DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

Date: March 10, 2021

Due to COVID-19 restrictions, this meeting was held electronically via Zoom Meeting Link and audio-recorded.

[Actual AGENDA

Time] /
Audio
Recording

Time Stamp

[05:37 pm] <u>I CALL TO ORDER</u>

O0:22:57 Chair Commissioner Johnson called the meeting to order at 5:37 p.m.

[05:38 pm] 00:23:59

II ROLL CALL

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION		PRESENT	ABSENT
Katie Johnson	Chair	X	
Tiffany Franklin	Vice-Chair	X	
Jim Hamilton	Commissioner	X	
Richard Hosey	Commissioner	From	From
		7:40pm	5:38pm
Alease Johnson	Commissioner	X	
Dennis Miriani	Commissioner	X	
STAFF			
Brendan Cagney	PDD	X	
Audra Dye	PDD	X	
Garrick Landsberg	PDD	X	
Ann Phillips	PDD	X	
Daniel Rieden	PDD	X	
Jennifer Ross	PDD	X	
Katy Trudeau	PDD	X	
Taylor Leonard	Law Dept.		X
Pamela Parrish	Law Dept.		X
Logan Patmon	Law Dept.		X
Jennifer Reinhardt	HDAB		X
Rebecca Savage	HDAB	X	
Rebecca Lockhart	DOIT	X	

[05:39 pm] 00:26:20

III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Director Landsberg requested that the agenda be changed in the following manner: #21-7065 for 1444-1448 Brooklyn and #21-7067 for 1259, 1309 Labrosse be moved from the public hearing portion of the agenda and moved to the non-public hearing portion of the agenda due to the following scope changes:

- The applicant requested to remove the application for 1309 Labrosse.
- The applicant requested that curb cuts be removed from the scope of the application for 1259 Labrosse.

Thus, only 1444-1448 Brooklyn/1259 Labrosse remains on the agenda.

Commissioner <u>J. Hamilton</u> asked the following projects be moved to the Consent Agenda:

- #21-7122 for 755 Seyburn
- #21-7065 for 1444-1448 Brooklyn and #21-7067 for 1259, 1309 Labrosse

Commissioner <u>A Johnson</u> - SUPPORT Ayes - 5 Nay - 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner <u>T. Franklin</u> moved that any presentations presented today to be no longer than 20 mins. and any public comments be no more than 2 mins., with staff support for keeping time on this effort. Director Landsberg confirmed staff support.

Commissioner <u>A Johnson</u> - SUPPORT Ayes -5 Nay -0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner <u>J. Hamilton</u> moved to approve the Agenda:

Commissioner <u>T. Franklin</u> - SUPPORT Ayes - 5 Nay - 0

MOTION CARRIED

[05:46 pm] 00:32:38

IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

Commissioner <u>J. Hamilton</u> made a motion to APPROVE the December 9, 2020 meeting minutes.

Commissioner <u>A Johnson</u> – SUPPORT

Ayes -5 Nay -0

MOTION CARRIED

[05:48 pm]

V REPORTS

00:33:30

Director Landsberg reported on resources damaged in Historic Districts due to fires at the following addresses:

- 1767 Edison of the Boston Edison HD catastrophic damage and building was demolished by the Detroit Building Authority as directed by the DBA Director.
- 134 Arden Park of the Arden Park- East Boston HD had a fire of minimal damage as reported by HDC Staff.

Ms. Rebecca Savage of HDAB reported City Council has approved four new Historic Districts, starting with Single Building Historic Districts:

- 1. The Bluebird Inn HD, 1521 Tireman, in October 2020
- 2. Higginbottom School HD, 8550 Chippewa St., in February 2021
- 3. Johnson Recreation Center HD, 8550 Chippewa St., in February 2021
- 4. Eastern Market HD, which contains 9 buildings, on February 9th, 2020

[05:49 pm] 00:35:28

VI APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO THE CONSENT AGENDA

Commissioner James Hamilton made a motion to APPROVE the following projects, with staff recommendations and conditions (if present):

#21-7065 and #21-7067 for 1444-1448 Brooklyn and 1259 Labrosse

Applicants Agreed to conditions of Staff Report

#21-7122, 755 Seyburn

Applicants Agreed to conditions of Staff Report

Commissioner Dennis Miriani – SUPPORT

 $Ayes - 5 \qquad Nay - 0$

MOTION CARRIED

[05:52 pm]

VII POSTPONED APPLICATION

00:38:40

None

[05:53 pm] 00:38:52

VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS)

• 1501-1567 Church, 1606-1622 Church, 1611 Michigan - Corktown HD (in and adjacent) - Demolish building; erect new buildings and parking structure

[06:22 pm]

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

01:07:17

[06:59 pm]

END (AUDIO)

01:45:02

[07:00 pm]

Commission (and Developer) Comments

01:45:34

[07:08 pm]

ACTION

01:53:50

Commissioner J. Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **1501-1567 Church**, **1606-1622 Church**, **1611 Michigan - Corktown HD (in and adjacent)**, will have a demonstrable effect on the Corktown Historic District, and that such a demonstrable effect is likely to be beneficial, subject to the condition that the historic self-storage building be retained, and that the determination of the Commission be reported to the Mayor and the City Council for their consideration.

Commissioner A. Johnson - SUPPORT

Aves - 5

Nav - 0

MOTION CARRIED

Additional Commissioner Hamilton Comments

[07:10 pm] 01:56:10

IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7112

ADDRESS: 445 Ledyard (Mariner's Inn) HISTORIC DISTRICT: Cass Park HD APPLICANT: Edward Potas, Cinnaire **OWNER:** Edward Potas, Cinnaire

SCOPE OF WORK: Revision to previously-approved application to include decrease in height, change in exterior materials, & change in fenestration type and opening size.

PROPOSAL:

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to revise the previously approved design of a new mixed-use building per the attached drawings and application. Included in the proposal are the following scope items:

• Decreased Building Height

- Previously Approved Design: 3-6 stories (6 story portion stepped down to 3 story portion)
- o **Revision Proposed:** Entire building to be 4 stories in height

• Fenestration

- o Previously Approved Design: See attached drawings for locations and sizes
- o **Revision Proposed:** See attached drawings for locations and sizes

• Building Cladding

- Previously Approved Design: Fiber cement panels (colors: off-white and dark gray), brick veneer (colors: dark gray and red), and accent panels (colors: yellow and orange)
- Revision Proposed: Metal panels (color: bone white & matte black), brick veneer (color: dark gray only), and accent panels (colors: peacock, sage, sea glass, goldenrod)

• Modified Building Footprint

- Previously Approved Design: See Figure 1 below (highlighted circles show areas of revision)
- Revision Proposed: See Figure 2 below (highlighted circles show areas of revision)

[07:14 pm] 02:00:28 [07:15 pm] 02:01:14 [07:22 pm]

02:07:29

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO) No comments

END (AUDIO)

ACTION

Commissioner A. Johnson moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7112 for 445 Ledyard Street**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines that the work as proposed WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner J. Hamilton - SUPPORT

 $Ayes - 5 \qquad Nay - 0$ **MOTION CARRIED**

[07:23 pm]

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7106

02:09:24

ADDRESS: 550 Fiske

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Joseph Berry Subdivision HD

APPLICANT: Charles Williams **OWNERS:** Charles Williams

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect new garage / storage structure.

PROPOSAL:

The current owner provided an application, narrative, site photos, construction documents and material details for the following proposed work: construct a new 20' x 25' garage, with a 4" concrete pad, set back 3 feet from the rear (east) and side (north) property line. See also attached documents provided by the applicant. No driveway or other site improvements are included because the proposed use for the garage is storage.

[07:29 pm] 02:14:50 [07:29 pm] 02:15:17 [07:31 pm]

02:16:00

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO) No Comment

END (AUDIO)

ACTION

Commissioner Jim Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7106 for 550 Fiske**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed 20' x 25' garage with 4" concrete pad WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The applicant will provide manufacturer specifications for aluminum siding for HDC staff review and approval prior to an issued permit.
- If exterior lighting is ever proposed for this storage structure, it must be approved by HDC staff for approval before it's installed.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay - 0

MOTION CARRIED

[07:33 pm]

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7108 and #21-7130

02:19:00

ADDRESS: 664-676 W. Alexandrine HISTORIC DISTRICT: Willis-Selden HD

APPLICANT: Brian Ellison, Kevin Brandon, Michael

OWNERS: Michael Ferlito, Ferlito Group

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect a new multiple-family building/30-unit apartment

building **PROPOSAL**

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to erect a new multiple-family, 30-unit, apartment building per the attached drawings and application. Included in the proposal are the following scope items:

• Sitework

o Demolition

- Demolish existing curb cut and concrete driveway.
- Demolish all existing concrete on the site in its entirety, including the sidewalk at the front (south) edge of the site
- Remove all existing trees on the site

New Sitework

- Renovate and repave alleys located adjacent to the site along the north and west property lines to City specifications.
- New curb cut and concrete approach/driveway near the east property line (new location)
- New asphalt-paved drive aisles and parking areas
- New 6' wide concrete sidewalk at the front (south) property line
- New concrete pedestrian paths around the building
- Creation of new recreational space at the front (south) end of the building consisting of a 2'-6" high wall running east/west, raised planters, landscape beds, wall-mounted douglas fir benches and paved with exposed aggregate concrete paving. Wall-mounted benches are to be "Timberform Greenway" model no. 2144-6 finish: Douglas Fir (untreated)
- Creation of a new 10'W x 5'D bike parking area located near the southeast corner of the proposed new building including three bike racks and paved with brick pavers. Bike racks are to be "Landscape Forms: FGP Bike Rack" finish: light gray aluminum
- Creation of a new recreational area at the rear (north) of the proposed building consisting of a dog run (artificial turn)
- Trash enclosure to be located near the northwest corner of the building.
- Install new 6'-0" high composite fence along the entire length of the east (side) property line
- Planting areas with ornamental grasses and small shrubs at various locations throughout the site
- New trees as shown on landscape plan

• New Construction

Construct a new 3-story, multiple-family apartment building (30 units)

- Proposed building is rectangular in form with a footprint that measures approximately 40°W x 153°D.
- Uncovered surface parking is proposed to be located on the east and west sides of the building. The east parking area is accessed via a new driveway off of Alexandrine and the west parking area is accessed off of the adjacent alley.
- Building set back approximately 12' from the front (south) property line and 10' from the rear (north) property line.

- All units are to be accessed either from grade or from exterior staircases and covered balconies. No interior circulation is proposed.
- Building materials include:
 - Medium-gray vertical metal panel system cladding
 - Dark gray brick veneer
 - Architectural metal panels with wood-like appearance color: Scandinavian Fir
 - Exterior insulated panel system with a stucco-like texture color: Cream/Buff mix, finish: fine
- All windows are proposed to be vinyl windows color: black
- Entry doors at all dwelling units are proposed to be fiberglass Therma
 Tru Smooth-Star doors door and frame finish: black
- Exterior light fixtures at dwelling units are proposed to be Glacier Integrated LED wall-mounted lights by Artika material/finish: dark gray aluminum with glass lens, size: 5.1" x 3.2" x 11.8"
- Exterior balcony railings are to be a cable rail system with steel posts
 frame finish: black

[07:51 pm] 02:36:40 [08:00 pm] 02:48:34 [08:12 pm]

02:58:18

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)

END (AUDIO)

ACTION

Commissioner Jim Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7108 and #21-7130 for 664-676 W. Alexandrine**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines will **not** be appropriate and therefore issues a DENIAL for proposed work.

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 MOTION CARRIED

[08:15 pm] 03:01:25

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7109

ADDRESS: 1520 (1526) Broadway (Detroit Opera House)

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Grand Circus Park HD

APPLICANT: Gordon Janowski, Architect/Albert Kahn Associates Inc.

OWNERS: Patricia Walker

SCOPE OF WORK: New addition of elevator shaft/tower at east elevation **PROPOSAL**

As per the submitted proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to erect a new elevator tower at the building's rear/east elevation, adjacent to the ca. 1993 Smith Lobby wing. The tower shall include two elevators. The uppermost level of the new six-story tower will open on to the historic-building's rooftop. Per the applicant, the wing shall be erected according to the following specifications:

- The bottom portion of the exterior wall will be precast concrete panels. The finish will match the adjacent Smith Lobby.
- On the south side The material above the precast concrete panels will be staggered vertical insulated metal panels as indicated on drawings and product literature. This material continues to the top and is capped with metal coping.
- On the east side Materials continue to be the same as the south, until it reaches the entry/ exit portion. That portion will be glazed curtain wall that continues up to the top at a higher elevation, capped with metal coping. The finish for the curtain wall framing will be dark bronze, matching the Smith Lobby. Glazing will have a similar appearance as the in the Smith Lobby. Additional insulated metal panel will appear on this elevation, but will terminate at a lower elevation. Refer to product information on the curtain wall.
- On the north side Only a portion is visible, due to the adjacent Smith Lobby. This too is a continuation of the other side (east elevation) for both the insulated metal panel and glazed curtain wall.
- On the west side Only the top level is visible. This as well is a continuation of the other sides (north & south). The glazed curtain wall continues up to a higher elevation such as the north, south and east. There will be a door to enter/ exit the Elevator Lobby.
- There will be visible expansion joints, primarily on the south and east elevations. The product will be an expandable foam expansion joint between the existing buildings. The color selected will be as appropriate for the adjacent buildings and insulated metal panels.

[08:19 pm] 03:05:00 [08:19 pm] 03:05:20 [08:20 pm] 03:05:55

PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO) No Comments

END (AUDIO)

ACTION

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7109 for 1520 (1526) Broadway**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Richard Hosey – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 MOTION CARRIED

[08:21 pm] 03:07:10 • APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7107

ADDRESS: 1566 Bagley

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Corktown HD

APPLICANT: Josh Maddox

OWNERS: Tim Flintoff/4545 Architecture

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect new duplex building PROPOSAL

Per the submitted drawings, the applicant is proposing to erect a new 2-unit duplex in a contemporary design, described by the applicant as such:

The project proposes to construct a new 2-story 2-unit townhouse building at the corner of Bagley and 10th Streets. In 2016, the owners of the parcel constructed a single-family home with attached first-floor 2-car garage located at the rear (north) side of the site. Their vision always included eventually building rental units at the front of the property, with their unit acting as a carriage house off the alley. The design of the new townhomes takes cues from the existing home, replicating the gray metal siding, wood shiplap siding at the inset entries, and the overall simply massing featuring a single slope roof. The new townhomes introduce brick cladding on the first story along both Bagley and 10th Streets. The addition of brick provides additional durability along the sidewalk and adds visual weight to the base and allows the building to hold the corner. An existing stained wood fence currently encircles the owner's home at the rear of the site. The proposed project adds two offstreet parking spaces accessed from 10thStreet, and extends the existing fence to create a new shared exterior yard space at the rear of the new townhomes. Project Scope•Construct a new 2-unit Townhouse Building•Construct 2 new parking spaces off of 10th Street (including new curb cut) Extend/modify existing stained wood fence as shown on site plan

[08:26 pm] 03:12:16 [08:32 pm] 03:18:10 [08:38 pm] **PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)**

END (AUDIO)

ACTION

03:24:50 Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7107 for 1566 Bagley**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT Ayes – 5 Nay – 0 Abstain - 1 Commissioner Hamilton **MOTION CARRIED**

[08:40 pm] 03:26:18

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7121

ADDRESS: 112 Edmund

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Brush Park HD

APPLICANT: Carlo Liburdi, Tim L, Xander Bogarts,

OWNERS: Carlo Liburdi

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect a new multiple-family building/16-unit

condominiums **PROPOSAL**

This is the third submitted proposal to the HDC and incorporates revisions for the following proposed work: construction of a new 24,000 SF, three-story, 16 unit condominium building with private rooftop terraces, surface parking in the rear and a 5 foot screen wall.

SITE IMPROVEMENTS

- New parking lot and drive aisle accessed from existing alley: screened covered parking total 16 spaces and includes 1 ADA space.
- Bike storage for 8 bikes.
- Planting areas along John R and Edmund Place
- Five-foot, grey brick screenwall on north and west sides of parking area

NEW BUILDING

- Construct 1 new building consisting of 4 ranch style units on the first floor with 12 townhome units on the second and third floors.
 - Height 46' 10"
 - o 24,273 Total square feet
 - o Building footprint of 4,907 square feet
- Three entry access points to John R

[08:52 pm] 03:38:54 [08:55 pm] 03:41:11 [09:01 pm] **PUBLIC COMMENT: START (AUDIO)**

END (AUDIO)

ACTION

03:46:50 Commissioner Franklin moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7121 for 112 Edmund**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- West and East elevation parapets reflect one another
- Revise the grey (lighter) colored brick to a more appropriate (darker) color

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[09:03 pm] 03:48:50 X CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

None None

XI PUBLIC COMMENT

[09:03 pm] 03:49:00

None

[09:04 pm] 03:50:00 [09:07 pm] 03:54:44

-(RECESS)-

XII APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7124

ADDRESS: 894 & 910 Marlborough

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Jefferson-Chalmers HD (in and adjacent)

APPLICANT: Marques King, Brandon Hodges, Dorian Moore **PROPERTY OWNER:** Jefferson East Development Corporation

SCOPE OF WORK: (910 Marlborough) Alterations to previously-approved design;

(894 Marlborough) new surface parking lot.

PROPOSAL

910 Marlborough

In December 2020, the applicant submitted revisions to the Housing Revitalization Department for review and final approval. HRD staff contacted HDC staff to discuss the revisions, at which time it was confirmed the Historic District Commission had not been involved in project reviews since 2017.

To minimize confusion over what has occurred between 2017 and 2021, HDC staff identified the below items for HDC review:

Installation of vinyl windows (rather than HDC-approved aluminum-clad wood units)

Side Elevations, Basement – Third Floor: one-over-one double hung Rear Elevation, Basement – Third floor: one-over-one double hung and three-unit slider windows (sliders are an operational change from HDC-approved triple-mulled double-hung units)

- Operational and enlarging of some basement windows (rather than installing HDC-staff approved wood-clad double-hung units).
- Enclosure of rear elevation door openings: infilled with wood panels or flush wood doors (rather than HDC approved enclosures with brick, inset 1-inch)
- Condenser units will be located on roof of building (HDC approved at-grade condensing units at rear of building).

894 MARLBOROUGH

The lot was graded after the residential structure and garage were demolished. A 10-space surface parking lot is proposed.

[09:32 pm] 04:18:08

ACTION ONE: 910 Marlborough

Commissioner <u>Dennis Miriani</u> moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7124 for 910 Marlborough**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- A roof plan confirming location and setbacks of the condensers will be submitted for staff review.
- That cut sheets of the door panel that are to be placed in the rear openings to be submitted to staff for review.
- That cut sheets for the proposed replacement lighting be submitted to Staff for review and approval.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 **MOTION CARRIED**

[09:38 pm] 04:24:29

ACTION TWO: 894 Marlborough — Adjacent to the Jefferson-Chalmers Historic Business District Section 21-2-5, Effects of projects on districts — ADVISORY DETERMINATION

Commissioner Jim Hamilton moved that:

The Commission finds the proposed project at 894 Marlborough will have a demonstrable effect on the Jefferson-Chalmers Historic Business District, and that such demonstrable effect is likely to be beneficial as it will provide parking for the adjacent development.

This determination of the Commission shall be reported to the Mayor and City Council for their consideration.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 MOTION CARRIED

[08:39 pm]

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7125

04:25:34

ADDRESS: 1031 Marlborough

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Jefferson-Chalmers HD

APPLICANT: Marques King, Brandon Hodges, Ron Edwards **PROPERTY OWNER:** Jefferson East Development Corporation

SCOPE OF WORK: Rehabilitate building

PROPOSAL

To reiterate, the scopes of work before the Commission within this application are only those that have been revised and submitted to the city for review, or were recently added to the project (the surface parking lots).

1031 MARLBOROUGH

New Front Door: Construction Set: Pages A6 & A9.2

• A new front entry door fitting the existing frame is proposed and will be comprised of full clear glass door (24-light) with stained wood frame, flanked by six-high sidelights.

Door Enclosures - Construction Set: Page A6

Rear/West elevation and

Courtyard/East elevation

- o These doors led to areas in the basement and are partially below grade. The stair/light well will be infilled with dirt to level ground.
- Existing doors and frames will be removed. Openings will be infilled with new CMU

on the interior, finish brick matching adjacent brick will be placed on the exterior. Recess face of infill brick by one-inch.

Window Replacement – Construction Set: Page A6, Pella Shop Drawings, Pella Window Order

<u>Pella Reserve Traditional Style</u> Wood Windows, Integral Light Technology, primed exterior (paint color not specified)

It is staff's understanding the Pella window order was based on measured drawings, created by Quaker Windows in 2017, of the existing historic windows present in the building. Therefore, wider mullions, similar to historic mullions, have been specified.

East/Front elevation

Double-hung are six-over one, eight-over-one (2nd floor landing), twelve-over-one (3rd floor landing)

North/Side elevation, courtyard:

Double-hung units, one-over-one

South/Side elevation, courtyard:

Double-hung units, one-over-one

First bay closest to Marlborough will have six-over-one double-hung units to match front elevation windows

West/Rear elevation

Double-hung units, one-over-one

1039 MARLBOROUGH

AND 1040 CHALMERS

A sixteen space surface lot will be constructed encompassing both lots and bridged by the north-south alley.

Five spots (one ADA) will be located at 1039 Marlborough and accessed by a one-way entrance off Marlborough.

The remaining eleven parking spots will be at 1040 Chalmers, whose curb cut will offer two-way traffic leading in and out of the lot.

A sidewalk and ramp will immediately abut the north elevation of 1031 Marlborough, while a grass area will be adjacent the spots at 1040 Chalmers.

14501 East Jefferson

AVENUE

The lot will be patched as needed and restriped. The entry will be off the alley; exit will be at East Jefferson Avenue.

[08:41 pm] **ACTION**

04:27:20

Commissioner Miriani move that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7125 for 1031 Marlborough**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines that the proposed work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local

legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work with the Staff Conditions:.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Specifications for the entry door (material, stain, divided lights) will be submitted.
- Catalog cuts for the exterior light fixtures (and confirmation of placement) will be submitted.
- The window at the second floor landing, on the front elevation, will be removed and replaced with an eight-over-one double-hung window.
- The window being fabricated for the third floor landing should be confirmed through Pella (and HDC staff informed) that it will be a twelve-over-one double-hung unit.
- The paint color for the window sash will be submitted for review and will conform to the tenants of trim/sash options as outlined in Color System D.

Confirmation of A/C condensing units and their placement will be submitted. If the units are to be located on the roof, a dimensioned roof plan must be submitted for staff review

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 MOTION CARRIED

[09:43 pm]

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7126

04:28:56

ADDRESS: 14501 E. Jefferson

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Jefferson-Chalmers HD APPLICANT: Marques King, Brandon Hodges

PROPERTY OWNER: Jefferson East Development Corporation **SCOPE OF WORK:** Alterations to existing surface parking lot

PROPOSAL

The lot will be patched as needed and restriped. The entry will be off the alley; exit will be at East Jefferson Avenue.

[09:44 pm] 04:30:43

ACTION ONE:

Commissioner Hosey moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7126 for 14501 E. Jefferson Avenue**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the work as proposed WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 **MOTION CARRIED** [08:39 pm] 04:31:50 ACTION TWO: 1039 Marlborough and 1040 Chalmers — Adjacent to the Jefferson-Chalmers Historic Business District Section 21-2-5, Effects of projects on districts—ADVISORY DETERMINATION

Commissioner Jim Hamilton moved that:

The Commission finds the proposed project at 1039 Marlborough and 1040 Chalmers will have a demonstrable effect on the Jefferson-Chalmers Historic Business District, and that such demonstrable effect is likely to be **beneficial**. This determination of the Commission shall be reported to the Mayor and City Council for their consideration.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 MOTION CARRIED

[09:47 pm]

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7114

04:32:50 ADDRESS: 2220 Wabash *

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Corktown HD

APPLICANT: Mary Galvan

PROPERTY OWNER: Mary Galvan

SCOPE OF WORK: Install new vinyl siding on home.

PROPOSAL

The owner provided an application, project narrative, BSEED permit receipts (see timeline above), vinyl siding description and site photos for the following proposed work: Install vinyl siding on top of existing Insul-brick siding. Per the attached project narrative, the applicant proposes the following detail work:

- Existing Insul Brick to remain intact
- Install vinyl siding on exterior of existing siding, 4-1/2 " exposed
- Vertical trim at corners 4"
- Trim at all windows 5-1'2"

[09:49 pm] 04:32:50

ACTION

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #21-7114 for 2220 Wabash and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the work as proposed WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the vinyl siding, vertical trim at corners and the trim at all windows.

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

- 6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- 9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 **MOTION CARRIED**

[09:52 pm] 04:37:30

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7116

ADDRESS: 1773 Parker

HISTORIC DISTRICT: West Village HD

APPLICANT: Jennifer Lyon

PROPERTY OWNER: Jennifer Lyon **SCOPE OF WORK:** Window replacement.

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to replace woodframe windows on the East, West elevations of the house, storm windows on the North and South elevations, and replace a glass block window on the South elevation of the house.

FRONT (EAST) ELEVATION

• Replace 3rd floor dormer windows (3) with Pella Lifestyle, double-hung, white (See windows labeled, "X,Y,Z".)

REAR (WEST) ELEVATION

• Replace 2nd floor windows (2) with Pella Lifestyle, double-hung, white (See windows labeled, "U" and "V")

SIDE (NORTH) ELEVATION

• Replace 1st floor *storm* windows only (2) (See windows labeled, "A-1")

SIDE (SOUTH) ELEVATION

- Replace 1st floor *storm* window only (1) (See window labeled, "L")
- Replace 3rd floor glass block window (1) with Pella Lifestyle, double-hung, white (See window labeled, "W")

[10:01 pm] ACTION ONE

04:47:47 Commissioner <u>Hosey</u> moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7116 for 1773 Parker**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21

Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic

Districts Act, the Commission determines that the wood window replacement as proposed WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work item.

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
- 6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- 9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Commissioner <u>Hamilton</u> – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 **MOTION CARRIED**

[10:03 pm] 04:48:55

ACTION TWO

Commissioner <u>Hosey</u> moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7116 for 1773 Parker**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed replacement of storm windows on the north and south elevations and the replacement of the 3rd floor glass block window on the south elevation WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The double-hung window for the third floor shall be field-painted to match the color scheme and replacement windows approved at the November 2020 HDC meeting.
- The applicant shall provide the final window/storm specifications for the areas to be replaced for HDC staff review and approval prior to a permit being issued.

Commissioner Hamilton - SUPPORT

 $Ayes - 6 \qquad Nay - 0$ MOTION CARRIED

[10:05 pm] 04:50:24

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7117

ADDRESS: 85 Chicago – Work Done Without Approval **HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD**

APPLICANT: Bibiana Narcissa, Johnny Merehouyas, Alexander Belilovsky

PROPERTY OWNER: Bibiana Narcissa,

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace clay tile roof with new metal roof.

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to install Great American Shake Metal Roof Shingles, color:

Weathered Cedar.

Panel Exposure – 12" x 24" Weight Per Square: 90 pounds Material: G90 Galvanized Steel

Fastening Detail: Four-Way Interlocking Panels with Clips for Concealed Fasteners Finish: Four-layer PVDF coating, resin-based finish. Finish includes a high

definition woodgrain print, providing light and dark areas on panels.

[10:30 pm] 05:16:39

ACTION ONE

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7117 for 85 Chicago**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed work WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Alease Johnson - SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

MOTION CARRIED

[10:33 pm]

ACTION TWO

05:18:37 Commissioner <u>Hamilton</u> moved that:

The Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for **85 Chicago** for repair of wood roof decking and replaced with underlayment.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[10:35 pm] 05:21:55 • APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7093

ADDRESS: 9884 West Outer Drive

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Rosedale Park HD APPLICANT: Rachel Saltmarshall (Contractor)

PROPERTY OWNER: Durand Jones

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace three existing vinyl windows with new vinyl windows.

PROPOSAL

House

 At rear elevation, first story, replace a fixed vinyl picture window with a set of vinyl slider windows

- At side elevation, second story, replace one existing 1/1 vinyl double-hung window with a new 1/1 vinyl double-hung window
- At front elevation, first story, replace a fixed vinyl picture window a new vinyl picture window
- At the second story, front elevation, replace two double-hung 1/1 vinyl windows with two new double-hung 1/1 vinyl windows

Garage

- Replace the existing asphalt shingle, grey roof with a new brown asphalt shingle roof
- Replace the existing single metal overhead vehicle door with a new single metal overhead door with arched divided light windows
- Install beige vinyl siding at exterior walls

[10:40 pm] 05:26:37

ACTION ONE

Commissioner Miriani moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7093 for 9884 W. Outer Drive**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the new asphalt shingle roof, the single overhead door at the garage's front elevation, and replacement of five vinyl windows with new vinyl windows, WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for that proposed work with the Staff conditions:

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following condition:

- The new asphalt shingle roof at the garage shall be dark grey, to match the roof at the home.
- The existing hipped-roof vent at the garage's roof shall be retained in situ/in place. The new replacement windows shall be white to match the existing and have the same operation and light configuration as the existing. Specifically, the fixed picture windows at the front and rear elevation which are proposed for removal must each be replaced with a new vinyl picture window. Neither fixed windows can be replaced with slider windows.

MOTION CARRIED

[03:41 pm] 05:27:57

ACTION TWO

Commissioner Miriani moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7093 for 9884 W. Outer Drive**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the installation of vinyl siding at the garage's exterior walls WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

[10:43 pm]

• APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7115

05:29:05

ADDRESS: 4138 Lincoln

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Woodbridge Farms HD

APPLICANT: Micheal Sklenka

PROPERTY OWNER: Jacqui Au and Nick Soule

SCOPE OF WORK: Rehabilitate building to include replacement of existing

historic windows.

PROPOSALWith the current submission, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to rehabilitate the house per the attached drawings, including the following scope items:

Site

• At the rear yard, install a new HVAC condenser unit

Rear Elevation

- Remove existing door and infill opening
- At first story, add new door opening. Repair existing rear door and install in new opening.
- At second story, add new door opening/new door. New door will have a full height vision panel (material not specified)
- At second story new door, install metal railing for Juliet balcony
- At second story, add new window opening/new 1/1 aluminum-clad, wood window with 1x4 wood trim
- Erect a new partial-width wood porch at new door opening/door at first story
- Tuckpoint brick at foundation wall where necessary

 Install new cedar lapped wood siding to match existing at front and side elevations

South Elevation

- Replace all existing wood windows with new aluminum-clad wood windows
- Replace all existing trim/brickmould at windows with new cedar 1x4 trim
- Replace existing trim baseboard at wall/foundation junction with new 2x10 wood trim board
- Retain and repair existing wood lapped clapboard and fishcale shingle siding
- At bay window, retain and repair existing brackets
- Retain and repair existing basement windows
- Tuckpoint brick at foundation wall where necessary

North Elevation

- Replace all existing trim/brickmould at windows with new cedar 1x4 trim
- Retain and repair all existing wood sash/wood windows
- Replace existing trim baseboard at wall/foundation junction with new 2x10 wood trim board
- Retain and repair existing wood lapped clapboard and fishcale shingle siding
- Tuckpoint chimney where necessary
- Retain and repair existing basement windows
- Tuckpoint brick at foundation wall where necessary

Front Elevation

- Replace all existing historic wood windows with new aluminum-clad wood windows
- Remove existing historic front porch and rebuild to match. Only existing false brackets will be retained and reinstalled
- Replace all existing wood windows with new wood windows
- Retain and repair existing trim/brickmould at 2nd story windows only
- Replace all existing trim/brickmould at first story and attic story windows with new cedar 1x4 trim
- Replace existing trim baseboard at wall/foundation junction with new 2x10 wood trim board
- Retain and repair existing wood lapped clapboard and fishscale shingle siding
- At front gable overhang, retain and repair existing brackets
- Retain and repair existing basement windows
- Retain and repair existing wood panel siding
- Tuckpoint brick at foundation wall where necessary
- Retain and repair existing paired wood entry doors

Roof

- Replace existing asphalt shingle with new asphalt shingle roof (color brown)
- Install new aluminum gutters and downspouts (5"), color black or match trim color
- Retain and repair all existing brackets and trim boards

All Elevations

• Paint walls as per submitted color scheme

[11:06 pm] 05:52:08

ACTION

Commissioner Hamilton moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7115 for 4138 Lincoln**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The following elements of the front porch shall be retained and repaired where necessary with in kind materials:
 - The entire roof/canopy structure to include the roof, wood bead board ceiling, decorative wood brackets, and structural cornice/beam, and corner post and the remaining wood balustrade, newel posts. The corner posts, newel posts and balustrade may be repaired or replicated as necessary in accordance to the designation slide at the HDC.
- The existing windows, brickmould/trim, and mullions at the front elevation shall be retained and repaired.
- The applicant shall revise their construction drawings to reflect the Commission's conditions. These drawings shall be submitted to HDC staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of the permit.

Commissioner Franklin - SUPPORT Ayes - 6 Nay - 0 MOTION CARRIED

[11:10 pm] 05:56:16 • APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: #21-7137

ADDRESS: 532 Parkview

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Joseph Berry Subdivision HD APPLICANT: Natalia Pruchniak, Robert Skinner, Roofer

PROPERTY OWNER: Natalia Pruchniak

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace historic roof with asphalt shingle roof (work partially completed)

PROPOSAL

With the current submission, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to replace the existing concrete tile and asphalt-shingle roofing with new dimensional asphalt shingles. See the included brochure that outlines the product for which the applicant is seeking approval and the image of the below three images of the product options which she has submitted: The color of the asphalt roofing which she would like to install is "Weathered Wood".

[11:33 pm] 06:19:22 **ACTION**

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #21-7137 for 532 Parkview**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed work WILL NOT BE

APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- 5) Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
- 6) Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 MOTION CARRIED

[11:36 pm] • **REPEAT DETERMINATION:** for 9884 W. Outer Drive. Owner fell asleep. Q&A 06:20:51

[11:39 pm] XIII CITY PROJECTS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING
None

[11:39 pm] XIV OLD BUSINESS

06:25:00 None

[11:39 pm] XV NEW BUSINESS

06:25:14 HDC Staff report out on potential steel window replacements.

[11:42 pm] XVI ADJOURNMENT

06:27:14 Commissioner Miriani motioned to adjourn the meeting at 11:42pm.

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 **MOTION CARRIED**

MEETING ADJOURNED