.m. [00:59:00])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8150 for 84 Edmund** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The design be further developed at the non-primary elevations consistent with input from PDD Design Review and Historic staff. Upon receipt of an updated design, staff may approve the revisions for permit if consistent with the Elements of Design and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, or return the design to the Commission for further review if necessary.
- Product selections for exterior elements including but not limited to doors, windows and railings be provided for staff review.
- That the color of the fiber panels be reviewed by Historic staff to be consistent with historic design elements.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: ABSTAIN

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 3 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8151 (6:17 p.m. [01:01:00])

ADDRESS: 1451 Bagley

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Corktown HD

APPLICANT: Devan Caldwell, Ballpark Bagley, LLC; Alan Machielse, Infuz Architects

OWNER: Devan Caldwell, Ballpark Bagley, LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect addition, replace windows, replace storefront, add lighting

Staff described the proposal to rehabilitate the building and construct an addition. Staff suggested that historic wood siding is likely to exist under the existing T1-11 siding, and expressed concern with the fixed windows proposed at the second floor.

Joseph Hudec, the architect, introduced Devan Caldwell and Ryan Zampardo from Inkwell, and agreed regarding retaining any historic siding that may exist.

Chairperson Franklin noted that there were almost twenty letters received in response to this application.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (6:22 p.m. [01:06:15])

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (6:22 p.m. [01:06:45])

Commissioner Miriani spoke favorably of the project and supported the staff recommendations.

Commissioner Hamilton opined that double hung windows on the second floor would be more appropriate than fixed windows or windows with transoms.

ACTION (6:24 p.m. [01:08:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8151 for 1451 Bagley** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Photo documentation of the existing exterior wall cladding will be submitted to staff for review once the grooved plywood (T-111) siding is removed.
 - If original wood cladding is present, it will be retained. Paint color to be approved by HDC staff.
 - If no historic cladding is present, the composite siding specified for the new construction walls shall be approved.
- When the project is submitted for permit, the signage and mural will be removed from the drawing set.
- The second story windows on the new building be furnished with double hung windows similar to the existing building.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8058 (6:26 p.m. [01:10:30])

ADDRESS: 873 Virginia Park

HISTORIC DISTRICT: New Center Area HD

APPLICANT: Scott Krall, Blue Star Demolition Inc.

OWNER: John Brown

SCOPE OF WORK: Demolish house and garage

Staff described the proposal to demolish the house and garage, and recommends denial. Staff also described some soffit work previously done without approval. The house is contributing to the district.

John Brown, the applicant, expressed disagreement with the staff report, and explained the rationale for the soffit work. The applicant described an intent to demolish the current building due to its deteriorated condition and build an new building similar in appearance to the existing building.

Chairperson Franklin noted that the Commission has received at least four letters regarding this proposal; they have been uploaded to the website.

Director Landsburg noted that three letters are in opposition to the proposal.

PUBLIC COMMENT: (6:34 p.m. [01:18:00])

Jeffrey Cowan, president of the Virginia Park Block Club, spoke in opposition, and asked about a penalty for the work already completed.

Jodi Wise, a Virginia Park resident, expressed concern that the demolition of the house could interfere with efforts to obtain grant funding for the repair of the historic brick street, and expressed opposition to the proposal.

Marcus Frederich, a Virginia Park resident, spoke in opposition.

Tiffany Cook, a Virginia Park resident, suggested that if the building is demolished, there should be a requirement that it be rebuilt to its original form.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (6:54 p.m. [01:27:45])

Several commissioners expressed opposition to the proposal, noting that the house appears to be repairable.

ACTION (6:56 p.m. [01:29:30])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8058 for 873 Virginia Park** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

X CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (6:46 p.m. [01:30:45])

None

XI PUBLIC COMMENT (6:47 p.m. [01:31:00])

None

XII APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (6:48 p.m. [01:32:15])

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8156 (6:48 p.m. [01:32:15])

ADDRESS: 1241 Woodward

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Lower Woodward Avenue HD

APPLICANT: Thomas Teknos, Tek-Adams Foods

OWNER: KWA1

SCOPE OF WORK: Alter storefront, install walk-up window

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (6:48 p.m. [01:32:30])

Tom Teknos addressed the Commission.

Commissioner Hamilton suggested that a more symmetrical design would be more appropriate. Commissioner Miriani expressed similar concerns, emphasizing the importance of the entryway feature and the location.

ACTION (6:53 p.m. [01:37:15])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8156 for 1241 Woodward**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 1) *A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.*
- 9) *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Miriani: AYE
Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8153 (6:55 p.m. [01:39:15])

ADDRESS: 607 Shelby

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Detroit Financial HD

APPLICANT: Peter Han

OWNER: 607 Shelby Detroit LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Install wall signs

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (6:56 p.m. [01:40:00])

Commissioners Hamilton and Miriani expressed agreement with the staff report.

Staff noted that the applicant was not present.

ACTION (ONE) (7:56 p.m. [01:43:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8153 for 607 Shelby**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Miriani: AYE
Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8157 (7:00 p.m. [01:44:30])

ADDRESS: 1760 Van Dyke

HISTORIC DISTRICT: West Village HD

APPLICANT: Irma Louise Hunter

OWNER: Irma Louise Hunter

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace wood windows with new vinyl windows

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (7:00 p.m. [01:44:30])

Clinton Hunter, resident and applicant, described the proposal to replace historic windows on the house to match existing non-historic windows elsewhere on the house.

Commissioner Hardamon asked about the current non-historic windows. Staff replied that the windows were approved by the building department but the application had not been routed to the Historic District Commission as it should have been.

Commissioners Miriani and Hamilton suggested that the existing windows should be repaired; if they are unable to be repaired, they should be replaced with appropriate windows.

ACTION (7:10 p.m. [01:54:45])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8157 for 1760 Van Dyke**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8158 (7:12 p.m. [01:56:15])

ADDRESS: 4205 Fullerton

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Russell Woods-Sullivan HD

APPLICANT: Paul Windel, Windowpro

OWNER: Rufus S. Evans, Jr.

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace rear doors

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (7:12 p.m. [01:56:30])

Staff observed that the applicant is not present.

Commissioner Hamilton suggested that the leaded glass doors are distinctive and look to be in good condition and should be repaired and preserved; however, the storm doors are not historic and may be replaced with new doors that highlight the leaded glass doors.

ACTION (ONE) (7:16 p.m. [02:00:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8158 for 4205 Fullerton**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application to replace the leaded glass door with a sliding glass door **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (ONE) (7:17 p.m. [02:01:15])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8158 for 4205 Fullerton**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local

Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed replacement of the storm doors WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Commission issues the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that:

- Staff will approve an appropriate storm door design as submitted by the applicant.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8159 (7:18 p.m. [02:02:45])

ADDRESS: 4762 Cortland

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Russell Woods-Sullivan HD

APPLICANT: Kagan Gursoy

OWNER: Kagan Gursoy

SCOPE OF WORK: Alter roof, replace roofing, install vinyl windows and front door

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (8:19 p.m. [02:03:00])

The applicant stated that the doors and windows were missing when he bought the property from the Detroit Land Bank, and discussed other aspects of the proposal. The applicant stated that the cost of wood windows would be high in comparison to the house values in the area.

Commissioners and the applicant discussed the windows and the awning.

Director Landsberg reminded the Commission of the compatibility standard, which does not require that the missing historic windows be replicated. The commission agreed that one-over-one windows would be acceptable.

Staff and commissioners discussed the eaves, siding, and other aspects of the application.

ACTION (ONE) (7:40 p.m. [02:24:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8159 for 4762 Cortland**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of original windows with vinyl windows and the installation of vinyl siding below the front elevation windows, **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a **DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT
Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Miriani: AYE
MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (7:41 p.m. [02:25:15])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8159 for 4762 Cortland**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the other work items within the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Applicant supply HDC staff a wood door of similar design and style as the proposed door for approval.
- Applicant supply HDC staff with a detail of the missing front entrance trim and should this be found by HDC staff as a necessary element to the front entrance composition, that this element be included in the entrance for review and approval by HDC staff.
- Applicant supply HDC staff a drawing or detail product sheet that shows the proposed front porch roof's dimensions, materiality, color, and design before installation.
- Applicant use a material and design for the panels beneath the lower front façade windows as approved by staff as appropriate for this house.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8161 (7:43 p.m. [02:27:30])

ADDRESS: 1001 E. Jefferson

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Palms Apartment HD

APPLICANT: Thomas Roberts, AIA

OWNER: 1001 Jefferson LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Rehabilitate exterior, replace windows and doors

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (7:43 p.m. [02:27:45])

The applicant discussed the proposal to replace windows and doors and stated agreement with the conditions described by staff.

ACTION (7:53 p.m. [02:37:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8161 for 1001 E. Jefferson**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The double doors at the Rivard Street entrance be retained.
- The HDC is supplied with detailed window drawings that provide a clear comparison between the existing windows and proposed windows as they will be installed in the existing openings. The drawings will provide details for comparison of the overall dimensional changes in the sash, as well as exterior trim and brick mold configurations. If the details do not illustrate an acceptable match that can be approved at the staff level, the windows will be returned to the Commission for review

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8162 (7:54 p.m. [02:38:15])

ADDRESS: 15350 Grandville

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Rosedale Park HD

APPLICANT: Linda Hribar, Weathergard Windows

OWNER: Carole Smith and Eboni Chavers

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace six casement windows with vinyl windows

Chairperson Franklin left the room, assigning Commissioner Miriani to chair the meeting in her absence.

Staff noted that the applicant is not present.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (7:54 p.m. [02:38:45])

Commissioners Miriani and Hamilton observed that the existing windows do not appear to be in poor condition, and the proposed windows are not appropriate.

Chairperson Franklin returned.

ACTION (8:01 p.m. [02:45:30])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8162 for 15350 Grandville**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8163 (8:02 p.m. [02:46:30])

ADDRESS: 2418 Longfellow

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD

APPLICANT: Linda Hribar, Weathergard Windows

OWNER: Jaqueline Frazier

SCOPE OF WORK: Install vinyl windows

Staff noted that the applicant is not present.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (8:03 p.m. [02:47:00])

Commissioner Hamilton observed that the existing windows do not appear to be in poor condition, and the proposed windows are not appropriate.

ACTION (9:58 p.m. [02:48:45])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8163 for 2418 Longfellow**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8164 (8:05 p.m. [02:49:45])

ADDRESS: 19630 Roslyn

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Sherwood Forest HD

APPLICANT: Linda Hribar, Weathergard Windows

OWNER: Ladonna Barnes

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace vinyl windows

Staff noted that the applicant is not present.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (8:06 p.m. [02:50:00])

Commissioner Hardamon expressed agreement with the staff recommendation.

ACTION (8:07 p.m. [02:51:00])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8164 for 19630 Roslyn**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 1) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8165 (8:08 p.m. [02:52:00])

ADDRESS: 3385 Cambridge

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Sherwood Forest HD

APPLICANT: Brendan McGlinch, McGlinch & Sons

OWNER: Steve Lewis

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace wood shake roof with asphalt shingles

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (8:08 p.m. [02:52:30])

Steven Lewis introduced Brendan McGlinch and Marvin Bolish. The applicant described a proposal to replace the roof. According to the applicant, a home inspector and the insurance company agreed that the roof is in need of replacement. The proposal is intended as a cost-effective approximation of the historic cedar roof.

Brendan McGlinch described the proposed roof material and the condition of the existing roof.

Commissioner Hamilton opined that the proposed material is of a high quality, but it is not as appropriate as cedar. Commissioner Miriani noted that although wood shakes are expensive, wood shingles might be more affordable; the applicant has not obtained a cost estimate for wood shingles.

Commissioner Hardamon suggested that the house might have had a slate roof originally, in which case the proposed replacement would be appropriate.

ACTION (8:20 p.m. [03:04:00])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8165 for 3385 Cambridge**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of the shake roof with asphalt roofing **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work. This Certificate of Appropriateness, if the applicant decides, would also be for a wood shingle roof.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: ABSTAIN

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 3 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8166 (8:22 p.m. [03:06:30])

ADDRESS: 7441 Second

HISTORIC DISTRICT: New Center Area HD

APPLICANT: Raid Jamil, Hamilton Anderson Associates

OWNER: Midnight Golf

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace windows and roof to include removal of HVAC and television broadcasting equipment

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (8:23 p.m. [03:07:45])

Rainy Hamilton, Sam Ashley, Rene Fluker, and Harold Curry described the application. They stated that the antenna would be costly to maintain and has little architectural value. The applicants also described the difficulty of repairing and restoring the windows.

Commissioner Hardamon suggested that the antenna was not significant.

Commissioners Miriani and Franklin agreed that the antenna would be difficult to maintain.

Commissioner Hamilton opined that the antenna was not a significant architectural feature.

Commissioners Hamilton, Franklin, and Miriani agreed that the windows appeared to be in good condition.

ACTION (ONE) (8:43 p.m. [03:27:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8155 for 7441 Second**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of the existing windows WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (8:44 p.m. [03:28:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8155 for 7441 Second**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Miriani: AYE
Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8167 (8:47 p.m. [03:31:30])

ADDRESS: 12142 Broadstreet

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Russell Woods-Sullivan HD

APPLICANT: Razel Remen, Motown Umoja, LLC

OWNER: Razel Remen

SCOPE OF WORK: Install aluminum-clad wood windows and vinyl windows

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (8:48 p.m. [03:32:00])

Commissioners discussed the application.

Commissioner Hamilton noted that some windows, such as the leaded glass windows above the front door, have been removed. Commissioner Hamilton asked if they were removed by the current owner or if they were removed prior to the purchase of the house. The applicant responded that the windows were missing prior to when the house was purchased by the applicant; staff confirmed that this is supported by city records.

Commissioners Miriani and Franklin suggested that a compatibility standard should be used, rather than requiring replication, since the windows were already missing.

The applicant expressed concern that expensive wood or aluminum clad windows might be stolen since there are no occupied buildings on the block.

ACTION (ONE) (9:00 p.m. [03:44:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8167 for 12142 Broadstreet**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed window installation on the north, east, and south elevations, and the installation of the two windows above the front entrance bay **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities*

and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (09:01 p.m. [03:45:30])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8167 for 12142 Broadstreet**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The choice of simulated muntins and sash color shall be subject to approval by staff.
- Historic wood mullions on the front (west) façade will be preserved or, if missing, replicated.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8170 (9:03 p.m. [03:47:15])

ADDRESS: 4370 Glendale

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Russell Woods-Sullivan HD

APPLICANT: Anthony King

OWNER: India Marshall

SCOPE OF WORK: Rehabilitate house

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (9:03 p.m. [03:47:45])

Anthony King, the applicant, described the work that was completed, including the vinyl siding, the overhangs on the windows, the back deck, the painted brick, and discussed security concerns. The vinyl siding was added before the applicant purchased the property.

Commissioners discussed the possibility of painting the brick a contrasting color, such as red, and replacing the lost window overhangs. Commissioners and the applicant also discussed vinyl windows.

ACTION (ONE) (9:27 p.m. [04:11:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8170 for 4370 Glendale**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed replacement of the windows WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (9:28 p.m. [04:12:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8170 for 4370 Glendale**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines that the remaining application items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- That all brick elements that were painted be painted in a color approved by staff
- That the back porch, once it is dry, be stained an appropriate color that is approved by staff.
- That the original front overhangs on both the lower and upper window be restored with the design and colors to be approved by staff.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

XIII CITY PROJECTS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (9:30 p.m.
[04:14:35])

None

XIV OLD BUSINESS (9:30 p.m. [04:14:30])

None

XV NEW BUSINESS (9:30 p.m. [04:14:30])

None

XVI ADJOURNEMENT (9:30 p.m. [04:14:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved to adjourn the meeting at 9:30 p.m.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Miriani: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

LIST OF ACRONYMS

- Building Safety Engineering, and Environmental Department (BSEED)
- Historic District (HD)
- Historic Designation Advisory Board (HDAB)
- Historic District Commission (HDC)
- HDC Staff
 - AD: Audra Dye
 - TB: Timothy Boscarino
 - BB: Benjamin Buckley
 - DR: Dan Rieden
 - GL: Garrick Landsberg
 - JR: Jennifer Ross
- Planning & Development Department (PDD)