DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

Date: May 11, 2022

Due to COVID-19 restrictions, this meeting was held jointly in person and electronically via Zoom Meeting Link and audio-recorded.

[Actual AGENDA

Time] /
Audio
Recording
Time Stamp

[05:46 pm] I CALL TO ORDER

00:59:15 Chair Franklin called the meeting to order at 5:46 p.m.

[05:46 pm] <u>II ROLL CALL</u> 00:59:15

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION		PRESENT	ABSENT
Tiffany Franklin	Chair	X	
James Hamilton, Detroit	Commissioner	X	
Richard Hosey, Detroit	Commissioner	X	
Brandon Lockhart, Detroit	Commissioner	X	
Dennis Miriani, Detroit	Vice Chair	X	
STAFF			
Brendan Cagney	PDD	X	
Audra Dye	PDD	X	
Garrick Landsberg	PDD	X	
Daniel Rieden	PDD	X	
Jennifer Ross	PDD	X	

[05:47 pm] <u>III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA</u>

01:00:15 Commissioner <u>Hamilton</u> moved to approve the Agenda.

Commissioner Miriani - SUPPORT

 $\begin{array}{ll} Ayes-5 & Nay-0 \\ \textbf{MOTION CARRIED} \end{array}$

[05:48 pm] IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

01:00:33 Commissioner Miriani moved to approve the April 13, 2022 Meeting Minutes:

Commissioner Hosey - SUPPORT

 $\begin{array}{cc} Ayes-5 & Nay-0 \\ \textbf{MOTION CARRIED} \end{array}$

[05:49 pm] V REPORTS

Director Landsberg reported on the following items:

• Candidates are being interviewed for the two open Commissioner positions and hope to have an announcement in the June HDC meeting.

[05:50 pm] VI APPROVAL OF APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO CONSENT AGENDA

01:02:33 None

01:01:33

[05:50 pm] VII POSTPONED APPLICATION

01:02:33 None

<u>VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS)</u>

[05:50 pm] 01:02:33 • APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: NA

ADDRESS: 1977 Woodbridge

HISTORIC DISTRICT: *Adjacent to* McGregor Carriage House HD **APPLICANT/OWNER:** Detroit Economic Growth Corporation

SCOPE OF WORK: Demolish flanking buildings, erect new additions, general

rehabilitation

PROPOSAL: The DEGC has awarded the project to a developer who plans to rehabilitate the center (older) 2-story portion and create two new flanking additions to replace the existing ones. The property will become a cigar bar.

[05:54 pm] 01:06:33 **COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS**

• Commissioners comment that the proposal would have a beneficial effect.

ACTION

[05:54 pm] 01:06:33

Commissioner <u>Hamilton</u> moved that:

I move that the Commission find that the proposed project at 1977 Woodbridge <u>will</u> have a demonstrable effect on the McGregor Carriage Historic District, and; that such demonstrable effect is likely to be <u>beneficial</u>, due to <u>protecting the integrity of the building in the neighborhing historic district</u>: That the determination of the Commission be reported to the Mayor and City Council for their consideration.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT Ayes –5 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0 MOTION CARRIED

[05:56 pm] 01:08:33 • APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: NA

ADDRESS: 12710 & 12716 Dexter

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Russell Woods-Sullivan HD

SPONSORING CITY AGENCY/AUTHORITY: Detroit Building Authority

OWNER: City of Detroit/Planning And Development Department

SCOPE OF WORK: Sale of city-owned property

PROPOSAL: Because the parcels proposed for sale are owned by a City agency/authority and are located within the boundaries of a local historic district, at this time the Commission is acting only per Section 21-2-5 of the 2019 Detroit City Code to provide an advisory opinion concerning the potential "demonstrable effect" on the Russell Woods-Sullivan Historic District, which opinion will be forwarded to the Mayor and City Council for their consideration in their own review/approval of such discretionary city actions. No permit application (i.e., Certificate of Appropriateness) is under consideration at this time. Should a permit application for additions, demolition, or new construction for in-district properties be received and docketed, such application will be scheduled, advertised, heard, and considered at a future Commission meeting as a public hearing, per Sections 21-2-73, 21-2-75, 21-2-77, and 21-2-78 of the 2019 Detroit City Code. Only at that time would a final action occur. Decision or opinions entered today by the Commission do not bind the Commission in their later consideration of a permit application.

Per the submitted materials, the potential owners of the subject parcels own the property/the Dexter Car Wash and Vacuum which is to the direct north of 12710-12716 Dexter. They hope to rehabilitate the building for use as office for their business as well as a "...space for collaborating with other potential business partners and like-minded business people." Specifically, per the submittal, upon purchase of the property, the potential owners propose to undertake the following exterior work items:

- Repair windows
- o Replace windows
- o replace existing concrete walkway
- Add landscaping (shrubs, flowers, and turf)
- o Remove trees
- o Replace the existing asphalt shingle roof
- Install exterior light fixtures

[05:56 pm]

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

01:08:33

None

[05:56 pm] 01:08:33 ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

I move that the Commission find that the proposed project at 12710 & 12716 Dexter <u>will</u> have a demonstrable effect on the Russell Woods-Sullivan Historic District, and; that such demonstrable effect is likely to be <u>beneficial</u>, due to <u>the fact that it will reactivate property in the neighborhood</u> and have no conditions; that the determination of the Commission be reported to the Mayor and City Council for their consideration.

Commissioner Lockhart – SUPPORT Ayes – 5 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0

MOTION CARRIED

IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

[05:58 pm] 01:11:33 • APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7798 JR

ADDRESS: 1450 Sixth (Workers Row House) **HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Corktown HD **APPLICANT/OWNER:** Timothy McKay

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect scaffolding and canopy cover over building

PROPOSAL: With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to erect scaffolding and a canopy over the building. A tarp which is made of "an industrial outdoor material" will be secured to the building's roof via straps which will be affixed to the canopy/antenna trussing tower. Please see the submitted renderings and narrative for a detailed description of the project. The structure is proposed to be in place for "approximately 12 months."

[06:13pm] 01:25:33

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

5:33 o 1

o None

[6:13 pm] 01:25:33 END (AUDIO)

[6:03pm] 01:16:33

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- Applicant—Timothy McKay described new roof material that was delivered to Staff an hour before the meeting and described history of the project.
- Commissioners requested more information on scaffolding and its purpose. The applicant described the structures soundness and purpose to dry out the structure.

[6:15 pm] 01:28:33 **ACTION**

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7798 for 1450 Sixth**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

• The structure, as proposed, may stay in place up to twelve (12) calendar months from the date of installation and shall be removed after that time. Should the structure need to remain in place beyond 12 calendar months, the property owner shall provide a new application for the structure to the Historic District Commission for consideration/review and approval.

Commissioner <u>Hamilton</u> – SUPPORT Ayes –5 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0 **MOTION CARRIED**

[06:17 pm]

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7799 AD

01:29:33

ADDRESS: 605 Chicago

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD APPLICANT/OWNER: Kevin Prihod SCOPE OF WORK: Erect addition

PROPOSAL: Erect a one-story addition (22'3" wide x 14'8-1/2" deep) on the west

elevation, at the rear of the house.

[06:22 pm]

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

01:34:33

None

[06:22 pm] 01:34:33 END (AUDIO)

[6:19 pm] 01:31:33

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

• Applicants Kevin Prihod & Mary Zatina are present and wanted to correct the record on the roof and windows that were shown in drawings. They will adjust the drawings so that the roof doesn't interfere with the limestone band.

No comments from the Commission.

[06:22 pm] 01:34:33

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7799 for 605 Chicago**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

• The drawings will be revised to address the following issues: removal of square vents and specification of tile ridge vents, visual confirmation that the

roof ridge will terminate below the second story stone trim, correction of window color, trim specification, and muntin profile.

Commissioner Hosey - SUPPORT Ayes –5 Nay - 0 Abstain - 0MOTION CARRIED

[06:23 pm] 01:36:33

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7800 AD

VIOLATION NUMBER: 595 ADDRESS: 2010 Chicago

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD APPLICANT/OWNER: George Shihadeh

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect garage

PROPOSAL: Erect a 24'-8" x 24'-8" single-story detached garage.

- Roof CertainTeed Landmark Pro asphalt shingle, Weathered Wood
- Siding James Hardie Lap Siding, smooth surface, Light Mist
- Garage Door 16' x 7' 16-panel solid door, Sandtone
- Entry Door 36" x 80" nine-light/ half-panel primed steel door.
- Window 36" x 55" aluminum frame double-hung (1/1) window, brown.
- All siding, doors, window, and trim to be painted B:8 Grayish Brown.

[06:29 pm]

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

None

END (AUDIO)

01:43:33 [06:29 pm] 01:43:33 [6:27 pm] 01:41:33

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- The applicant, George Shihadeh, is present and stated that he would have the drawings updated to the staff's recommendation.
- Staff added that vinyl windows were identified as a violation but not added in the application.
- Commissioners comment on the hardie siding and would like to add to the conditions that the smooth surface side be used, not the wood-grain side.
- Commissioner raised question regarding the vinyl windows. Applicant states he purchased the house with those in place at time of purchase and believes that they were in place 3 years prior to the purchase of the house. Staff confirmed that there are some in the front and back side of the house.

[6:30 pm] 01:44:33

ACTION

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #22-7800 for 2010 Chicago, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

Notes specifying the style, material and color of the overhead and entry doors be added to the drawings.

- The hardie-board siding specification shall be smooth and color will be added to the drawings and corrected on the wall section.
- If exterior lighting is selected, catalog cuts will be submitted to staff for review and approval.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT Ayes –5 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0 MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

There is a modification to change the language of the motion to state that the work is reviewed and approved by HDC staff before a permit is issued.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT Ayes –5 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0 MOTION CARRIED

[06:45 pm] 01:58:30

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7801 JR

VIOLATION NUMBER: 594
ADDRESS: 1310 Labrosse

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Corktown HD

APPLICANT: Josh Diverno **OWNER:** Arturo Quiroz

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect garage

PROPOSAL: The applicant is proposing to erect a new garage with loft/storage above at the property's rear yard. Specifically, per the submitted proposal, the new garage shall be built according to the following:

- The building shall have a footprint which measures 22'x24' and shall be 21' in height.
- The exterior walls will be clad with textured cement fiberboard, painted yellow to match the home.
- A steel overhead door (color white) will be located at the "front elevation" per the construction drawing, while a single steel person door will be located at the rear elevation.
- A paired vinyl slider window will be located at the front elevation gable end.

[06:52 pm] 02:11:54

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

- Vincent Keenan, homeowner and applicant's neighbor, supports the proposal.
- Hunter Kurtz, resident and neighbor, supports the proposal.
- Debra Walker, resident, supports the tarp on Sixth Street (previous) proposal.
 END (AUDIO)

[07:00 pm] 02:14:54 [6:51 pm] 02:40:18

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- The applicant, Josh Diverno, is present and showed a sample of the hardie board which matches the house. It has a woodgrain board and wants to use this. The applicant has no issue with the window recommendations.
- The homeowner, Arturo Quiroz, is also present and asked the Commissioners to explain why previous work was approved with woodgrain surface. The Commissioners stated that the woodgrain is not historic, even though that it was previously approved by the HDC on this property for the house, it is not recommended for the garage.

Staff confirmed that there is no vinyl siding on the house. Staff also described the violations on the house and its history.

[7:01 pm] 02:15:54

ACTION

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #22-7801 for 1310 Labrosse, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The garage's cement fiber siding shall not display a textures/faux wood finish. Rather, the siding shall have a smooth finish.
- The front-elevation, gable-end fenestration shall not be vinyl. Also, slider windows shall not be installed at this location. If windows are to be installed at the new garage, they shall be wood or aluminum-clad wood, 1/1, doublehung units.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT Nay - 0 Abstain - 0**MOTION CARRIED**

[07:02 pm] 02:16:54

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7802 GL

ADDRESS: 150 W Boston

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD **APPLICANT/OWNER:** Dr. Devon Hoover

DESIGNER/CONTRACTOR: Art Harrison Design, Alitex Limited

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect greenhouse

PROPOSAL: Per the submitted drawings, documents, and scope of work, the applicant is proposing to erect a greenhouse adjacent to the existing carriage house, at the location of a former greenhouse. The size is approximately 34' by 16' with a lobby entrance extending an additional 4' to the east and an overall height of approximately 13' The work proposed includes the following:

- Installation of new underground service lines
- Removal of existing (cast-in-place concrete) greenhouse wall and foundations
- Remove tree at corner of fence for access
- Excavation and installation of concrete slab/foundations
- Insulated brick kneewalls about 2' high, with stucco texture/color to match the carriage house, capped with bluestone
- Bluestone pavers at entry walk
- Premanufactured ornamental aluminum and glass greenhouse structure

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

[07:11 pm] 02:23:54

[07:11 pm]

• None

02:23:54

END (AUDIO)

[7:09 pm] 02:21:54

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

The applicant, Dr. Devon Hoover, is present and described the background on the greenhouse and the house.

• No comments from the Commission.

[7:11 pm] 02:24:54

ACTION

Commissioner Lockhart moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7802 for 150 W. Boston,** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Any fencing temporarily removed shall be stored and returned to position; and.
- Any major landscaping impacted by the project, including the tree at corner of fence required for access, be replaced in kind.

Commissioner <u>Hamilton</u> – SUPPORT Ayes –5 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0 **MOTION CARRIED**

[07:13 pm] 02:26:54

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7803 AD

ADDRESS: 1201 Washington

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Washington Blvd. HD **APPLICANT:** Brian Rebain, Kraemer Design Group

OWNER: Innovative Acquisitions LLC **SCOPE OF WORK:** Erect penthouses

PROPOSAL:

The description of work listed below is an abridged version of the items described in the applicant's narrative letter.

Masonry

- Clean: All stone will be cleaned with a light duty detergent and low-pressure water rinse prior to any masonry work to allow matching of stone and mortar color.
- Repair: The many small holes found across the façade from former signage locations will be patched with matching materials. Loose or displaced pieces will be reset.
- Repointing: Mortar will match the color, texture, compressive strength, joint width, and joint profile of the existing mortar.
- Replace: Badly damaged stones will be replaced with new Indiana limestone selected to match the existing in color, profile, and finish

New West Wall

- A new western façade, constructed at the open end of the building where the two structural bays were demolished, will be clad in buff colored brick to match the alley brick found on the Book Building/Tower.
- New aluminum windows (previously installed at the adjacent Book Building, and since removed), will be repurposed to provide glazing. The non-operable windows will be grouped together in each structural bay at the 2nd floor to provide large areas of mostly continuous glass.

Two pairs of flush metal doors, factory finished to match the "Quaker Dark Bronze" color, will be installed near the north end of this façade for building loading and trash removal access. A single door will be provided near the center of the façade for the exit stair.

Storefront, Main Entry and Windows

East and South Facades

- All non-original storefronts and overhead signage panels will be removed and replaced with new storefront systems.
- Large format storefront windows, approximately 10'-8" H x 11'-8" W, divided into three vertical glazing panels with transoms above, will be installed in the first and second floor window openings.
- A curb wall (actual height will vary with floor and pavement elevations) clad in limestone will be built beneath each storefront assembly on the first floor. The limestone veneer will be split into three panels to align with the storefront frames above.
- At the second floor the non-historic storefront will be removed and replaced with new storefront with a similar tripartite w/ transom design. Product info and details are submitted.
- All storefront framing and associated doors shall have a factory painted finish to match the "Quaker Dark Bronze" finish.

Main Entrance - East Façade

- The main double door entrance for the primary retail tenant is located in the vaulted center bay. The existing wood double doors and frame are glazed with an arched transom overhead that is divided into three lights.
- The wood frames and doors will be repaired and restored with new door hardware.
- The coffered vaulted ceiling will be repaired and restored, and the non-historic utility light removed.
- Side walls of the recessed entry will remain as is, with limestone panels restored as part of the façade work.

Northern-most Storefront – East Façade

- The storefront bay on the east façade will receive an entry door into a lobby for the 2nd floor tenant.
- This new entrance door will be a fully glazed aluminum stile and rail unit, centered within the new storefront assembly with sidelights on either side of the door and a transom overhead.
- The door will be recessed into the storefront bay with limestone clad wall returns, storefront glazing into the adjacent tenant space and exterior gyp board ceiling.
- The solid wall on the north side will have a similar storefront system as the south, but with a solid inset panel for tenant directory and electronic card reader.

Façade Lighting

Architectural sconces will be added on the two primary facades (east and south) at each column to accentuate architectural features. The sconces are rectangular in shape, will be Satin Black in color, and provide up/down light.

Roof and Penthouses

Roof

- All roofing materials, including the built-up wood framing and deck, will be removed down to the structural steel frame at the ceiling level below.
- Once removed, the roof structure will be rebuilt by stubbing up at each column location with new steel columns and beams sloped to drain. New wood roof joists

and decking will span between the new steel beams. New insulation and roof membrane will be provided to meet code.

Penthouses

- Two new penthouses will be constructed.
- The first, housing the exit stair, will be constructed in the SW corner and will be recessed two structural bays from the State Street parapet/building edge.
- The second penthouse is proposed along the north end of the building. This penthouse will house mechanical space and the top landings of the stair and elevator. The east end of this penthouse will be recessed three full structural bays from the Washington Boulevard parapet/building edge.
- Both penthouses will be clad in the same buff color brick proposed for the alley façade.
- Rooftop mechanical equipment will be located in the space between the two penthouses along the west facade. A brick parapet wall, contiguous with the new alley wall, will screen the rooftop equipment from view from the alley. The rooftop equipment will be shorter than the two new penthouses and neither the rooftop equipment nor future screen wall will be visible from State St or Washington Blvd.

Site Work

- Once the western two bays of the 1201 Washington building were demolished, the alley was extended to connect to State St.
- The alley has been left unpaved, and this application proposes to pave with materials similar in design with the proposed Book Tower alley paving. Brick pavers similarly used behind Book Tower will compose the driving surface of the alley, with standard finish concrete curbs at either side of the alley.
- The State St and Washington sidewalks shall be completely replaced as part of the 1201 Washington work. The design is to match the sidewalk design for Book Tower, including a wide concrete walkway against the building, landscaped planter beds near the curb, permeable pavers between the landscape beds and curb, and a granite curb against the roadbed. This design shall wrap around both facades of the building with a much narrower concrete walkway on the State St façade.

[07:20 pm] 02:32:54

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

• Ms Butler, a resident and member of the Book Building, requested more clarity on the location of the proposed site. She supports the project.

[07:23 pm] 02:36:54 [7:17 pm] 02:29:54

END (AUDIO)

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- The applicant, Brian Rebain, raised concerns on the staff report's condition to reduce the penthouse height and described future intentions on the potential to add a roof deck and enclosed structure in addition to the current proposal.
- Commissioners said they don't have any issues with removing the staff's recommendation for a condition to reduce the penthouse height.
- The applicant presented some future intended work for Commissioner's information and feedback. Commissioners stated that they didn't see any issues.

[7:24 pm] 02:38:55

ACTION

Commissioner Hosey moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7803 for 1201 Washington Blvd.**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof

pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

• Staff is granted authority to review the sidewalk plan for the remaining block, confirming that it will match the design approved within this application.

Commissioner Hamilton - SUPPORT

Ayes -4 Nay -0 Abstain -0 (Commissioner Lockhart stepped out of the room.) **MOTION CARRIED**

[07:30 pm] 02:43:30

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7804, 7809-7812 AD

ADDRESS: 2555, 2508-2484 Burns

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Indian Village HD

APPLICANT: Brian Rebain **OWNER:** Detroit Waldorf School

SCOPE OF WORK: Establish permanent outdoor classroom structures, previously

erected per COVID-19 resolution

PROPOSAL: In September 2020, the applicant submitted a proposal for the erection of 14 temporary structures in response to COVID-19. A Notice-To-Proceed was issued for the erection of the 12 structures within the historic district's boundaries under the authority conferred to HDC staff by the Commission's Resolution #20-02. In 2021 and 2022, the structures were modified per the submitted narrative.

With the current submission, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to retain the 12 existing shelters within the Indian Village Historic District's boundary as a permanent addition to the Waldorf School property. (The remaining two shelters are located along Fischer Street, which is outside of the district's boundary.)

[07:51 pm] 03:04:54

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

- Matthew Naimi, Detroit resident and parent of student at Waldorf, supports the project.
- Liam Kurtz, an 8th grader at Waldorf, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Sarah Elliot, parent of student at Waldorf, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Christine Driscoll, parent of students at Waldorf and resident of Indian Village, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Alex Alsup, parent of students at Waldorf and resident of Indian Village, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Melanie Watkins, parent of student at Waldorf, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Chris McInnis, parent of student at Waldorf, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Joe Klecha, resident of Corktown, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Shira, resident of Indian Village, parent of former student, and health professional, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Bill Swanson, resident of West Village and parent of student at Waldorf, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Amy Mitchell, resident of West Village and parent of student at Waldorf, spoke in support of the proposal.

- Vadim Oss, resident of Indian Village and parent of student at Waldorf, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Carol Hill, board member of Waldorf School, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Debra Walker, whose grandson went to Waldorf School, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Linda Williams, teacher at Waldorf School, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Mike Champrani, parent of students at Waldorf School, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Anri Beleshi, parent of students at Waldorf School, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Andi Mahony, resident of Indian Village, parent and worker at Waldorf School, spoke in support of the proposal.
- Betty Warmack, parent of former students at Waldorf, spoke in support of the proposal.

END (AUDIO)

[08:28 pm] 03:41:54 [7:32 pm] 02:48:18

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- Director Landsberg left the room and stated that he has not been involved with this application.
- Commissioner Hosey recused himself from this case because he has a family member involved with the school.
- The applicant, Brian Rebain, is present and described the historic and current background on the proposal. He also disclosed that he is a parent of students who attend here. He stated some disagreement with the staff's assessment that the grounds were a formal, park-like setting. He clarified that no vegetation was disturbed except grass and preserves some of the open landscape in the middle of the grounds. He also presented how material and work was completed and funded by volunteers, but professionally designed and certified.
- The applicant, Virginia Stanard, described the benefits of these outdoor classrooms.
- Commissioners discussed the value of these assets during the pandemic and like to understand why they would have to be permanent structures at this time.
- Commissioners discuss the materiality and design the structures. The Arts and Crafts design of the school is not reflected in the design very well in these structures, but the design could be augmented to be more closely resembling the historic context of the historic architecture of the building.
- Commissioners discuss the value this proposal has in the community.
- Commissioners discuss the reasons between having a NTP (versus a COA) and adding a time component to a NTP.

[8:39 pm] 03:52:55

ACTION ONE

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7804** and #22-7809 - 7812 for 2555, 2508 – 2484 Burns, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 1) A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes -4 Nay -0 Abstain -0 (Commissioner Hosey recused himself, not present.) **MOTION CARRIED**

[8:40 pm] 03:53:55

ACTION TWO

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7804** and #22-7809 - 7812 for 2555, 2508 – 2484 Burns, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation. However, the Commission has determined that the following condition prevails and therefore ISSUES a NOTICE TO PROCEED for the proposed work because it is necessary to substantially improve or correct the following condition:

(2) The resource is a deterrent to a major improvement program that will be of substantial benefit to the community. Substantial benefit shall be found only if the applicant proposing the work has obtained all necessary planning and zoning approvals, financing and environmental clearances, and the improvement program is otherwise feasible.

The Notice to Proceed is issued with the following condition:

- New alterations proposed for the 12 structures and site be submitted to HDC staff for review and approval prior to work taking place.
- This Notice to Proceed shall expire after 10 years.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes –4 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0 (Commissioner Hosey recused himself, not present.)

MOTION CARRIED

X CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

[8:43 pm] 03:56:55 None

[8:52 pm] 04:03:00

XI PUBLIC COMMENT

None

XII APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

[8:52 pm] 04:03:00 • APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7806 DR

VIOLATION NUMBER: 579 ADDRESS: 891 Edison **HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Boston-Edison HD **APPLICANT/OWNER:** Larry Butler

SCOPE OF WORK: Rehabilitate house and garage*

PROPOSAL: The proposed work consists of several scopes of work as described below. In most cases the work described entails repair of existing materials with like materials and the replacement of existing vinyl windows from a former owner with wood windows.

Repair roof of house and garage

- Replace roof asphalt shingles with Owens Corning TruDefinition Duration asphalt shingles, color slate
- Replace existing aluminum gutters with white aluminum gutters

Rehabilitate walls, siding and soffits

- Repair deteriorated areas in soffits and siding: use matching wood and overlay style for soffits, clapboard and shake siding
- Repair rear walls with 2x4 plywood framing in an approximate 6'x15' area. Install wood shake shingles, 6'x16' area, and wood clapboard, 6'x 6' area, to match existing.
- Repair west wall siding with wood shake shingles, 2'x25' area, to match existing.
- Repair east walls with 2x4 plywood framing in an approximate 4'x15' area. Install wood shake shingles, 2'x30' and 8'x10' areas, and wood clapboard, 1'x 8' area, to match existing.
- Paint to existing color, C:1 or C:4, depending on location

Rehabilitate windows and doors

- Restore front wood door: remove, repair and replace existing front door.
- Install two (2) steel doors at the rear of the house:
 - o one (1) 6-panel Jeldwen steel replacement basement door, color white, no window
 - o one (1) 4-panel Jeldwen steel replacement door, color white, fan lite.
- Replace eight (8) vinyl windows in rear elevation from a previous owner:
 - o six (6) 32"x58" wood, double-hung Jeldwen window with true divided light 6/1.
 - o one (1) 30"x46" wood, double-hung Jeldwen window with no grid/divided light.
 - o one (1) 24"x36" wood, double-hung Jeldwen window with no grid/divided light.
- Install three (3) casement windows for the front elevation, 2nd floor with 2x3 true divided light:
 - One (1) 18"x36" wood, Jeldwen casement, hinge operation in the middle.
 - o Two (2) 18"x36" wood, Jeldwen casement, fixed on either side.
 - o Retain original casement frame.
- All other windows (28) will install panes of sheet glass to match existing glass, retaining all wood windows.
- Paint window trim existing color, off-white (C:4)

Paint house & trim

- Paint house and trim using existing colors off-white (C:4) for body and trim and gray colors (C:1) body and porches, which was painted this color by a previous owner, using Color System C:
 - o C:1 Sherwin Williams "Light Bluish Gray", flat sheen
 - o C:4 Sherwin Williams "2829 Classical White", flat sheen

Rehabilitate front steps, rear porch deck, rear sleeping room (2nd floor enclosed porch)

- Install 6' wide wood front steps, paint grey C:1 to match existing color
- Install one (1) wrought-iron handrail for the steps, left side, facing the house.
- Repair rear, 4'x6' wood porch/deck, install 3 steps, paint grey C:1.
- Remove rotted wood skirting from rear, porch deck and install 1x4 white pine skirting, approximately 30' length of area, paint grey C:1.
- Remove rotted wood from sleeping room skirt wall, approximately 15' length of area, replace with tongue-and-groove plank wall, paint grey C:1.

Garage Doors & Windows

- Install steel replacement Cloplay 8'x7' short-panel garage door, no windows (alley security), color white.
- Install one (1) six-panel Jeldwen steel replacement door, color white, no windows.
- Replace broken glass for windows on front, east and west sides

[8:52 pm] 04:03:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- O Applicant, Larry Butler, described history of the project and the process to get permits while there was water damage to the house.
- o Commissioner asked if applicant understand the Applicant's conditions, and asked that the applicant review the staff report.
- Staff recommended an alteration to the conditions regarding dimensions and drawings. Staff would like the applicant to provide clarity on the work being done for the rear porch conditions.

[9:02 pm] 04:15:20

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7806 for 891 Edison**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

• HDC staff has final approval over the alterations to the rear porch of the home.

Commissioner Lockhart – SUPPORT Ayes – 5 Nay – 0 MOTION CARRIED

[09:03 pm] 04:16:56

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-7807 DR

ADDRESS: 1053 Burns

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Indian Village HD

APPLICANT/PROPERTY OWNER: Curt Cramer

SCOPE OF WORK: Enclose rear porch

PROPOSAL:

The proposed work is the enclosure of the rear, northwest porch with walls, finished with wood siding, a window and door with a reconstruction of the staircase to widen

and extend the existing brick and limestone-capped wingwalls to provide a mudroom to the adjacent kitchen.

Enclose Porch

The porch's footprint would remain the same. The existing limestone capped knee-wall and brick pillar shall remain in place. The enclosure would be completed by building a wall immediately on top of the limestone capped brick wall, which would have a fixed, 47" x 23" window with a 4/2 muntin pattern to match the sunroom windows. The siding would match the existing wood clapboard siding. A door would be installed at the top of the stair, with the same proposed wood clapboard siding to fill in the exterior wall.

Product Data- See attached brochures and cut sheets for additional information:

- Siding: 4 ½" wood beveled clapboard to match existing wood siding's material and thickness and color, by Detroit Forest Products.
- Window: Pella architect series, fixed 47" x 23" with 4/2 muntins, stain grade pine interior, aluminum clad exterior, painted to match existing house trim
- Door: Wood and double-pane glass, 36"x 80"

Replace stair and wing walls

The proposal is to replace the existing concrete and brick paver stair with wider, limestone steps and to expand the existing 2' limestone capped, brick wingwalls with longer limestone capped, brick wingwalls. The dimensions of the stairs would increase from 48" wide to 63" wide to match the dimensions of the existing sun porch steps more closely. The dimensions of the wing walls would increase from 31" tall and 46" long to 42" tall and 82" long to match the dimensions of the existing sunporch walls more closely.

Product Data- See attached brochures and cut sheets for additional information:

- Brick: Reuse of existing brick, and new bricks (Bowerston #1100, red flash smooth) that the applicant is using to match existing brick.
- Limestone caps and steps

[09:04 pm] 04:17:34

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- O Applicant Curt Cramer is present and described the history of rehabilitation of the house as the owner the rationale for the proposed enclosed porch. The applicant stated their objection to the Staff Report's point to change the walls to windows; they wouldn't bother enclosing the porch with this condition.
- o Commissioner asked the applicant to describe the original conditions of the porch.
- The applicant created new columns in the front of the house by removing the wall and glass block of the front porches.
- O Commissioners discussed how the proposed work could be undone and is not visible to the public.

[09:15 pm] 04:27:56

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7807 for 1053 Burns**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

• The applicant provides drawings to HDC staff for review and approval that show the proposed width of the stair shall not exceed the width of the existing interior space between the pillar and the exterior wall, that the height of the wingwall not exceed the height of the porch, except for the limestone cap.

Commissioner <u>Lockhart</u> SUPPORT Ayes - 5 Nay - 0 **MOTION CARRIED**

[9:16PM] 04:29:00 • APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7808 JR

VIOLATION NUMBER: 593 ADDRESS: 647 Arden Park

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Arden Park- East Boston HD

APPLICANT: Shalom Dubov

OWNER: Shalom Dubov/ NN Builders LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace glass block windows with vinyl windows

PROPOSAL:

With the current submission, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to replace a number of existing glass block windows with new vinyl windows. Specifically, the work includes the following items:

West Elevation

 Replace three glass block windows at the first story with new, double-hung vinyl windows with muntins between the glass

East Elevation

- Replace one glass block window at the first story with a new double-hung vinyl windows with muntins between the glass
- Replace one glass block windows at the first story with a new fixed vinyl window with muntins between the glass

Rear/North Elevation

- Replace one glass block window at the second story with a new, double-hung vinyl window with muntins between the glass
- Replace two glass block windows at the first story with new, fixed vinyl windows with muntins between the glass
- Replace one glass block window at the first story with a new, double-hung vinyl window with muntins between the glass

[9:17 PM] 04:29:34

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Applicant, Shalom Dubov, was present and described the proposal to replace the block windows with vinyl windows. He requested guidance on other materials that may be approved.
- o Commissioner discussed use of vinyl windows, alternative materials and clarity on the number of glass block windows.

[09:25 pm] 04:38:00

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7808 for 647 Arden Park**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards

of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided. Staff therefore recommends that the Commission issue a Denial for the proposal.

Commissioner <u>Hamilton</u> – SUPPORT Ayes – 5 Nay – 0 **MOTION CARRIED**

[09:26pm]

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #22-7819 JR

04:42:00

ADDRESS: 259 W. Grand Blvd.

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Hubbard Farms HD

APPLICANT: Gamal Usmanoff/Alexandira Home Solutions

PROPERTY OWNER: Erin Ebsch

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace existing vinyl and wood windows

PROPOSAL:

The applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to replace all of the windows at the home with new wood units. Specifically, the current proposal includes the following:

- Replace all vinyl windows with new 1/1 aluminum-clad wood, double-hung, Pella Windows. The aluminum cladding will display a black finish color. The applicant has stated that they would also be willing to install simulated divided lite windows if the Commission requires, but that they prefer a 1/1 configuration. The existing historic wood trim/brickmound/casing will be retained and will not be covered/clad with aluminum
- Replace the each of the two existing wood picture windows at the front elevation, first story, with a new fixed aluminum-clad wood window. The aluminum cladding will display a black finish color The existing historic wood trim/casing/brickmould will be retained and will not be covered/clad with aluminum

[09:26pm] 04:42:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- O Applicant/Owner, present, described the proposal's background.
- Commissioners discuss how non-original window replacement should go towards a design that is more towards the traditional design, and they asked the applicant to describe their aversion to double-hung windows. The applicant stated security, light, and cost were the reasons.
- O The owner stated that they remove windows 9 and 10 from the application based on the estimates from the contractor.

[09:35 pm] 04:48:00

ACTION

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #22-7819 for 259 W. Grand Blvd., excluding the two picture windows identified as 9 and 10 in the application, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the

proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

 $Commissioner\ \underline{Lockhart}-SUPPORT$

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[9:38pm] XIII CITY PROJECTS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

04:51:00 None

XIV OLD BUSINESS

[9:38pm]

None

04:51:00

XV NEW BUSINESS

[9:38pm] 04:51:00

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: NA

ADDRESS: 1750 Trumbull & 1567 Church

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Corktown HD APPLICANTS: Seth Herkowitz, Brian Rebain, Michael Marks, Sheila Cockerel

(Hunter Pasteur, Oxford Capital Group, The Forbes Company, Kraemer Design Group, Giffels Webster, Crossroads Consulting)

PROPERTY OWNER: Anthony Formosa **SCOPE OF WORK:** Concept design review

PROPOSAL:

The proposed work consists of new construction of four-story residential building with parking, called "The Formosa". The second site, "Red Arrow Lofts", is a conversion of an existing storage building into 22 residential apartments and 8 dedicated parking spaces.

[9:38pm]

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

04:51:00

- o The applicants presented a 34-page presentation on the two sites and the conceptual ideas, their background, materiality, site and proposed construction.
- o The Commissioners had no objections to the presentations.

[10:01 pm]

COMMISSIONER ELECTIONS

05:14:00

None

[10:02 pm]

XVI ADJOURNMENT

05:15:00

Commissioner Miriani moved to adjourn the meeting at 10:02 pm.

Commissioner Hosey - SUPPORT

Ayes - 5 Nay - 0

MOTION CARRIED

MEETING ADJOURNED

LIST OF ACRONYMS

- Building Safety Engineering, and Environmental Department (BSEED)
- Historic District (HD)
- Historic District Advisory Board (HDAB)

- Historic District Commission (HDC)
- HDC Staff
 - o AD- Audra Dye
 - o BC- Brendan Cagney
 - o DR- Dan Rieden
 - o GL- Garrick Landsberg
 - o JR Jennifer Ross
- Planning & Development Department (PDD)