3/22/2012

		Page 1
1	DETROIT BOARD OF POLICE COMMISSIONERS	
2		
3		
4		
5		
6	REGULAR BOARD MEETING	
7		
8		
9		
10		
11	/	
12		
13		
14		
15	PAGE 1 TO 26	
16		
17	Taken at 1300 Beaubien Street, Room 328	
18	Detroit, Michigan,	
19	Commencing at 3:20 p.m.,	
20	Thursday, March 22, 2012,	
21	Before Wendy A. Boer, CSR 3505.	
22		
23		
24		
25		



3/22/2012

		Page 2
1	APPEARANCES:	
2		
3		
4	MR. DONNELL WHITE, CHAIRMAN	
5		
6	MR. JEROME WARFIELD, COMMISSIONER	
7		
8	MS. JESSICA TAYLOR, COMMISSIONER	
9		
LO	MR. TONEY STEWART, COMMISSIONER	
L1		
12	MR. CHESTER LOGAN, ASSISTANT CHIEF OF POLICE	
13		
L 4	MR. GEORGE ANTHONY, EXECUTIVE SECRETARY	
15		
L6		
L 7		
L8		
L9		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		



Page 3 Detroit, Michigan 1 2 Thursday, March 22, 2012 3 About 3:20 p.m. 4 5 CHAIRMAN WHITE: We say good afternoon to everyone and welcome you to the Board of Police 6 7 Commissioners meeting dated for Thursday, March 22nd, 2012. My name is Commissioner Donnell White. I have 8 9 the pleasure of serving as Chairman for the Board of 10 Police Commissioners. Today I am joined with my 11 colleague to my left and your right, Commissioner Toney 12 Stewart who is the vice chair to the Board of Police 13 Commissioners. To my right, Commissioner Jerome 14 Warfield and Commissioner Jessica Taylor. representing the staff of the Board of Police 15 Commissioners, Executive Secretary to the Board, 16 17 Mr. George Anthony. Mr. Anthony, for the record, can 18 you please introduce our staff? 19 SECRETARY ANTHONY: Thank you, Mr. Chair. 20 George Anthony for the record. Present we have 21 Ms. Celia Banks Washington who is our attorney to the 22 Board; Ms. Dalph Watson who is our director of police 23 personnel; Lieutenant Tim Leach from the Office of the Chief Investigator. We have Mr. Robert Brown who is our 24 25 office manager, Sergeant Alan Quinn who is recording our



	Page 4
1	proceedings and Miss Wendy Boer from Hanson Court
2	Reporting Service. That completes the introductions.
3	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Thank you, Mr. Secretary.
4	Certainly I would like to note the presence representing
5	the Office of the Chief, Assistance Chief Chester Logan.
6	Thank you for being with us, sir.
7	ASSISTANT CHIEF LOGAN: Good to be here, sir.
8	CHAIRMAN WHITE: At this time we'll ask if we
9	can have our invocation from Chaplain Darren Penson of
10	the Allen Temple AME Church.
11	CHAPLAIN PENSON: Could we all bow our heads
12	in a word of prayer? Dear gracious, kind and wonderful
13	heavenly father, we come before you first and foremost
14	to say thank you. And now we ask your blessings upon
15	this meeting, that it is utilized to enhance our
16	Department in efforts for a brighter Detroit. We bless
17	your holy name. In Jesus name, Amen.
18	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Thank you, sir. At this
19	time, a motion for the approval of the agenda dated
20	Thursday, March 22, 2012, will be in order.
21	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: So moved.
22	COMMISSIONER STEWART: Second.
23	CHAIRMAN WHITE: It's been properly moved and
24	supported. Any discussion? Seeing none, all those in
25	favor?



1	COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
2	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Opposed? Thank you. At this
3	time, the approval of the minutes for Thursday, March
4	15, 2012, will be in order.
5	COMMISSIONER STEWART: So moved.
6	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Second.
7	CHAIRMAN WHITE: It's been properly moved and
8	supported. Any discussion? Seeing none, all those in
9	favor?
10	COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
11	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Opposed? Thank you very
12	much. Under the Chairperson's report we'd just like to
13	make reference to one point. The proposed revisions to
14	the towing rules as were supposed to be produced or
15	published if you will on March the 19th did not appear
16	published until March the 20th. That was not an error
17	of this body or our staff. That was the earliest date
18	that they could publish that information. And
19	Commissioners, with that being said, there will be a
20	need to adjust another date to remain within the rules.
21	As we move through this process, I'm going to
22	ask if Counsel can come forward with the recommendation.
23	Attorney WASHINGTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Celia
24	Washington on behalf of the Board. Because of the
25	March 20th print date, in order to make sure that we



	Page 6
1	have had the complete 30 days, that public hearing
2	should be moved, Mr. Chair, to April 26th.
3	CHAIRMAN WARFIELD: Thank you, Counselor.
4	There is a question from Commissioner Warfield.
5	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: They published the
6	rules on March 20th, correct? That's when it went in?
7	If you count from March 20th to April 19th, that's
8	31 days.
9	Attorney WASHINGTON: Okay. We were just adding in
10	I think a buffer. But we can certainly do that. We can
11	keep it as it is.
12	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: So 31 days. But will
13	31 days be within the period of time?
14	MS. WASHINGTON: It has to run for four weeks.
15	And we had an issue before. So it has to be for four
16	weeks.
17	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: So, is it four weeks
18	or is it 30 days?
19	Attorney WASHINGTON: The Charter says four weeks.
20	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Let us err on the side
21	of caution then.
22	Attorney WASHINGTON: Yes.
23	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Commissioners, before us is a
24	recommendation from Counsel to hold our public hearing
25	date to change the original public hearing date to



1	hold it on April 26th, 2012. Is there a motion?
2	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Sir, I move that we
3	hold the public hearing as relates to the adjustments to
4	the towing rules for April the 26th.
5	COMMISSIONER STEWART: Support.
6	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Properly moved and supported.
7	Any discussion? Seeing none, all those in favor?
8	COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
9	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Opposed? Thank you very
10	much. Before we move on to our Secretary's report, I
11	would also like to apologize for my early leave again
12	today. For those of you who are our regular members,
13	our fourth Thursdays, there's a need for me to leave
14	early to adjust for some other responsibilities that I
15	have. So, pardon my leaving mid way. And also, we beg
16	for your indulgence as there is also a number of
17	personnel committee issues that need to be held in
18	closed session. And so, there's a need for us to move
19	to closed session prior to public comment. Typically we
20	hold closed session following public comment so you
21	don't have to stay through that grueling I shouldn't
22	say grueling through that wonderful process as it
23	works itself through.
24	However, so that we can have forum to vote and
25	run our agenda appropriately, we'll do that prior to

	3/22/2012
	Page 8
1	public comment today. And Assistant Chief, we also beg
2	your indulgence if we could do that prior to our
3	presentation from the payroll department as well?
4	ASSISTANT CHIEF LOGAN: Yes, sir.
5	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Thank you, sir. At this
6	time, we will have our executive secretary's report.
7	SECRETARY ANTHONY: Thank you, Mr. Chair. For
8	the record, George Anthony, secretary to the Board.
9	There are there were requests for closed door
10	sessions as you indicated, and there are three. We have
11	a suspension without pay recommendation, Sergeant
12	Tiffany Jordan, Badge S-604. There's a disciplinary
13	appeal case, Deborah Stinson, BPC 11-002D. And then
14	there is the rejected applicant for Mr. Paul Fillmore.
15	As you indicated, you indicated that you would like to
16	go into closed session. Will it be now?
17	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Yes, sir.
18	SECRETARY ANTHONY: Did you want to go into
19	closed session now or was there any other preliminary
20	matters that you wanted to and I have just been
21	informed that Ms. Stinson is not a closed session. So,
22	there's just two closed sessions. What is your
23	pleasure? Would you like to go into closed session at

this point or are there other preliminary matters?

CHAIRMAN WHITE: If it's not in closed

24

1	session,	if	we	can	deal	with	the	disciplinary	appeal
2	prior to?	>							

2.2

will be the disciplinary appeal in the matter of Police Officer Deborah Stinson, Badge 612. Petitioner Police Officer Deborah Stinson was charged on February 24th, 2011, with the following rule violation. Count 1, neglect of duty, specification 1. She -- Police Officer Deborah Stinson, Badge 612, currently assigned to evidence control while on duty and in civilian attire did on September 17th, 2010, at approximately 8:30 a.m., neglect her duty by failing to notify her command that her scheduled police trial board was canceled, not returning back to her command until several hours later, this being in violation of the Detroit Police Department Manual Series 100, Directive 102.3-7.15, Miscellaneous Command 4.

Today on behalf of the Department is Counsel Letitia Jones. On behalf of the petitioner is Attorney Stolberg.

ATTORNEY STOLBERG: Good afternoon. For the record, Donald Stolberg on behalf of Police Officer Stinson. This incident stemmed from an allegation of neglect of duty that occurred while Officer Stinson was on duty on September 17th, 2010. She had a trial board

scheduled on that date on an unrelated matter of course and was informed upon her arrival that the trial board had been canceled. So, there's a sign-in book at the disciplinary administration section. And it shows that she signed in and signed out at exactly the same time.

There were phone records that were submitted on the part of Officer Stinson that showed that she did attempt to call a couple of supervisors, including her command's general phone number but was unable to reach anyone. And she did admit that she did not leave a message on any of those voice mails or message machines. Subsequently, she did explain that she spent some time chatting to a colleague in an office adjacent from the disciplinary administration section.

After that conversation, she explained that she left the section and saw that her vehicle was on empty. Now I can't remember whether she went to eat, took a code first or went to get gas first. But either way, she took her code, and she did drive to get gasoline. Upon her arrival at the filling station, she discovered that she did not have her card to swipe the gasoline and then subsequently returned to her command about three hours after she had signed out. She was working for the evidence control section at the time. She was not an officer that was on routine patrol. She

1	is the sort of officer as was admitted by many other
2	offices in that section that they don't even usually
3	take a code. They usually just work their way through
4	it. She didn't receive any phone calls saying she
5	needed to be anywhere in particular. She even after
6	that she requested some time off which was granted. And
7	that's the long and short of it.
8	There was the trial board did find her
9	guilty and suspended her to lose three days pay and
_ 0	benefits. Subsequently, this appeal petition was filed.
1	Your investigator's report and recommendation was
_2	submitted. I have reviewed it. I concur that the
_3	penalty meted out by the trial board should be reduced
_ 4	to a one day penalty under the circumstances since this
_5	represented her first adverse contact in the
_6	disciplinary process.
. 7	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Thank you, Attorney Stolberg.
_8	Attorney Jones?
_9	ATTORNEY JONES: Letitia Jones on behalf of the

City of Detroit Police Department. Thank you,

Commissioners, for letting me address you today.

Briefly, he did give a correct recitation of the facts

as to what happened. However, it is the City's position

that effectively she was AWOL for those three hours. No

one knew where she was. She didn't call back and reach



	raye 12
1	anyone. So, no one knew where she was. And so, we
2	would ask that you uphold the trial board's decision of
3	three days. She is she was found guilty, and there's
4	no denying that. And counsel even admits she was found
5	guilty.
6	The argument before you is was the penalty
7	justified. Now, as you know, we have a disciplinary
8	matrix. We have a commander's action, where they can
9	get a written reprimand up to three days per each
10	charge. Officers sometimes elect to take their chances
11	before a trial board. But at the trial board level, the
12	minimum penalty is three days to five days for a first
13	offense. So, we are asking they gave her the minimum
14	that she would receive at a trial board. So, we are
15	asking that you uphold the trial board, the Chief's
16	decision of the trial board's recommendation.
17	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Thank you, Attorney Jones.
18	Attorney Stolberg, for the record, is Officer Stinson
19	present?
20	ATTORNEY STOLBERG: Not to my knowledge. If I may
21	just have a second to peruse the hearing room? No, I do
22	not see her present.
23	CHAIRMAN WHITE: If the record could so



if we have questions from the commissioners.

24

25

reflect. Before we hear our recommendation, we'll see

1	Commissioner Stewart?
2	COMMISSIONER STEWART: None from me.
3	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Commissioner Warfield?
4	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: To Attorney Jones,
5	Attorney Jones, if we go below the trial board
6	recommendation, would that effect the matrix?
7	ATTORNEY JONES: It does not effect the matrix.
8	The Collective Bargaining Agreement allows for the
9	Commissioners to modify. So, you could effectively go
10	down to a written reprimand. We would hope that you
11	don't do that, but you could. That is within your
12	jurisdiction to do so. Have I responded to your
13	question?
14	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Sorry. Through the
15	Chair, I think I was about to ask the question, but
16	you've already answered it. That was the minimum
17	penalty that she could receive from the trial board was
18	three to five days? That's the lowest that she could
19	have got, correct?
20	ATTORNEY JONES: From the trial board, yes, because
21	she elected to I have people telling me I'm not
22	telling you that she waived to a trial board, but she
23	elected to go to a trial board. And when I say elected,
24	I do mean she waived to go to a trial board.
25	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Got you. Okay.



1	Attorney STOLBERG: If I may?
2	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Please.
3	ATTORNEY STOLBERG: Very briefly. You should know
4	that this disciplinary matrix is not even binding on the
5	trial board. So, they are not compelled. They I
6	think the Department would have you believe that the
7	trial board is bound by this disciplinary matrix. It is
8	not. They can do whatever they decide. They can find
9	someone not guilty. You have that power. You could
10	determine to dismiss this case or mete out any penalty.
11	In other words, this matrix is simply a recommendation.
12	It's not bargained for, and it's not part of the
13	contract.
14	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Thank you, Attorney Stolberg.
15	Commissioner Taylor?
16	COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: No, I don't have any
17	questions.
18	CHAIRMAN WHITE: If I could, Attorney Jones,
19	could you explain to the Board the process in terms of
20	how officers are explained their options through the
21	matrix?
22	ATTORNEY JONES: Generally, when a police officer
23	has no discipline, when they get charged, it
24	automatically unless it's something really egregious,
25	it automatically goes back to a commander's action.



1	They can elect to have a commander's hearing or they can
2	elect to waive to a trial board. In this case, she
3	waived to a trial board.
4	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Who advises them on that
5	phase, on that process?
6	ATTORNEY JONES: I don't know if they have a union
7	rep present. But it is in the manual. It's in the
8	Department manual. And I would think that the commander
9	as well as the union rep would advise them they can
10	waive.
11	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Counsel?
12	ATTORNEY WASHINGTON: Thank you, sir. Through the
13	Chair, after reviewing the trial board transcripts and
14	actually the entire disciplinary file, if you will allow
15	me just very briefly to give the support for the
16	recommendation for the reduction. The first issue is
17	the specification as it was charged, as it was pled.
18	There was an error in the specification. It said that
19	at the date and time of this incident, that she was in
20	civilian clothing. The testimony that was offered
21	during the trial board supported that she was in her
22	uniform at the time.
23	During the trial board argument, the
24	Department took the position that that error was a

harmless error. And I don't necessarily disagree with

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 16

it being a harmless error.	The issue,	though, is that
factored into the number of	days. So,	there was an
error. She was not in civil	lian unifor	m in civilian
clothing. She was in unifor	rm. That w	as one issue.

So, that leaves us with the primary issue of whether she neglected her duty by failing to notify her command. After reviewing again the transcripts and the testimony, there was nothing offered to contradict that particular issue. She made several attempts to contact her command but unfortunately didn't leave messages with anybody. The trial board based its disciplinary action on several factors which included the officer's past discipline history, which is in this case she didn't have any; the discipline matrix; the progressive discipline standard and reasonableness. In light of the error and Charge 1, Specification 1 together with Officer Stinson's lack of history of prior discipline, that's the basis for the recommendation that the trial board findings be reduced from three days to one day suspension.

CHAIRMAN WHITE: Thank you, Counsel.

Commissioners, as relates to the recommendation by counsel, as relates to Charge 1, Specification 1 for Officer Stinson for the lack of history of prior discipline, the recommendation before us is that the

1	trial board's findings be reduced from a three-day
2	suspension to a one-day suspension. Is there a motion?
3	Is there a motion and support?
4	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Sir, I move that we
5	uphold the trial board's recommendation of a three-day
6	suspension.
7	COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Support.
8	CHAIRMAN WHITE: It's been properly moved and
9	supported. Any discussion? Seeing none, all those in
10	favor?
11	COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
12	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Opposed? Opposed. Is that
13	majority vote, Counsel?
14	ATTORNEY WASHINGTON: Yes, sir.
15	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Thank you. As relates to
16	Officer Stinson, the trial board's recommendation of a
17	three-day suspension will pass. Mr. Secretary?
18	SECRETARY ANTHONY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
19	Just to clarify some old matters from last week. There
20	were a couple of closed door sessions last week. And we
21	need to record Commissioner Toney's recommendations.
22	The first or his vote I should say. The first
23	pertains to Officer William Brown. It was a suspension
24	without pay recommendation from the Chief. And unless
25	contravened by Commissioner Toney Stewart, the



1	recommendation suspension without pay recommendation
2	will stand.
3	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Commissioner, any
4	contravention? Seeing none, that suspension without pay
5	will stand.
6	SECRETARY ANTHONY: There was one
7	contravention last week in that. So, it will be
8	Officer Brown will be suspended with pay.
9	CHAIRMAN WHITE: So, there is one
10	contravention?
11	SECRETARY ANTHONY: One contravention from
12	last week, correct. The next was Mr. Jeremy Burchman,
13	which was a rejected applicant. Do we have to is
14	that necessary? We don't have to deal with that one at
15	all. That's it, sir. Closed session?
16	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Yes, please.
17	SECRETARY ANTHONY: As a public body, your
18	meetings are subject to the Open Meetings Act, the OMA.
19	The OMA defines a meeting as the convening of a public
20	body at which a quorum is present for the purpose of
21	deliberating towards or rendering a decision on a public
22	policy, MCL 15.262(b). The OMA however does allow a
23	public body to call a closed session, one limited to the
24	public body and its invitees for stated purposes only.
25	Only deliberations may be conducted in closed session.



	o, ==, =,==
	Page 19
1	All decisions must be made at a meeting open to the
2	public. While in the closed session, the Board makes no
3	decisions. That must be done on the record.
4	On Thursday, March 22nd, 2012, you will be
5	presented with the suspension without pay recommendation
6	for Sergeant Tiffany Jordan, Badge S-604, through her
7	representative, LSA Attorney Fred Walker. Sergeant
8	Jordan has requested closed sessions for the purpose of
9	contesting the suspension without pay recommendation.
10	The closed session will be called pursuant to 15.268(a)
11	of the Open Meetings Act, which states in part, "The
12	public body may meet in a closed session to consider the
13	suspension of or hear charges brought against an
1.4	employee. A simple majority vote quorum of three is
15	required to close the session for this purpose.
16	A motion is in order for a closed session.
17	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Thank you, Mr. Secretary. Is
18	there a need to include the applicant?
19	SECRETARY ANTHONY: That's on the record.
20	CHAIRMAN WHITE: So
21	ATTORNEY WASHINGTON: Close the record.
22	SECRETARY ANTHONY: That's the one.
23	ATTORNEY WASHINGTON: You should close it on the



SECRETARY ANTHONY: With regards to the

record.

1	applicant, that would be Firefighter Paul Fillmore.
2	Some of the same language applies to this closed
3	session. As a public body, your meetings are subject to
4	the Open Meetings Act. And the OMA defines a meeting as
5	convening a public body at which a quorum is present for
6	the purpose of deliberating towards or rendering a
7	decision on a public policy, MCL 15.262(b). And that's
8	the same as it was, particularly to this particular
9	applicant at the Board meeting scheduled for Thursday,
10	March 22nd, 2012. Unless there is an objection, the
11	Board is scheduled to go into closed session to discuss
12	the rejected application of Paul Fillmore. And the
13	closed session will be called pursuant to MCL 15.268(h)
14	of the Open Meetings Act, which states in part, "A
15	public body may meet in a closed session to consider
16	material exempt from discussion or disclosure by state
17	or federal statute.
18	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Thank you, Mr. Secretary.
19	Commissioners, before us is a recommendation to move
20	into closed session to deal with personnel matters of
21	Sergeant Tiffany Jordan Badge S-604 as well as rejected
22	applicant Firefighter Paul Fillmore. Is there a motion?
23	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Sir, move that we move
24	into closed session to discuss the personnel matters
25	mentioned on the record.



Page 21 1 COMMISSIONER STEWART: Support. 2 CHAIRMAN WHITE: Properly moved and supported. 3 Any discussion? Seeing none, all those in favor? 4 COMMISSIONERS: Aye. 5 CHAIRMAN WHITE: Opposed? Thank you. We'll reconvene shortly. 6 7 (The Board of Commissioners entered into Closed Session from approximately 3:45 p.m. 8 9 to 4:45 p.m.) 10 CHAIRMAN WHITE: We will call this meeting 11 back to order. Mr. Secretary? 12 SECRETARY ANTHONY: Mr. Chair, a motion is in 13 order to come back from closed session to public 14 meeting. CHAIRMAN WHITE: Board, what is your pleasure? 15 COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Sir, I move to move 16 17 back into open session from closed session. 18 COMMISSIONER STEWART: Support. 19 CHAIRMAN WHITE: Properly moved and supported. 20 Any discussion? Seeing none, all those in favor? 21 COMMISSIONERS: Aye. 22 CHAIRMAN WHITE: Opposed? Thank you very 23 much. Mr. Secretary, as it relates to the suspension



without pay of Sergeant Tiffany Jordan, S-604.

SECRETARY ANTHONY: That's correct, sir. And

24

1	you have considered in closed session and unless you
2	contravene or a member contravenes the suspension
3	without pay, the recommendation of the Chief will stand.
4	COMMISSIONER STEWART: Contravened.
5	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Are there any other
6	contraventions? I believe with one contravention, the
7	suspension without pay will fail. Mr. Secretary, as
8	relates to the personnel matter of Lieutenant Paul
9	Fillmore?
10	SECRETARY ANTHONY: I think the attorney to
11	the Board, Celia Banks Washington, has a recommendation.
12	ATTORNEY WASHINGTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Before
13	you in closed session this afternoon was the appeal of
14	disqualified applicant acting arson Lieutenant Paul
15	Fillmore. Obviously because it was in closed session,
16	we won't go into the details. However, based on the
17	facts as presented, there has been no showing that the
18	Department abused its discretion in disqualifying
19	Mr. Fillmore. Rather the decision reached by the
20	Department was based on the candidate's failure to meet
21	the Department's and MCOLES' standards with regards to
22	good moral character. And the recommendation would be
23	to deny the appeal.
24	CHAIRMAN WHITE: Board, before us is the
25	recommendation of Counsel to deny the appeal of



Page 23 1 applicant Lieutenant Fillmore. Is there a motion? 2 COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Sir, I move that we 3 support or adopt Counsel's recommendation. 4 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Support. 5 CHAIRMAN WHITE: It's been properly moved and supported. Any discussion? Seeing none, all those in 6 7 favor? 8 COMMISSIONERS: Aye. 9 CHAIRMAN WHITE: Opposed? Thank you very 10 much. Before we move on to the grant request, we are 11 going to table the police payroll presentation. We will 12 come back for that presentation. Before we go into oral 13 communications, however, there is a grant request. 14 Mr. Secretary, this grant request, could that be dealt with next week? 15 SECRETARY ANTHONY: Yes, it could. 16 CHAIRMAN WHITE: We will ask that we table 17 18 this grant request until the following week as well. 19 And at this time -- so, at this time I do apologize. 20 This is the point where I need to exit. But 21 Commissioner Stewart will carry us through. Vice Chair 22 Stewart will carry us through the end of the meeting, our announcements and communications from the audience. 23 24 (Exit Chairman White)



COMMISSIONER STEWART: Commissioner Stewart, I

	3/22/2012
	Page 24
1	will be continuing on for a couple of minutes here
2	because I got to go too. Announcements, the next
3	meeting is next Thursday, March 29th, 3:00 right here at
4	the police headquarters. We'll move on to oral
5	communications, keep it at what, two minutes?
6	Two-minutes please. Anyone? Anyone?
7	MS. HERNANDEZ: Hello there. Phyllis
8	Hernandez, Casino Towing. Actually I have a question
9	today instead of a comment. I'm wondering if the Board
10	was aware of the City Council or in City Council to
11	extend the lease on the evidence garage for Fiore for
12	two years and if they had to approve it before it went
13	before City Council? I'm just wondering how that
14	process went.
15	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Ms. Hernandez, as you
16	know, all contracts have to go through City Council.
17	And City Council, you know, does that.
18	MS. HERNANDEZ: Then since it's a police
19	department issue, wouldn't it have to come through you?
20	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: No, ma'am, it does
21	not.
22	MS. HERNANDEZ: No approval at all? Really?
23	Thanks a lot. Just curious.



COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: No problem.

COMMISSIONER STEWART: Any other

24

3/22/2012

	Page 25
1	communications? Anyone else? If not so, I move to
2	adjourn the meeting.
3	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: You can't move.
4	There's one announcement that the Chair asked me to give
5	prior to him leaving. And that is that Chief Godbee
6	will be presenting tonight at the NAACP meeting at I
7	guess located at their headquarters over there on Second
8	Street. So, those who wish to come out certainly can do
9	that. I believe that starts at 6:00 tonight I think.
10	COMMISSIONER STEWART: Again, we adjourn.
11	Thank you.
12	(Proceedings concluded at 4:50 p.m.)
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	



1	CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER
2	
3	
4	STATE OF MICHIGAN)
5) SS
6	COUNTY OF MACOMB)
7	
8	I HEREBY CERTIFY that I reported
9	stenographically the foregoing proceedings and testimony
10	under oath at the time and place hereinbefore set forth;
11	that thereafter the same was reduced to computer
12	transcription under my supervision; and that this is a
13	full, true, complete and correct transcription of said
14	proceedings.
15	
16	Real-egg.
17	hkrey O. Bour
18	Wendy A. Boer,
19	CSR 3505
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	



	appropriately 7:25
<u>A</u>	approval 4:19 5:3
abused 22:18	24:22
Act 18:18 19:11	approve 24:12
20:4,14	approximately 9:11
acting 22:14	21:8
action 12:8 14:25	April 6:2,7 7:1,4
16:11	argument 12:6
adding 6:9	15:23
address 11:21	arrival 10:2,20
adjacent 10:13	arson 22:14
adjourn 25:2,10	asked 25:4
adjust 5:20 7:14	asking 12:13,15
adjustments 7:3	assigned 9:9
administration	Assistance 4:5
10:4,14	Assistant 2:12 4:7
admit 10:10	8:1,4
admits 12:4	attempt 10:8
admitted 11:1	attempts 16:9
adopt 23:3	attire 9:10
adverse 11:15	attorney 3:21 9:19
advise 15:9	11:17,18 12:17
advises 15:4 afternoon 3:5 9:21	12:18 13:4,5
22:13	14:14,18 19:7
	22:10
agenda 4:19 7:25	audience 23:23
Agreement 13:8	automatically
Alan 3:25 allegation 9:23	14:24,25
	aware 24:10
Allen 4:10	
allow 15:14 18:22	AWOL 11:24
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8	
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12 21:25 22:10 23:16	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8 based 16:11 22:16
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12 21:25 22:10 23:16 anybody 16:11	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8 based 16:11 22:16 22:20
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12 21:25 22:10 23:16	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8 based 16:11 22:16 22:20 basis 16:18
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12 21:25 22:10 23:16 anybody 16:11 apologize 7:11 23:19	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8 based 16:11 22:16 22:20 basis 16:18 Beaubien 1:17
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12 21:25 22:10 23:16 anybody 16:11 apologize 7:11	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8 based 16:11 22:16 22:20 basis 16:18 Beaubien 1:17 beg 7:15 8:1
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12 21:25 22:10 23:16 anybody 16:11 apologize 7:11 23:19 appeal 8:13 9:1,4	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8 based 16:11 22:16 22:20 basis 16:18 Beaubien 1:17 beg 7:15 8:1 behalf 5:24 9:18
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12 21:25 22:10 23:16 anybody 16:11 apologize 7:11 23:19 appeal 8:13 9:1,4 11:10 22:13,23	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8 based 16:11 22:16 22:20 basis 16:18 Beaubien 1:17 beg 7:15 8:1 behalf 5:24 9:18 9:19,22 11:19
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12 21:25 22:10 23:16 anybody 16:11 apologize 7:11 23:19 appeal 8:13 9:1,4 11:10 22:13,23 22:25 appear 5:15 APPEARANCES 2:1	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8 based 16:11 22:16 22:20 basis 16:18 Beaubien 1:17 beg 7:15 8:1 behalf 5:24 9:18 9:19,22 11:19 believe 14:6 22:6
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12 21:25 22:10 23:16 anybody 16:11 apologize 7:11 23:19 appeal 8:13 9:1,4 11:10 22:13,23 22:25 appear 5:15 APPEARANCES 2:1 applicant 8:14	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8 based 16:11 22:16 22:20 basis 16:18 Beaubien 1:17 beg 7:15 8:1 behalf 5:24 9:18 9:19,22 11:19 believe 14:6 22:6 25:9
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12 21:25 22:10 23:16 anybody 16:11 apologize 7:11 23:19 appeal 8:13 9:1,4 11:10 22:13,23 22:25 appear 5:15 APPEARANCES 2:1 applicant 8:14 18:13 19:18 20:1	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8 based 16:11 22:16 22:20 basis 16:18 Beaubien 1:17 beg 7:15 8:1 behalf 5:24 9:18 9:19,22 11:19 believe 14:6 22:6 25:9 benefits 11:10
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12 21:25 22:10 23:16 anybody 16:11 apologize 7:11 23:19 appeal 8:13 9:1,4 11:10 22:13,23 22:25 appear 5:15 APPEARANCES 2:1 applicant 8:14	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8 based 16:11 22:16 22:20 basis 16:18 Beaubien 1:17 beg 7:15 8:1 behalf 5:24 9:18 9:19,22 11:19 believe 14:6 22:6 25:9 benefits 11:10 binding 14:4
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12 21:25 22:10 23:16 anybody 16:11 apologize 7:11 23:19 appeal 8:13 9:1,4 11:10 22:13,23 22:25 appear 5:15 APPEARANCES 2:1 applicant 8:14 18:13 19:18 20:1 20:9,22 22:14 23:1	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8 based 16:11 22:16 22:20 basis 16:18 Beaubien 1:17 beg 7:15 8:1 behalf 5:24 9:18 9:19,22 11:19 believe 14:6 22:6 25:9 benefits 11:10 binding 14:4 bless 4:16
allow 15:14 18:22 allows 13:8 AME 4:10 Amen 4:17 announcement 25:4 announcements 23:23 24:2 answered 13:16 Anthony 2:14 3:17 3:17,19,20 8:7,8 8:18 17:18 18:6 18:11,17 19:19 19:22,25 21:12 21:25 22:10 23:16 anybody 16:11 apologize 7:11 23:19 appeal 8:13 9:1,4 11:10 22:13,23 22:25 appear 5:15 APPEARANCES 2:1 applicant 8:14 18:13 19:18 20:1 20:9,22 22:14	AWOL 11:24 Aye 5:1,10 7:8 17:11 21:4,21 23:8 a.m 9:11 B back 9:14 11:25 14:25 21:11,13 21:17 23:12 Badge 8:12 9:5,9 19:6 20:21 Banks 3:21 22:11 bargained 14:12 Bargaining 13:8 based 16:11 22:16 22:20 basis 16:18 Beaubien 1:17 beg 7:15 8:1 behalf 5:24 9:18 9:19,22 11:19 believe 14:6 22:6 25:9 benefits 11:10 binding 14:4

```
approval 4:19 5:3
 24:22
approve 24:12
approximately 9:11
 21:8
April 6:2,7 7:1,4
argument 12:6
 15:23
arrival 10:2,20
arson 22:14
asked 25:4
asking 12:13,15
assigned 9:9
Assistance 4:5
Assistant 2:12 4:7
 8:1,4
attempt 10:8
attempts 16:9
attire 9:10
attorney 3:21 9:19
 11:17,18 12:17
 12:18 13:4,5
 14:14,18 19:7
 22:10
audience 23:23
automatically
 14:24,25
aware 24:10
AWOL 11:24
Aye 5:1,10 7:8
 17:11 21:4,21
 23:8
```

R

В
back 9:14 11:25
14:25 21:11,13
21:17 23:12
Badge 8:12 9:5,9
19:6 20:21
Banks 3:21 22:11
bargained 14:12
Bargaining 13:8
based 16:11 22:16
22:20
basis 16:18
Beaubien $1:17$
beg 7:15 8:1
behalf 5:24 9:18
9:19,22 11:19
believe 14:6 22:6
25 : 9
benefits 11:10
binding $14:4$
bless 4:16

3:12,15,16,22 5:24 8:8 9:13,25 10:2 11:8,13 12:11,11,14,15 13:5,17,20,22,23 13:24 14:5,7,19 15:2,3,13,21,23 16:11,19 19:2 20:9,11 21:7,15 22:11,24 24:9 board's 12:2,16 17:1,5,16 body 5:17 18:17,20 18:23,24 19:12 20:3,5,15 Boer 1:21 4:1 26:18 book 10:3 bound 14:7 bow 4:11
<pre>BPC 8:13 briefly 11:22 14:3 15:15 brighter 4:16 brought 19:13 Brown 3:24 17:23 18:8 buffer 6:10 Burchman 18:12</pre>

С

```
call 10:8 11:25
 18:23 21:10
called 19:10 20:13
calls 11:4
canceled 9:13 10:3
candidate's 22:20
card 10:21
carry 23:21,22
case 8:13 14:10
 15:2 16:13
Casino 24:8
caution 6:21
Celia 3:21 5:23
 22:11
Central 4:10
certainly 4:4 6:10
 25:8
CERTIFICATE 26:1
CERTIFY 26:8
chair 3:12,19 5:23
 6:2 8:7 9:3
 13:15 15:13
 17:18 21:12
 22:12 23:21 25:4
Chairman 2:4 3:5,9
 4:3,8,18,23 5:2
 5:7,11 6:3,23
```

7:6,9 8:5,17,25 11:17 12:17,23 13:3 14:2,14,18 15:4,11 16:21 17:8,12,15 18:3 18:9,16 19:17,20 20:18 21:2,5,10 21:15,19,22 22:5 22:24 23:5,9,17 23:24 Chairperson's 5:12 **chances** 12:10 **change** 6:25 Chaplain 4:9,11character 22:22 **charge** 12:10 16:16 16:23 **charged** 9:6 14:23 15:17 charges 19:13 Charter 6:19 chatting 10:13**Chester** 2:12 4:5 Chief 2:12 3:24 4:5,5,7 8:1,4 17:24 22:3 25:5 **Chief's** 12:15 Church 4:10circumstances 11:14 City 11:20 24:10 24:10,13,16,17 City's 11:23 civilian 9:10 15:20 16:3,3 **clarify** 17:19 **close** 19:15, 21, 23 closed 7:18,19,20 8:9,16,19,21,22 8:23,25 17:20 18:15,23,25 19:2 19:8,10,12,16 20:2,11,13,15,20 20:24 21:8,13,17 22:1,13,15 clothing 15:2016:4 code 10:18,19 11:3 colleague 3:11 10:13 Collective 13:8 **come** 4:13 5:22 21:13 23:12 24:19 25:8 command 9:12,14,17 10:22 16:7,10 commander 15:8 commander's 12:8

14:25 15:1 command's 10:9
Commencing 1:19
<pre>comment 7:19,20 8:1 24:9</pre>
Commissioner 2:6,8
2:10 3:8,11,13
3:14 4:21,22 5:5 5:6 6:4,5,12,17
6:20 7:2,5 13:1
5:6 6:4,5,12,17 6:20 7:2,5 13:1 13:2,3,4,14,25 14:15,16 17:4,7
17:21 , 25 18:3
20:23 21:1,16,18
22:4 23:2,4,21 23:25,25 24:15
24:20,24,25 25:3
25:10 commissioners1:1
3:7,10,13,16 5:1 5:10,19 6:23 7:8
11:21 12:25 13:9
16:22 17:11 20:19 21:4,7,21
20:19 21:4,7,21 23:8
committee 7:17
communications 23:13,23 24:5
25:13,23 21.3
compelled 14:5
<pre>complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2</pre>
<pre>complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11</pre>
<pre>complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12</pre>
<pre>complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25</pre>
<pre>complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12</pre>
<pre>complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12 20:15 considered 22:1</pre>
<pre>complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12 20:15 considered 22:1 contact 11:15 16:9</pre>
complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12 20:15 considered 22:1 contact 11:15 16:9 contesting 19:9 continuing 24:1
complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12 20:15 considered 22:1 contact 11:15 16:9 contesting 19:9 continuing 24:1 contract 14:13
complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12 20:15 considered 22:1 contact 11:15 16:9 contesting 19:9 continuing 24:1 contract 14:13 contracts 24:16 contradict 16:8
complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12 20:15 considered 22:1 contact 11:15 16:9 contesting 19:9 continuing 24:1 contract 14:13 contracts 24:16 contradict 16:8 contravene 22:2
complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12 20:15 considered 22:1 contact 11:15 16:9 contesting 19:9 continuing 24:1 contract 14:13 contracts 24:16 contradict 16:8
complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12 20:15 considered 22:1 contact 11:15 16:9 contesting 19:9 continuing 24:1 contract 14:13 contracts 24:16 contradict 16:8 contravened 17:25 22:4 contravenes 22:2
complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12 20:15 considered 22:1 contact 11:15 16:9 contesting 19:9 continuing 24:1 contract 14:13 contracts 24:16 contradict 16:8 contravened 17:25 22:4 contravenes 22:2 contravention 18:4
complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12 20:15 considered 22:1 contact 11:15 16:9 contesting 19:9 continuing 24:1 contract 14:13 contracts 24:16 contradict 16:8 contravened 17:25 22:4 contravenes 22:2 contravention 18:4 18:7,10,11 22:6 contraventions
complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12 20:15 considered 22:1 contact 11:15 16:9 contesting 19:9 continuing 24:1 contract 14:13 contracts 24:16 contradict 16:8 contravened 17:25 22:4 contravened 17:25 22:4 contravention 18:4 18:7,10,11 22:6 contraventions 22:6
complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12 20:15 considered 22:1 contact 11:15 16:9 contesting 19:9 continuing 24:1 contract 14:13 contracts 24:16 contradict 16:8 contravened 22:2 contravened 17:25 22:4 contravenes 22:2 contravention 18:4 18:7,10,11 22:6 contraventions 22:6 control 9:10 10:24 convening 18:19
complete 6:1 26:13 completes 4:2 computer 26:11 concluded 25:12 concur 11:12 conducted 18:25 consider 19:12 20:15 considered 22:1 contact 11:15 16:9 contesting 19:9 continuing 24:1 contract 14:13 contracts 24:16 contradict 16:8 contravened 17:25 22:4 contravened 17:25 22:4 contravention 18:4 18:7,10,11 22:6 contraventions 22:6 control 9:10 10:24

correct 6:6 11:22

13:19 18:12 21:25 26:13 Council 24:10,10 24:13,16,17 counsel 5:22 6:24 9:18 12:4 15:11 16:21,23 17:13 22:25
Counselor 6:3
Counsel's 23:3
count 6:7 9:7
COUNTY 26:6
couple 10:8 17:20
24:1
course 10:1
Court 4:1
CSR 1:21 26:19
curious 24:23
currently 9:9
D
Dalph 3:22

Dalph 3:22 Darren 4:9 **date** 5:17,20,25 6:25,25 10:1 15:19 **dated** 3:7 4:19 **day** 11:14 16:19 days 6:1,8,12,13 6:18 11:9 12:3,9 12:12,12 13:18 16:2,19 **deal** 9:1 18:14 20:20 dealt 23:14 **Dear** 4:12 **Deborah** 8:13 9:5,6 **decide** 14:8 **decision** 12:2,16 18:21 20:7 22:19 decisions 19:1,3 **defines** 18:19 20:4 deliberating 18:21 20:6 deliberations

18:25 deny 22:23,25

denying 12:4

department 4:16 8:3 9:15,18 11:20 14:6 15:8 15:24 22:18,20 24:19 Department's 22:21

details 22:16 determine 14:10**Detroit** 1:1,18 3:1

4:16 9:15 11:20 Directive 9:16 director 3:22 disagree 15:25 disciplinary 8:12 9:1,4 10:4,14 11:16 12:7 14:4 14:7 15:14 16:11 discipline 14:23 16:13,14,15,17 16:25 disclosure 20:16 discovered 10:21 discretion 22:18 discuss 20:11,24 discussion 4:24 5:8 7:7 17:9 20:16 21:3,20 23:6 $extbf{dismiss} 14:10$ disqualified 22:14 disqualifying 22:18 **Donald** 9:22 Donnell 2:4 3:8 **door** 8:9 17:20 **drive** 10:19 **duty** 9:8, 10, 12, 24 9:25 16:6

Е

earliest 5:17

early 7:11,14

effect 13:6,7

effectively 11:24

eat 10:17

13:9 efforts 4:16 egregious 14:24 **either** 10:18 **elect** 12:10 15:1,2 **elected** 13:21,23 13:23 **employee** 19:14 **empty** 10:17 enhance 4:15entered 21:7 **entire** 15:14 err 6:20 **error** 5:16 15:18 15:24,25 16:1,3 evidence 9:10 10:24 24:11 exactly 10:5 executive 2:14 3:16 8:6

exempt 20:16

exit 23:20,24 explain 10:1214:19 explained 10:15 14:20 **extend** 24:11

F

factored 16:2 **factors** 16:12 facts 11:22 22:17 fail 22:7 failing 9:12 16:6 **failure** 22:20 **father** 4:13 **favor** 4:25 5:9 7:7 17:10 21:3,20 23:7 February 9:6 **federal** 20:17 **file** 15:14 **filed** 11:10 **filling** 10:20 Fillmore 8:14 20:1 20:12,22 22:9,15 22:19 23:1 find 11:8 14:8 findings 16:1917:1 Fiore 24:11 Firefighter 20:1 20:22 **first** 4:13 10:18 10:18 11:15 12:12 15:16 17:22,22 **five** 12:12 13:18 **following** 7:20 9:7 23:18 foregoing 26:9 foremost 4:13 forth 26:10 forum 7:24 forward 5:22 found 12:3,4 four 6:14,15,17,19 **fourth** 7:13 Fred 19:7 full 26:13

G

garage 24:11 gas 10:18 **gasoline** 10:20,22 general 10:9 Generally 14:22 **George** 2:14 3:17 3:20 8:8

give 11:22 15:15 25:4 **go** 8:16,18,23 13:5 13:9,23,24 20:11 22:16 23:12 24:2 24:16 **Godbee** 25:5 goes 14:25 going 5:21 23:11 good 3:5 4:7 9:21 22:22 gracious 4:12 grant 23:10,13,14 23:18 granted 11:6 grueling 7:21,22 **quess** 25:7 **guilty** 11:9 12:3,5 14:9

Н

Hanson 4:1happened 11:23harmless 15:25headquarters 24:4 25:7 heads 4:11hear 12:24 19:13 hearing 6:1,24,25 7:3 12:21 15:1 heavenly 4:13 held 7:17 **Hello** 24:7 hereinbefore 26:10 Hernandez 24:7,8 24:15,18,22 history 16:13,17 16:24 hold 6:24 7:1,3,20 holy 4:17 hope 13:10 hours 9:14 10:23 11:24

I
incident 9:23
15:19
include 19:18
included 16:12
including 10:8
indicated 8:10,15
8:15
indulgence 7:16
8:2
information 5:18
informed 8:21 10:2
introduce 3:18

introductions 4:2 Investigator 3:24 investigator's 11:11 invitees 18:24 invocation 4:9 issue 6:15 15:16 16:1,4,5,9 24:19 issues 7:17

J
Jeremy 18:12
Jerome 2:6 3:13
Jessica 2:8 3:14
Jesus 4:17
joined 3:10
Jones 9:19 11:18
11:19,19 12:17
13:4,5,7,20
14:18,22 15:6
Jordan 8:12 19:6,8
20:21 21:24
jurisdiction 13:12
justified 12:7

K

keep 6:11 24:5 kind 4:12 knew 11:25 12:1 know 12:7 14:3 15:6 24:16,17 knowledge 12:20

lack 16:17,24 language 20:2 Leach 3:23 lease 24:11 leave 7:11,13 10:10 16:10 leaves 16:5

light 16:15
limited 18:23
located 25:7
Logan 2:12 4:5,7
8:4
long 11:7

lose 11:9 lot 24:23 lowest 13:18 LSA 19:7

М machines 10:11**MACOMB** 26:6 mails 10:11majority 17:13 19:14 manager 3:25 manual 9:16 15:7,8 March 1:20 3:2,7 4:20 5:3,15,16 5:25 6:6,7 19:4 20:10 24:3 material 20:16 matrix 12:8 13:6,7 14:4,7,11,21 16:14 matter 9:4 10:1 22:8 matters 8:20,24 17:19 20:20,24 ma'am 24:20 MCL 18:22 20:7,13 MCOLES 22:21 mean 13:24 meet 19:12 20:15 22:20 meeting 1:6 3:74:15 18:19 19:1 20:4,9 21:10,14 23:22 24:3 25:2 25:6 meetings 18:18,18 19:11 20:3,4,14 member 22:2 members 7:12 mentioned 20:25 message 10:11,11 messages 16:10 mete 14:10 meted 11:13 Michigan 1:18 3:1 26:4 mid 7:15 minimum 12:12,13 13:16 minutes 5:3 24:1,5 Miscellaneous 9:16 **modify** 13:9 moral 22:22 motion 4:19 7:1

17:2,3 19:16

move 5:21 7:2,10

20:22 21:12 23:1

7:18 17:4 20:19

20:23,23 21:16

21:16 23:2,10

moved 4:21,23 5:5

24:4 25:1,3

5:7 6:2 7:6 17:8 21:2,19 23:5

NAACP 25:6
name 3:8 4:17,17
necessarily 15:25
necessary 18:14
need 5:20 7:13,17
7:18 17:21 19:18
23:20
needed 11:5
neglect 9:8,12,24
neglected 16:6
note 4:4
notify 9:12 16:6
number 7:16 10:9
16:2

0 oath 26:10 objection 20:10 Obviously 22:15 occurred 9:24 **offense** 12:13 **offered** 15:20 16:8 **office** 3:23,25 4:5 10:13 officer 9:5,6,8,22 9:24 10:7,25 11:1 12:18 14:22 16:17,24 17:16 17:23 18:8 officers 12:10 14:20 officer's 16:12offices 11:2 **Okay** 6:9 13:25 **old** 17:19 **OMA** 18:18,19,22 20:4 one-day 17:2open 18:18 19:1,11 20:4,14 21:17 **Opposed** 5:2,11 7:9 17:12,12 21:5,22 23:9 **options** 14:20 oral 23:12 24:4 order 4:20 5:4,25 19:16 21:11,13 original 6:25

PAGE 1:15 pardon 7:15 part 10:7 14:12 19:11 20:14 particular 11:5 16:9 20:8 particularly 20:8 pass 17:17 **patrol** 10:25 Paul 8:14 20:1,12 20:22 22:8,14 **pay** 8:11 11:9 17:24 18:1,4,8 19:5,9 21:24 22:3,7 payroll 8:3 23:11 **penalty** 11:13,14 12:6,12 13:17 14:10 **Penson** 4:9,11 **people** 13:21 period 6:13 personnel 3:23 7:17 20:20,24 22:8 pertains 17:23 **peruse** 12:21 petition 11:10 petitioner 9:5,19 **phase** 15:5 **phone** 10:6,9 11:4 Phyllis 24:7 **place** 26:10 **please** 3:18 14:2 18:16 24:6 **pleasure** 3:9 8:23 21:15 **pled** 15:17 **point** 5:13 8:24 23:20 **police** 1:1 2:12 3:6,10,12,15,22 9:4,5,8,13,15,22 11:20 14:22 23:11 24:4,18 policy 18:22 20:7 position 11:23 15:24 **power** 14:9 **prayer** 4:12 preliminary 8:19 8:24 presence 4:4 present 3:20 12:19 12:22 15:7 18:20 20:5 presentation 8:3 23:11,12 presented 19:5 22:17 presenting 25:6 primary 16:5

print 5:25 prior 7:19,25 8:2 9:2 16:17,24 25:5 **problem** 24:24 proceedings 4:1 25:12 26:9,14 process 5:21 7:22 11:16 14:19 15:5 24:14 produced 5:14 progressive 16:14 **properly** 4:23 5:7 7:6 17:8 21:2,19 23:5 proposed 5:13 **public** 6:1,24,25 7:3,19,20 8:1 18:17,19,21,23 18:24 19:2,12 20:3,5,7,15 21:13 publish 5:18 **published** 5:15,16 6:5 purpose 18:20 19:8 19:15 20:6 purposes 18:24 pursuant 19:10 20:13 p.m1:19 3:3 21:8 21:9 25:12 Q

<u>Q</u> question 6:4 13:13

13:15 24:8
questions 12:25
14:17
Quinn 3:25
quorum 18:20 19:14
20:5

<u>R</u> reach 10:9 11:25

reached 22:19
really 14:24 24:22
reasonableness
 16:15
receive 11:4 12:14
 13:17
recitation 11:22
recommendation
 5:22 6:24 8:11

5:22 6:24 8:11 11:11 12:16,24 13:6 14:11 15:16 16:18,22,25 17:5 17:16,24 18:1,1 19:5,9 20:19

22:3,11,22,25 23:3 recommendations 17:21 reconvene 21:6 record 3:17,20 8:8 9:22 12:18,23 17:21 19:3,19,21 19:24 20:25 recording 3:25 records 10:6 **reduced** 11:13 16:19 17:1 26:11 reduction 15:16 reference 5:13 reflect 12:24 regards 19:25 22:21 **regular** 1:6 7:12 rejected 8:14 18:13 20:12,21 relates 7:3 16:22 16:23 17:15 21:23 22:8 remain 5:20 **remember** 10:17 rendering 18:21 20:6 **rep** 15:7,9 **report** 5:12 7:10 8:6 11:11 reported 26:8 **REPORTER** 26:1 Reporting 4:2 representative 19:7 represented 11:15 representing 3:15 4:4 reprimand 12:9 13:10 request 23:10,13 23:14,18 requested 11:6 19:8 requests 8:9 required 19:15 responded 13:12 responsibilities 7:14 returned 10:22 returning 9:14 reviewed 11:12 reviewing 15:13 16:7 revisions 5:13 right 3:11,13 24:3

room 1:17 12:21
routine 10:25
rule 9:7
rules 5:14,20 6:6
7:4
run 6:14 7:25

S

saw 10:16 saying 11:4**says** 6:19 scheduled 9:13 10:1 20:9,11 **second** 4:22 5:6 12:21 25:7 secretary 2:14 3:16,19 4:3 8:7 8:8,18 17:17,18 18:6,11,17 19:17 19:19,22,25 20:18 21:11,12 21:23,25 22:7,10 23:14,16 secretary's 7:10 8:6 **section** 10:4,14,16 10:24 11:2 see 12:22,24 Seeing 4:24 5:8 7:7 17:9 18:4 21:3,20 23:6 **September** 9:11,25 **Sergeant** 3:25 8:11 19:6,7 20:21 21:24 Series 9:16 Service 4:2 serving 3:9 **session** 7:18,19,20 8:16,19,21,23 9:1 18:15,23,25 19:2,10,12,15,16 20:3,11,13,15,20 20:24 21:8,13,17 21:17 22:1,13,15 **sessions** 8:10,22 17:20 19:8 **set** 26:10 **short** 11:7 shortly 21:6 showed 10:7showing 22:17 **shows** 10:4**side** 6:20 **signed** 10:5,5,23 **sign-in** 10:3 **simple** 19:14 **simply** 14:11

Robert 3:24

sir 4:6,7,18 7:2 8:4,5,17 15:12 17:4,14 18:15 20:23 21:16,25 23:2 **Sorry** 13:14 **sort** 11:1 specification 9:8 15:17,18 16:16 16:23 **spent** 10:12 **SS** 26:5 **staff** 3:15,18 5:17 **stand** 18:2,5 22:3 standard 16:15 standards 22:21 **starts** 25:9 **state** 20:16 26:4 **stated** 18:24 **states** 19:11 20:14 **station** 10:20 **statute** 20:17 **stay** 7:21 **stemmed** 9:23 stenographically 26:9 **Stewart** 2:10 3:12 4:22 5:5 7:5 13:1,2 17:25 21:1,18 22:4 23:21,22,25,25 24:25 25:10 **Stinson** 8:13,21 9:5,6,9,23,24 10:7 12:18 16:24 17:16 Stinson's 16:17 **Stolberg** 9:20,21 9:22 11:17 12:18 12:20 14:1,3,14 **Street** 1:17 25:8 **subject** 18:18 20:3 submitted 10:6 11:12 subsequently 10:12 10:22 11:10 supervision 26:12 supervisors 10:8 **support** 7:5 15:15 17:3,7 21:1,18 23:3,4 **supported** 4:24 5:8 7:6 15:21 17:9 21:2,19 23:6 supposed 5:14**sure** 5:25 suspended 11:9

18:8

suspension 8:11 16:20 17:2,2,6 17:17,23 18:1,4 19:5,9,13 21:23 22:2,7 swipe 10:21 **S-604**8:12 19:6 20:21 21:24 Т **table** 23:11,17 take 11:3 12:10 **Taken** 1:17**Taylor** 2:8 3:14 14:15,16 17:7 23:4 telling 13:21,22 terms 14:19 testimony 15:20 16:8 26:9 thank 3:19 4:3,6 4:14,18 5:2,11 5:23 6:3 7:9 8:5 8:7 11:17,20 12:17 14:14 15:12 16:21 17:15,18 19:17 20:18 21:5,22 22:12 23:9 25:11 **Thanks** 24:23 **think** 6:10 13:15 14:6 15:8 22:10 25:9 three 8:10 10:23 11:9,24 12:3,9 12:12 13:18 16:19 19:14

three-day 17:1,5

3:7 4:20 5:3

Thursdays 7:13

20:21 21:24

time 4:8,19 5:3

today 3:10 7:12

Toney 2:10 3:11

Tonev's 17:21

tonight 25:6,9

17:17

Tim 3:23

26:10

24:9

17:25

Thursday 1:20 3:2 19:4 20:9 24:3 waived 13:22,24 Tiffany 8:12 19:6 15:3 Walker 19:7 6:13 8:6 10:5,12 10:24 11:6 15:19 15:22 23:19,19 8:1 9:3,18 11:21

towing 5:14 7:4 24:8 transcription 26:12,13 transcripts 15:13 16:7 trial 9:13,25 10:2 11:8,13 12:2,11 12:11,14,15,16 13:5,17,20,22,23 13:24 14:5,7 15:2,3,13,21,23 16:11,18 17:1,5 17:16 **true** 26:13 two 8:22 24:5,12 Two-minutes 24:6 Typically 7:19

unable 10:9 unfortunately 16:10 uniform 15:22 16:3 16:4 union 15:6,9 unrelated 10:1uphold 12:2,15 17:5 **usually** 11:2,3 utilized 4:15

v **vehicle** 10:16 vice 3:12 23:21 violation 9:7,15 **voice** 10:11 vote 7:24 17:13,22 19:14

W waive 15:2,10

want 8:18 wanted 8:20

Warfield 2:6 3:14 4:21 5:6 6:3,4,5 6:12,17,20 7:2 13:3,4,14,25 17:4 20:23 21:16 23:2 24:15,20,24 25:3

Washington 3:21 5:23,24 6:9,14 6:19,22 9:3 15:12 17:14

19:21,23 22:11 22:12 Watson 3:22 way 7:15 10:19 11:3 week 17:19,20 18:7 18:12 23:15,18 weeks 6:14,16,17 6:19 welcome 3:6 Wendy 1:21 4:1 26:18 went 6:6 10:17,18 24:12,14 we'll 4:8 7:25 12:24 21:5 24:4 White 2:4 3:5,8 4:3,8,18,23 5:2 5:7,11 6:23 7:6 7:9 8:5,17,25 11:17 12:17,23 13:3 14:2,14,18 15:4,11 16:21 17:8,12,15 18:3 18:9,16 19:17,20 20:18 21:2,5,10 21:15,19,22 22:5 22:24 23:5,9,17 23:24 **William** 17:23 wish 25:8 wonderful 4:12 7:22 wondering 24:9,13word 4:12 words 14:11 work 11:3 working 10:24works 7:23 wouldn't 24:19

years 24:12

written 12:9 13:10

1 **1**1:15 9:7,8 16:16 16:16,23,23 **100** 9:16 **102.3-7.15** 9:16 11-002D 8:13 **1300** 1:17 **15** 5 : 4 **15.262 (b)** 18:22 20:7 **15.268 (a)** 19:10 **15.268 (h)** 20:13 **17th** 9:11,25



19th 5:15 6:7
2
20th 5:16,25 6:6,7
2010 9:11,25
2011 9:7
2012 1:20 3:2,8
4:20 5:4 7:1
19:4 20:10
22 1:20 3:2 4:20 22nd 3:7 19:4
20:10
24th 9:6
26 1:15
26th 6:2 7:1, 4
29th 24:3
3
3:00 24:3
3:20 1:19 3:3 3:45 21:8
30 6:1,18
31 6:8, 12, 13
328 1:17
3505 1:21 26:19
4
49:17
4:45 21:9 4:50 25:12
4:50 25:12
6
6:00 25 : 9
612 9:5,9
8
8:30 9:11