

DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

Date: September 8, 2021

Due to COVID-19 restrictions, this meeting was held electronically via Zoom Meeting Link and audio-recorded.

[Actual Time] /
Audio
Recording
Time Stamp

AGENDA

[05:43 pm]
01:11:00

I CALL TO ORDER

Vice-Chair Commissioner Franklin called the meeting to order at 5:43 p.m.

[05:44 pm]
01:13:00

II ROLL CALL

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION		PRESENT	ABSENT
Katie Johnson	Chair		X
Tiffany Franklin, Detroit	Vice-Chair	X	
Jim Hamilton, Detroit	Commissioner	X	
Richard Hosey	Commissioner	X	
Alease Johnson, Detroit	Commissioner	X	
Brandon Lockhart, South Korea	Commissioner	X	
Dennis Miriani	Commissioner	X	
STAFF			
Brendan Cagney	PDD	X	
Audra Dye	PDD		X
Garrick Landsberg	PDD	X	
Ann Phillips	PDD	X	
Daniel Rieden	PDD	X	
Jennifer Ross	PDD	X	
Dave Walker	PDD	X	
Rebecca Savage	HDAB	X	
Martha Delgado	HRD	X	
Aida	HRD	X	

[05:45 pm]
01:14:00

III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Commissioner J. Hamilton moved to approve the Agenda with the following change:

- Add 457 E. Kirby to the Consent Agenda

Commissioner Miriani - SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner J. Hamilton moved to approve the Agenda:

Commissioner Miriani - SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[05:44 pm]
01:16:00

IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

NONE

[05:44 pm]
01:16:00

V REPORTS

Director Landsberg reported on:

- Virtual HDC meetings to continue until end of calendar year 2021
- Special meeting for September 22, 2021
- Introduction of new Commissioner Brandon Lockhart
- Report on speed bumps in Historic Districts
- Rules of Procedure Subcommittee report

[05:52 pm]
01:19:45

VI APPROVAL OF APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO CONSENT AGENDA

Commissioner J. Hamilton moved to approve the Consent Agenda:

- 457 E. Kirby to the Consent Agenda

Commissioner A. Johnson - SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[05:53 pm]
01:21:00

VII POSTPONED APPLICATION

None

[05:53 pm]
01:21:00

VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS)

None

[05:53 pm]
01:21:00

IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

- **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7392**

ADDRESS: 1476 Chicago

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston Edison HD

APPLICANT: Kevin Crosby, Architect

OWNER: Sophie Wolman

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect new garage

PROPOSAL: Per the submitted drawings, the applicant is proposing to erect a new detached single-story garage to complement the existing house and expand the driveway to provide access to the garage doors.

[5:54 pm]
01:22:40

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

- Florencine: requested HDC information.

[5:57 pm]
01:26:30

END (AUDIO)

[5:57 pm]
01:26:30

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- None

[5:58 pm]
01:26:30

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7392 for 1476 Chicago** and, having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant

to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes –6 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[6:00 pm]
01:28:30

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7394**

ADDRESS: 2522 W. Boston

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD

APPLICANT/OWNER: Kristyn Patterson

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect new garage and fence

PROPOSAL: The applicant is seeking the Commission’s approval to erect a new garage at the rear yard and to install new wood fencing. Specifically, the current scope includes the following:

- Erect a new garage in the rear yard per the submitted drawing and site plan. The new garage will be one story in height and will have a 22’x24’ footprint. Exterior walls will be clad with vinyl siding with a wood grain finish. Vinyl shingles are proposed for installation at the front elevation’s gable end. A single 16’x7’ steel overhead door will be located at the front elevation, while a single steel pedestrian door will be installed at the side elevation. The gabled roof will be covered with black asphalt shingles.
- Replace existing chain link and aluminum fencing at rear and side yard with a 6’-0” high wood, dog-eared type privacy fencing. The new fencing will measure 8’-0” in height along the rear property line and 6’-0” high at the side property lines.

[6:04 pm]
01:33:00

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

- None

[6:05 pm]
01:33:30

END (AUDIO)

[6:06 pm]
01:33:30

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Commission asked for clarification on existing violations. Law department has clarified that applications are allowed to go forward, whether or not a violation is addressed. The Commission is allowed to address any outstanding violations.
- No issues and Commission agrees with Staff’s report.
- Commissioners would like to have discussion with applicant regarding the violation of windows, but the application is not present. No application for windows is included.

[06:07 pm]
01:35:30

ACTION

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7394 for 2522 W. Boston** and, having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of

review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The garage shall be clad with horizontally oriented lapped wood or **cementitious** (smooth finish) siding. If the applicant would like to install shingles in the gable end, they shall be wood or composite. The project drawings shall be revised to reflect the required exterior cladding change and shall submitted to HDC staff for approval prior to issuance of the project's permit.
- The proposed new wood fencing shall be painted or stained a color which complements the color of the home within one calendar year of the issuance of this COA. The applicant shall submit the final paint/stain color choice/swatch to HDC staff for approval prior to issuance of the project's permit.

Commissioner Miriani– SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

X CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

[06:13 pm]
01:41:30

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7395**

ADDRESS: 4784 Sturtevant

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Russell Woods - Sullivan HD

APPLICANT: Darnell Jackson, Ampro Construction, LLC

OWNER: Solome Williams

SCOPE OF WORK: Demolish existing garage, replace columns, railing

PROPOSAL: Per the submitted documents, the applicant is proposing to:

- Demolish existing garage by dismantling and removing all construction debris. The existing concrete pad and trees are to remain.
- Remove both fluted & tapered wood porch columns and replace with new fiberglass reinforced polymer (FRP) tapered columns which will be fluted.
- Remove existing 24" high decorative wrought iron railing (currently painted red) and replace with a new black wrought iron railing, 36" in height.

[06:19 pm]
01:44:30

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

- None

END (AUDIO)

[6:19 pm]
01:45:00

[6:20 pm]
01:45:00

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- Applicant, Darnell Jackson, Contractor: Railings are rusted at the bottom, and the railing is not to code according to the building inspector. The columns to be replaced are in poor condition and need to be replaced.
- Commissioners discuss on the condition of the columns as a pair and the replication of the material for replacement of the columns, as close as possible to the existing material.
- Commissioners discuss the conditions of the railings and have the work done by an ironwork expert. They discussed how historic railings relate to current code. The Commissioners stated that the higher railings would look odd here. Railings and columns can be repaired.
- Commissioners discussed materials other than wood for the columns.

- Staff pointed out that some scope items were identified as staff approvable so these items were approved by staff: porch steps, roof, rear porch.

[6:30 pm]
01:58:00

ACTION ONE

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7395 for 4784 Sturtevant** and, having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposal removal and replacement of the existing wrought iron porch railing **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

(5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

(6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

(9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes –6 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[6:30 pm]
02:00:00

ACTION TWO

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7395 for 4784 Sturtevant** and, having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposal to replace the two front wood columns with fiberglass reinforced polymer (FRP) columns that replicate the original look **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and

local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

Condition:

- *The applicant shall be submitted by the applicant for HDC Staff approval to review.*

Commissioner A. Johnson – SUPPORT
Ayes –5 Nay – 0 Abstain – 1 (Franklin)

MOTION CARRIED

[6:35 pm]
02:03:00

ACTION THREE

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7395 for 4784 Sturtevant** and, having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application for the demolition of the garage WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT
Ayes –6 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[6:38 pm]
02:05:30

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7396**

ADDRESS: 1772 Seyburn

HISTORIC DISTRICT: West Village HD

APPLICANT: Jozef Olszewski (Contractor), Martha Delgado (HRD Contact)

OWNERS: Danielle Este

SCOPE OF WORK: Demolish existing garage, scrape and paint home, window repair, replacement of roof

PROPOSAL: The applicant provided a complete application for the following proposed scope items:

Demolition of Garage:

- Complete dismantle and removal of wood frame garage.
- Terminate all utilities at source.
- Remove concrete slab and mechanics hole of garage
- Backfill, grade and grass seed.

Roof: Shingles, edges, gutters and downspouts

- Remove all existing shingles down to the roof boards.
- Install 7/16 inch Oriented Strand Board.
- Install new Dimensional 30 year asphalt shingle roofing, GAF “Timerline” including 15 lb., color: dark brown “Hickory”.
- Install asphalt saturated felt, over entire roof, ice and water shield at all eaves and valleys, and aluminum T-drip at all edges of roof.

- Match shingles to existing color and design. Black brown or gray.
- Install new aluminum gutters and rectangular downspouts on entire dwelling. Color: white.
- Repair of damaged wood components, where necessary (soffits, fascia, rake, frieze, gable, trim board) in kind to match existing.
- Paint wood components: Wet, scrape, prime any bare areas and repaint these surfaces with two coats of exterior grade, 20 year paint. Color to match existing.
- Replacement of rear flat roof with bituminous roofing material. Color: flat black.

Porches/ Balconies: Front Porch

- Repair of damaged wood components, where necessary (b-board ceiling, ceiling beam, soffits, fascia, columns) with in kind wood material to match existing.
- Paint wood components: Wet, scrape, prime any bare areas and repaint these surfaces with two coats of exterior grade, 20 year paint. Color to match existing, ie., white.
- Step repair not included in this application.

Walls: Repair Exterior walls, and Roof Dormer Siding:

- Repair in kind of all exterior wood components of front dormer: dormer siding, dormer soffits, fascia, rake, frieze, gable, trim boards.
- Paint wood components: Wet, scrape, prime any bare areas and repaint these surfaces with two coats of exterior grade, 20 year paint. Color to match existing.
- Repair exterior stucco components where holes are present at the front elevation. Add new stucco of same strength and composition. Previously completed rear elevation stucco repair to be removed from the application.
- Stream course: Where brick has been painted in some elevations of the house no new paint will be added to the masonry.

Windows: Repair Original Wood Windows (29), Awnings and storm windows

- See also attached “Window Assessment Form” provided by applicant for location and exterior photos of the 29 windows.
- Temporarily remove storm windows, awnings, upper and lower window sashes.
- Remove interior stops and save (or discard and replace with in kind material).
- Paint wood components: wet scrape and fully apply Eco-Bond Lead Defender, or equivalent, to all painted surfaces of the jambs and troughs. Repaint these surfaces with two coats of exterior grade, 20 year paint. Color to match existing.
- Determine track shape, most wood sashes have either a square-shaped groove or a “V” shaped groove. Install jamb liners to manufacturer’s recommendations.
- Reinstall sashes and stops that match existing in like and kind.

Windows: Cellar Windows (7)

- Remove and dispose of basement windows and all framing of 7 cellar windows.

- Install new framing to receive glass block windows complete with metal vent.
- Mortar and caulk (low VOC).

Doors: Front and Rear

- Remove and keep existing doors (Front and Rear). Remove existing stop.
- Plane all edges of door to prevent friction/impact surfaces. Perform substrate stabilization on doors and all remaining door trim. Wet scrape and fully apply Eco-Bond Lead Defender, or equivalent, to doors, jamb, and interior/exterior casing.
- Install new equivalent primed stop.
- Reinstall existing doors.
- Replace weather-stripping, if necessary, to provide an airtight seal.
- Paint wood components: Wet, scrape, prime any bare areas and repaint these surfaces with two coats of exterior grade, 20 year paint. Color to match existing, ie., White.

Other Site work:

- None

[6:45 pm]
02:09:30

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

- None

END (AUDIO)

[6:45 pm]
02:09:30

[6:41 pm]
02:10:30

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Aida Colon (HRD) and Martha Delgado (HRD) present for the applicant as a City-lead project: Lead poisoning condition with a child at this residence and would like to remove the lead. Both thanked the staff report and spoke in favor of the staff report's recommendation.
- Commissioners have no comments.

[06:45 pm]
02:13:00

ACTION

Commissioner Mariani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7396 for 1772 Seyburn** and, having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hosey– SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[06:47 pm]
02:15:00

- **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** #21-7466
ADDRESS: 13200 Dexter
HISTORIC DISTRICT: Russell Woods - Sullivan HD
APPLICANT: Kimberly Dokes (Architect)
OWNER: City Of Detroit/Planning And Development Department

SCOPE OF WORK: Establish a new retail/community space to include the installation of five shipping containers, artwork, and a stage

PROPOSAL: With the current submission, the applicant is seeking the Commission’s approval to establish a new retail/community space within the subject parcel. See the submitted renderings, which provide details around the proposed new development. Specifically, the proposed project shall consist of the following elements:

- **Five new 40’x8’x8’ steel shipping containers**
 - One container will serve as a restroom. This container will be centrally-located within the development
 - Three containers will be located at grade and shall house commercial uses. These containers will sit at the at the western and southern edges of the site and shall face upon Dexter Avenue and Tyler Street. Each container’s interior space will be accessed via aluminum storefront doors. An aluminum walk-up window will also be installed at each of the two containers at the southwest corner of the parcel.
 - One container will installed atop the two the two containers at the southwest corner of the parcel. This container will serve to support rotating artwork displays
 - The exterior “walls” of the container are ribbed steel and will be painted either yellow or grey as per the submission
- **Art**
 - New artwork will be installed at the container structure which is located at the southwest corner of the site
- **Landscape/Hardscape**
 - The site shall include a concrete apron along Dexter Avenue and Tyler Street, directly adjacent to the sidewalk, grass at the interior event space, plantings (species not specified) at the southeast edge of the site, and gravel at the parking/food truck area
- **Performance stage**
 - A stepped, approximately 12’x12’x24” stage shall be located centrally within the site. It will be constructed of 2’x4’ lumber and shall be unfinished/unpainted

[06:58pm]
02:23:00

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

- None

END (AUDIO)

[6:59 pm]
02:23:00

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- Applicant, Kimberly Dokes: Supports the staff report.
- City of Detroit’s PDD, Dave Walker: Temporary installation for activation of the corner. The purpose is to create a retail activity to support streetscape installation. It was part of the 2017 PDD planning framework, which included over 60 community meetings, 800-1000 people, to use SNF funds as one of the four implementation projects identified in the Russell Woods – Sullivan HD.
- Mark Tirikian, Detroit Building Authority (DBA): Supports initiative and the staff report. They are responsible for the design/build of the project.
- Commissioners discuss the popular use of containers to activate neighborhoods.
- Staff clarified that the Denial motion was not required and could go right to the Notice to Proceed.

[6:55 pm]
02:23:00

[7:01 pm]
02:29:29

ACTION ONE

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7466 for 13200 Dexter** and, having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation. However, the Commission has determined that the following condition prevails and therefore **ISSUES** a **NOTICE TO PROCEED** for the proposed work because it is necessary to substantially improve or correct the following condition:

(4) *Retention of the resource would not be in the interest of the majority of the community.*

The Notice to Proceed is issued with the following conditions:

- The existing brick within the berm area shall be retained
- The applicant shall indicate the species of the four plantings proposed for installation at the site's southeast edge to HDC staff. Staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve this element. If staff determines that the proposed plantings are not appropriate, they shall forward the work item to the Commission for review at a future meeting.
- Any new landscaping shall be reviewed and approved by HDC staff prior to issuance of the project's permit. If staff determines that the proposed plantings are not appropriate, they shall forward the work item to the Commission for review at a future meeting.
- The installation remains in-situ, as approved by the Commission, for up to four (4) calendar years from the date of the issuance of the project permit, as noted in the current application.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes –6 Nay – 0 Abstain – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[07:03 pm]
02:31:29

XI PUBLIC COMMENT

- None

IX APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

[07:05 pm]
02:32:46

- **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7393**

VIOLATION NUMBER: #21-378

ADDRESS: 2071 Longfellow

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston – Edison HD

APPLICANT: Delia Wells

PROPERTY OWNER: Delia Wells

SCOPE OF WORK: Painting of previously painted stone

PROPSAL:

After several attempts for paint removal and seeing little to no improvement and potential damage to the masonry, the applicant seeks to paint over already painted

masonry and continue to paint unpainted masonry where a partial paint area has occurred to achieve visual balance. Specifically, the applicant seeks the Commission's approval of the following work items:

A. General

- a. All paints are proposed to be Sherwin Williams' Loxon exterior paint for masonry/concrete. The applicant states that this Loxon product is breathable, self-cleaning, weather-resistant and inhibits the growth of mold and mildew. The sheen is flat.
- b. For all **cast-stone painted surfaces**, the applicant proposes to use one of the following colors, which are meant to best match existing cast-stone color. (See applicant's attached July 28th letter for color samples):
 - i. SW 7631 "City Loft"
 - ii. SW 9173 "Shiitake"
 - iii. SW 7050 "Useful Gray"
 - iv. SW 7051 "Analytical Gray"
 - v. SW 7647 "Crushed Ice"
 - vi. SW 7648 "Big Chill"
- c. For all **brick painted surfaces** surrounding windows, applicant seeks to either continue use of black paint to complete the surround of unfinished windows OR paint over black paint and continue the unpainted areas with one of the following colors, which are meant to best match existing brick color:
 - i. SW 6380 "Humble Gold"
 - ii. SW 9012 "Polvo de Oro"
 - iii. SW 6361 "Autumnal"
 - iv. SW 9011 "Sun Bleached Ochre"
 - v. SW 6353 "Chivalry Copper"
 - vi. SW 9006 "Rojo Dust"
 - vii. SW 6375 "Honeycomb"
 - viii. SW 6339 "Persimmon"
- d. Except where noted above, no masonry or brick is proposed for additional painting.

B. Front Elevation – Paint

- Elements that are already painted red (*Red Gumball*) include the following:
 - Porch brick pillar cast stone bases and capstones
 - Cast planters
 - Brick relief corners surrounding central windows on second floor
- Elements that are already painted black (*Black Onyx*) include the following:
 - Window sills and window brick inside edge
 - Porch wall cast-stone capstone

C. Side Elevations - Paint

- Elements that are already painted black (*Black Onyx*) include the following:
 - Window cast-stone sills and window brick inside edge (West elevation only)

D. Rear Elevation - Paint

- Elements that are already painted red (*Red Gumball*) include the following:
 - Cast planters
- Elements that are already painted black (*Black Onyx*) include the following:
 - Window sills and window brick inside edge
 - Cast-stone rear porch capstone

[07:06 pm]
02:33:46

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Applicant was present and had nothing to add to the staff report.
- Commissioner stated that this was a good resolution.

[07:07 pm]
02:35:46

ACTION

Commissioner Hamilton move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7393 for 2071 Longfellow** and, having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- For all cast-stone, previously painted surfaces, apply one color choice, confirmed by HDC Staff.
- For all brick, previously painted surfaces, apply one color choice, confirmed by HDC Staff.
- No additional paint be applied to unpainted masonry surfaces (ie., cast-stone, brick, etc.).
- Verify with HDC Staff final paint color choice and product prior to issuance of permit.

Commissioner Mariani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[07:08 pm]
02:37:00

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7397**

ADDRESS: 3290 Sherborne

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Sherwood Forest HD

APPLICANT: Mark Hagerty, Ray Myers (Contractors)

PROPERTY OWNER: Jeremy Wagner-Kaiser

SCOPE OF WORK: Install solar panels

PROPOSAL:

The owner is working through a contractor for the following proposed work: Install thirty-nine (39) roof-mounted, Jinko 370W solar panels, each panel with a micro inverter underneath, and three (3) Enphase IQ combiners near meter at the rear elevation.

[07:10 pm]
02:37:30

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- Jeremy Wagner-Kaiser (Owner): wants to reduce carbon footprint and be more resilient to power-outages.
- Ray Myers (Contractor): Staff report's recommendations would severely limit owner's ability to provide adequate power to the home.
- Commissioners discuss the visibility of these proposed panels, the detriment to the community and their impact on the historic character of the neighborhood. Commissioners discussed how past cases have been approved or denied pending on the location of the solar panels. Commissioners have been consistent and been willing to approve non-visible panels and deny visible panels.

- Commissioners elected to approve only the nonvisible panels and deny the visible panels.

[07:15 pm]
02:43:30

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7397 for 3290 Sherbourne** and, having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work with the following conditions:

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Solar panels only at the proposed garage roof ,rear elevation, and shed dormer roof locations on the house. (See Roof Plan, roofs #4, #5, #6, #7 and only shed dormer roof of roof #1)
- Solar panel equipment at rear of house near utility meter.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 1 (Hamilton)

MOTION CARRIED

[07:21 pm]
02:49:30

- **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7400**

VIOLATION NUMBER: #21-471

ADDRESS: 630 Virginia Park

HISTORIC DISTRICT: New Center Area HD

APPLICANT/ OWNER: Joe Guadagnino

SCOPE OF WORK: Window Replacement - Work Completed Without Approval

PROPOSAL

Per the submitted application, the applicant is seeking the Commission’s approval to retain work completed without HDC approval, which includes the replacement of all historic wood, true divided light windows with new aluminum-clad wood windows (matching operation and muntin pattern of previous window sash). Replacement window: Pella, Architect Traditional Series, wood aluminum-clad sash, simulated divided lights, color: black.

[07:22 pm]
02:50:30

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- Joe Guadagnino, Alycius (Owners): Had approval to replace 60% of the windows and permitted to repair the remaining windows. Found wood rot on the remaining windows. Other contractors agreed with the conditions and submitted reports to describe poor conditions of the windows. 8-10 windows were replaced without approval. Owner stated that they attempted to meet Staff on site, but did not provide a date for this request.
- Staff noted staff availability since May 2020.
- Owner replaced with almost identical divided windows. Historic photos were brought up, with diamond muntin window patterns, in the staff report. Owner states that they did not previously receive historic photos and could have replaced the 3rd floor window with that original pattern if they had known.

- Commissioners asked Staff what can be done about applications like this? Staff stated that the role of Staff is to make a recommendation based on the Standards.
- Commissioner stated that the work done is not a bad outcome.
- Clarification discussion on which windows were approved in the past COA.
- Discussion on having two motions: denial and approval.
- Owner clarified that all trim is the original material. New windows requiring new brick mold, which might have more character defining features than the sash. 2nd story front window is the one that is under this discussion.

[07:37 pm]
03:05:30

ACTION ONE

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7400 for 630 Virginia Park** and, having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application with regards to removal of the windows **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the removal of the proposed windows.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided, and;

(5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved, and;

(6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual quantities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[07:39 pm]
03:07:30

ACTION TWO

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7400 for 630 Virginia Park** installation of proposed windows, having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- *The first floor primary elevation windows be repaired and retained*

- *No additional brick mold aside from the small window on the right hand side of the 2nd story be replaced*

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[07:42 pm]
03:09:50

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7405**

ADDRESS: 1508 Brooklyn

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Corktown HD

APPLICANT/PROPERTY OWNER: Sarah Paleg

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace windows

PROPSAL:

Per the submitted documents, the applicant is proposing to replace 13 of 14 existing aluminum-clad wood windows with new black vinyl windows.

[07:43 pm]
03:09:50

COMMISSION (AND APPLICANT) COMMENTS

- Brad Lutz & Sarah Paleg (Applicants): Windows sash rotting, failing and needing repair. They are the first of several residents who will likely be replacing windows. These are 25-year warrantee windows that have failed.
- Commissioners discuss whether or not the windows are character-defining. The building is not historic, not a contributing feature.
- Commissioners discussion on material rather the principle of replacement of windows. Commissioners are not in support of the vinyl windows, but other composite material has been supported, approved by Staff. Fiberex is generally not approved, but it could be here because this is a non-historic building.
- There are 10 units in the development. Same color and materiality is important to keep the unify. Applicant is a Member at Large of the community and commit through the HOA to have all members meet these conditions to have the same material and color.
- Applicant states there is an equity issue due the cost.

[07:56 pm]
03:24:50

ACTION

Commissioner Hamilton move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7405 for 1508 Brooklyn** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed windows replacement WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- *The replacement of windows will be of a product other than vinyl*
- *The replacement windows will match existing windows in configuration and operation*
- *The Commission authorizes HDC Staff to approve applications in other units where the proposed replacement matches the windows approved for 1508 Brooklyn.*

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[07:58 pm]
03:26:40

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7467**

ADDRESS: 119 State

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Capitol Park HD

APPLICANT: Mike Kean/Levanway Sign

PROPERTY OWNER: Adam J Kaufman/AFC Detroit-LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Install vinyl window signage

PROPOSAL:

Per the current submission, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to adhere new opaque vinyl signage to storefront windows at the building's first story, at the north (front) and west (side) elevations. The signage will measure 560 square feet in total. The applicant has stated the signage will be installed at the proposed location "for about a year."

[07:59 pm]
03:27:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Jonathon Rollins (sign company): Clarification on the type of signage that it is see-through, not opaque and that it is not covering all the windows. Back in July of 2016, there was a COA for a similar project at this location when it was installed for the Lear building.
- Commissioner discussion about the character of both the building and the character of the building, the park and the area.
- Mike Gerhardt (Applicant): Signage is not meant to be permanent. Intention is to market the building. Signage would come down after the major tenants occupy the spaces. More permanent signage would be applied in the future.
- Vince Harris (Applicant): Could the smaller signage be approved? HDC Staff can address these at the Staff level.

[08:09 pm]
03:38:00

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7467 for 119 State** and, having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standard:
(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Commissioner A. Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 4 Nay – 0 Abstain – 1 (Hosey due to proximity to business)
(Commissioner Lockhart is no longer present)

MOTION CARRIED

[08:11 pm]
03:40:00

• **APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7468**

ADDRESS: 360 Lodge

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Berry Subdivision HD

APPLICANT: Nadav Doron

PROPERTY OWNER: ABI Invest MI, LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace concrete driveway with asphalt

PROPOSAL:

Concrete driveway, with brick border, and the concrete pad adjacent the garage will be removed and replaced with black asphalt.

[08:12 pm]
03:40:00

COMMISSION (AND DEVELOPER) COMMENTS

- Nadav Doron (Applicant): Agree with the Staff Report to use concrete instead of the proposed asphalt. They would like to extend the width driveway to the posts.
- Staff Recommendation is to retain brick edge and keep the concrete material. And Staff agrees that width of the driveway is ok.

[07:05 pm]
03:43:00

ACTION

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7468 for 360 Lodge** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed work on the driveway WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- *The concrete driveway from the brick pillars to the street can be replaced while retaining the original brick edging, where the new concrete driveway can be as wide as the opening between the two pillars.*
- *The new driveway shall be concrete not asphalt*

Commissioner A. Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[8:19pm]
03:47:00

XIII CITY PROJECTS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

None

[8:19pm]
03:47:00

XIV OLD BUSINESS

None

[8:19pm]
03:47:00

XV NEW BUSINESS

None

[8:20 pm]
03:47:00

XVI ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Miriani motioned to adjourn the meeting at 8:20 pm.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

MEETING ADJOURNED