

STAFF REPORT 9-11-2019 MEETING
APPLICATION NUMBER 19-6438
ADDRESS: 2225 W. BOSTON
HISTORIC DISTRICT: BOSTON EDISON
APPLICANT: JACQUELINE CUTRIGHT
DATE OF COMPLETE APPLICATION: 8-1-2019
DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: 9/9/2019

PREPARED BY: J. ROSS

SCOPE: REPLACE WOOD COLUMNS WITH NEW FIBERGLASS COLUMNS

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The building located at 2225 W. Boston is a two-story, single-family dwelling that was erected ca. 1920. The building features buff brick exterior cladding and wood sash windows. The roof is hipped, with hipped-roof dormers located at the side elevation roof surface. A centrally-located, partial-width porch with four monumental wood Tuscan columns shelters the building's primary entrance. Additional classical detailing at the front porch includes the cornice and dentils at its roof.

2225 W. Boston, current appearance



PROPOSAL

As per the **submitted proposal**, the applicant proposes to replace the two freestanding wood Tuscan columns at the front porch with two new composite columns which measure 9'1" in height, 18" in diameter (at the base) and 15" in diameter (at the capitol). The new columns will be painted to match the

existing trim/pilasters. The applicant has stated that the homeowner wishes to replace the columns because they are rotted at the base.

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- The applicant has provided photographic evidence of the wood rot at the base of the two columns. Staff has reviewed these photos and is of the opinion that the columns can be repaired.
- It is also staff's opinion that the columns are significant character-defining features of the home

ISSUES

- As per Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation standard number 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*
- It appears that the columns proposed for replacement are repairable

RECOMMENDATION

As per the above, it is staff's opinion that the two columns proposed for replacement can be repaired. Staff therefore recommends that the Commission deny the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work as proposed because it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, standard # 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*









HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION PROJECT REVIEW REQUEST

CITY OF DETROIT
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
2 WOODWARD AVENUE, ROOM 808, DETROIT, MI 48226

DATE: _____

PROPERTY INFORMATION

ADDRESS: 2225 W. Boston Blvd AKA: _____

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston Edison

APPLICANT IDENTIFICATION

Property
Owner/
Homeowner

Contractor

Tenant or
Business
Occupant

Architect/
Engineer/
Consultant

NAME: JACQUELYN CUTRIGI COMPANY NAME: EBD LLC

ADDRESS: 602 E. Maple Dale CITY: Hogansville STATE: MD ZIP: 48030

PHONE: 548-403-2889 MOBILE: _____ EMAIL: JACQUELYN.

ELEGANCEBYDESIGN@
hotmail.com

PROJECT REVIEW REQUEST CHECKLIST

Please attach the following documentation to your request:

- Photographs** of ALL sides of existing building or site
- Detailed photographs** of location of proposed work (photographs to show existing condition(s), design, color, & material)
- Description of existing conditions** (including materials and design)
- Description of project** (if replacing any existing material(s), include an explanation as to why replacement--rather than repair--of existing and/or construction of new is required)
- Detailed scope of work** (formatted as bulleted list)
- Brochure/cut sheets** for proposed replacement material(s) and/or product(s), as applicable

NOTE:


Based on the scope of work, additional documentation may be required.

See www.detroitmi.gov/hdc for scope-specific requirements.

Upon receipt of this documentation, staff will review and inform you of the next steps toward obtaining your building permit from the Buildings, Safety Engineering and Environmental Department (BSEED) to perform the work.

SUBMIT COMPLETED REQUESTS TO **HDC@DETROITMI.GOV**

Design #200DC



Bot. Dia.	Top Dia.	Shaft Heights	Base/Plinth Height	Plinth Width	Cap Height	Cap Width
6"	5 1/2"	6' - 10'	3 1/4"	8 1/4"	1 3/4"	7 1/8"
8"	6 1/2"	5' 6" - 10'	4 1/4"	10 1/4"	2 3/8"	9 9/16"
10"	8 1/2"	6' - 12'	5 1/4"	12 7/8"	3"	11 7/8"
12"	10"	6' - 16'	6"	15 1/4"	3 3/8"	14 1/2"
14"	12"	8' - 16'	7 3/8"	18 3/4"	4"	17 1/4"
16"	13 1/2"	8' - 20'	8 3/8"	21 1/2"	4 5/8"	19 1/4"
18"	15"	8' - 20'	9 5/8"	24 1/4"	5"	21 3/8"
20"	17"	12' - 20'	10 3/4"	27"	5 5/8"	24 1/4"
24"	20"	8' - 24'	13 1/4"	32 1/2"	6 7/8"	28 3/4"

overall height 9 ft 1 in



QUOTATION

QUOTE NO. 19671113

DATE June 10, 2019

SOLD TO: Daniel Behnke
602 East Mapledale
Hazel Park, MI 48030

PROJECT Behnke Residence
FREIGHT Delivered to Zip 48206

Phone: 248-403-2889
Fax:

PREPARED BY Will Fuller
Cell:
Email: danielbehnke@live.com

Quantity	2				
Diagram	A				
Design #	200DC				
Bottom Diameter	18"				
Top Diameter	15"				
Pilaster Dimension	-				
Overall Height	9'-4"	EXISTING MEASUREMENTS			
Flashing	No				
Capital	PolyMarble				
Base	PolyMarble				
Plinth	PolyMarble				
Primer	No				
Shaft	PolyMarble				
Splitting	No				
Unit Price	\$1,511.00				
Price Extension	\$3,022.00				

Remarks: DuraClassic™ PolyMarble Composite Columns; Round Tapered Shafts w/ Tuscan Design Cap/Base; Lifetime Warranty; Delivered LTL Curbside - Customer Offload

Product Total:	\$ 3,022.00
Sales Tax:	
Total:	

Melton Classics, Inc. quotation is based upon our standard item numbers and specifications. All products are custom manufactured for your project and cannot be returned for credit.
 QUOTATION OPEN FOR ACCEPTANCE UNTIL: 10 DAYS
 SCHEDULED SHIPMENT: 6-8 Weeks From Approved Submittals, If Required
 TERMS: 100% DUE AT TIME OF ORDER FOR ALL ORDERS UNDER \$5000

Project Overview

By

Elegance By Design

For

Lackey Residence

Description of existing condition

Columns are crumbling from moisture and support portico is giving way. Columns were originally built by stacking 2x4s, they are disintegrating from base to top and cannot be repaired.

Description of project

Replacing front wood columns supporting portico with Tuscan style polymarble fiberglass columns from Milton Classics. Will be primed with Sherwin Williams Durations paint recommended by manufacturer

Detailed scope of project

Order fiberglass columns, when received discard existing columns, and replace with new columns, then paint per manufacturer instructions

Melton Classics, Inc.

DuraClassic ColumnTM Limited Lifetime Warranty

Melton Classics, Inc. extends the following Limited Lifetime Warranty (the "Warranty") to original purchasers of its DuraClassic Composite Fiberglass Columns. An "Original Purchaser" is a retailer, distributor, builder or supplier that purchases the Product or the first individual homeowner who purchases the Product from a retailer, distributor, builder or supplier, whether or not the Product has been installed. This Warranty is not transferable to subsequent owners. Melton Classics, Inc. warrants that the Product, when properly installed in conformance to all governing building codes, shall be free of manufacturing defects in workmanship and materials under conditions of normal use and service. If the Product fails to perform as warranted, during the associated time periods listed below for each particular Product, as a result of defective material or workmanship and meets the criteria set forth in this Warranty, Melton Classics Inc. will provide replacement parts of those materials that it deems defective after its review. Installation and labor costs are NOT covered under this Warranty. Only finishes applied by the factory are covered under this Warranty.

Original Purchasers must look to the warranty or warranties, if any, of the paint manufacturer associated with the paint applied to the Product for recourse as to defects or any other issue concerning applied finishes. Product Components or Product Systems purchased from outside suppliers of Melton Classics will be warranted by those vendors under their standard warranty.

To validate this warranty a registration request must be made by the customer within 30 days of substantial completion of the project on which the DuraClassic Columns are installed. Warranty registration and activation can be accomplished by sending proof of purchase with order number to Melton Classics Inc. P.O. Box 465020 Lawrenceville, GA 30042. A certified warranty will be sent to the address of the customer of record within 30 days of receipt of a properly filed registration request. This warranty is void if not registered with proof of purchase within 30 days of substantial completion of the project on which the DuraClassic Columns are installed.

DuraClassic Columns must be installed and maintained in strict accordance to the DuraClassic Column Installation Instructions posted on the Melton Classics Inc. website. DuraClassic Columns should not be painted in dark colors (Dark colors are considered any color that falls within the L Value of 56 and 0). "L" is a measure of color with 0 being black and 100 being white.

If a warranted defect is determined to exist, Melton Classics shall repair or replace the product at its option. If Melton Classics determines that it shall replace the defective product, it will supply a product with the same general characteristics as originally furnished. Where replacement products are required and the defective product has been discontinued, or is no longer available, Melton Classics reserves the right to supply a product of equal or greater value.

General Conditions & Exclusions:

This Warranty is not transferrable and is subject to the following general conditions and exclusions:

There are certain conditions or applications over which Melton Classics, Inc. has no control. This Warranty does not cover defects or problems as a result of such conditions or applications, including but not limited to the following:

- Damage caused by improper installation, use, applications, or maintenance.
- Damage caused by environmental conditions or use that exceeds design standards.
- Damaged arising out of improper or unreasonable product use.
- Attempt to repair the product by anyone other than an authorized Melton Classics representative.
- Damage caused by accidents, Acts of God, abuse, vandalism, animal activity, or any other external force.
- Damage resulting from mishandling in transit.
- Damages resulting from the failure to apply a finish to any purchased, unfinished Product.
- Damages caused by lack of routine maintenance, including but not limited to painting or caulking the product as needed.
- Any modifications to the column, including but not limited to, splitting the column, by anyone, including but not limited to a retailer, distributor, builder, or supplier.
- Normal weathering, chalking, fading, mildew buildup, or the effects of atmospheric pollutants.
- Non-Factory applied finishes, applied sealants, or caulking.
- Installation or labor costs or disposal fees associated with removing or installing replacement product.
- Improper installation, including but not limited to installation in violation of building codes.
- Any product, part, assembly, coating, adhesive or hardware not manufactured by Melton Classics Inc.
- Damage or distortion to the product caused by twisting, bowing, or any other movement of the structure to which the product is installed or attached.
- Color matching of the product material to any other Melton Classics, Inc. material or product.

Melton Classics, Inc. makes no other express warranties, oral, or written. By purchasing or using the Product, you agree that you are not relying on any oral statements made by anyone that are in any way contrary to this Warranty. Melton Classics, Inc. liability shall be limited in all instances to the remedy provided above; that is, the remedy stated above is your sole and exclusive remedy. Melton Classics, Inc. shall not be responsible for incidental or consequential damages relating to your purchase or use of the Product.

Any products, parts, assemblies, coatings, adhesives or hardware manufactured by an outside supplier are ultimately the responsibility of the outside manufacturer and any warranty claim will be the responsibility of the outside supplier.

Statute of limitations:

No action arising out of any claimed breach of this agreement by seller may be brought by buyer more than Ninety (90) Days after the cause of action has arisen.

Rights May Vary By State:

This warranty gives you specific legal rights and you may have other rights which vary from state to state. Some states do not allow the exclusions or limitations of incidental or consequential damages so the above limitations or exclusions may not apply to you.

This warranty is only applicable in the United States and any and all litigation arising out of this warranty shall be brought, if at all, in the Circuit Court of Gwinnett County, Georgia, which court shall have exclusive jurisdiction to resolve any such litigation. All such litigation shall be tried without a jury.

Customer: _____

Project: _____ Date Shipped: _____

Address: _____

City _____ State: _____ Zip: _____

Authorized: _____ Title: _____ Date: _____