1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	DETROIT BOARD OF POLICE COMMISSIONERS
10	
11	REGULAR MEETING
12	
13	THURSDAY, JANUARY 19, 2012, 3:00 PM
14	
15	1300 BEAUBIEN, ROOM 328-A
16	
17	DETROIT, MICHIGAN
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	



```
1
    COMMISSIONERS:
 2
 3
          GEORGE ANTHONY, Secretary
          DONNELL R. WHITE, Chairperson
 4
 5
          JEROME L. WARFIELD, Commissioner
 6
          TONEY A. STEWART, Commissioner
          JESSICA TAYLOR, Commissioner
 7
 8
 9
10
11
     DETROIT POLICE DEPARTMENT COMMAND STAFF:
12
13
    CHIEF RALPH L. GODBEE, JR.
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```



Detroit, Michigan 1 2 Thursday, January 19, 2012 3 About 3:23 p.m. 4 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Let me say good 5 evening to everyone and welcome you to the Board of Police Commissioners meeting dated for 6 7 Thursday, January 19, 2012. My name is Commissioner Donnell White. 8 9 I have the pleasure of serving as Chairman for 10 the Board of Police Commissioners. 11 Today I'm joined with my colleagues, 12 Vice-Chairman to the Board of Police 13 Commissioners, Commissioner Toney Stewart to my left and to my right Commissioner Jessica Taylor 14 15 and representing our staff is Executive Secretary 16 to the Board Mr. George Anthony. Mr. Anthony, can you please introduce 17 18 our staff? 19 SECRETARY ANTHONY: Thank you, 20 Mr. Chair. For the record, George Anthony, 21 Secretary to the Board. Our staff members 22 include Ms. Dalph Watson who is our director of 23 Human Resources, Police Personnel; Ms. Celia 24 Banks Washington, the attorney to the Board; 25 Lt. Timothy Leach who's acting chief

> HANSON RENAISSANCE Ansonreporting.com

investigator, Office of the Chief Investigator; 1 2 Mr. Robert Brown, our office manager; Sgt. Allen 3 Quinn who's recording our proceedings and 4 Mr. Dale Rose from Hanson Court Reporting 5 Service. That completes the introduction. 6 7 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you, 8 Mr. Secretary. I certainly would like to note 9 the presence of Chief Ralph Godbee. Thank you 10 for being with us today, Chief. 11 CHIEF GODBEE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. 12 COMMISSIONER WHITE: At this time we 13 will ask if Chaplain Darren Pinson (sp) of the Allen Temple AME Church, Chaplain Pinson, if you 14 15 could lead us in our invocation. 16 (INVOCATION WAS GIVEN). 17 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you, sir. 18 At this time a motion for the approval of the 19 agenda dated for Thursday, January 19, 2012. 20 COMMISSIONER STEWART: So moved. 21 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Second. 22 COMMISSIONER WHITE: It's been properly 23 moved and supported and Commissioner Stewart, if 24 you would, I would ask that we approve the agenda 25 as an amendment to your motion with the deletion

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

1 of standing committee reports, the appeal of 2 Police Officer Deborah Stinson, BPC 11-002D, that 3 will be tabled for another day. 4 COMMISSIONER STEWART: So moved. 5 COMMISSIONER WHITE: It's been properly 6 moved and supported. Any other discussion? 7 Seeing none, all those in favor? 8 COMMISSIONERS: Aye. 9 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Opposed? Thank 10 you. At this time the Chair will entertain a 11 motion for the approval of the minutes dated for 12 Thursday, January 5, 2012. 13 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: So moved. 14 COMMISSIONER STEWART: Second. 15 COMMISSIONER WHITE: It's been properly moved and supported. Any discussion? Seeing 16 17 none, all those in favor? 18 COMMISSIONERS: Aye. COMMISSIONER WHITE: Under the 19 20 Chairman's report I would like to make note of 21 conversations that we as a body have been having 22 over the past 72 days. It deals directly with 23 the handling of complaints in the Office of the Chief Investigator. You should know we are 24 25 currently approved via the critical needs letter

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

Page 6

that was submitted to the City to fill vacant investigator positions that we have had open. This body has also begun the preliminary interview process for the position of the chief investigator.

several months ago. We are working expeditiously to fill all of those positions and interviews in each of those have already began to go forward.

7

8

9

10 Also I would like to make note and 11 congratulate to a degree the Chief and the entire 12 department who are moving expeditiously towards 13 compliance under the Federal Consent Decree and 14 also share with you some concerns that we have as 15 a Board which we take full responsibility for and that is the handling of the complaints as we move 16 17 forward under the Office of the Chief 18 Investigator.

We are putting some innovative ways, some strategies in place that will hold individuals accountable that will give them the tools both technical and personal support that is needed to make sure that we on our end maintain compliance as well with this Federal Consent Decree.

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

Page 7

1	So you'll hear more information as we
2	move forward as we look to restructure that
3	office to do things efficiently and in order and
4	to certainly give to each citizen who files a
5	complaint against the Detroit Police Department
6	the service that they have become accustomed to
7	and that is a first rate response and a first
8	rate investigation into the nature of their case.
9	So please stay with us as we go along
10	this journey to come from under this Federal
11	Consent Decree, but I do think we'll have more
12	greatness to share with you in the days and
13	months to come.
14	At this time, we'll move for our
15	Secretary's report.
16	SECRETARY ANTHONY: Thank you,
17	Mr. Chair. There are two things under the
18	Secretary's report. The first is the report of
19	citizens' complaint received December, 2011.
20	The monthly count of complaints
21	received for 2011 in December was 123 and
22	compared to the 2010 monthly for December was 115
23	which represents a 7 percent increase in 2011.
24	The year-to-date figures for 2011 are
25	1,584. For 2010 the year-to-date figures are

HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

	_
1	1,669, and so it represents a 5 percent decrease
2	for 2011.
3	At the end of December, 2011 the Office
4	of the Chief Investigator had open investigations
5	683, cases that were filed 1,584 and cases closed
6	1,508.
7	Of the 123 cases that were filed in
8	December of 2011 33 percent involved unknown
9	officers. The alleged leading known unit
10	involved in complaints filed in December, 2011
11	were Northeastern District 11 percent, Eastern
12	District 8 percent, 8 Precinct 7 percent.
13	Of the 123 cases filed in December,
14	2011, there were 189 allegations, the leading
15	areas of concern included procedure 30 percent,
16	demeanor 30 percent, service 21 percent and force
17	10 percent.
18	And that concludes the report on the
19	citizen complaints for December, 2011.
20	The second matter is that you have
21	the Board has received a request for a closed
22	door session on a suspension without pay
23	recommendation from Chief Godbee in the matter of
24	Sgt. Malkia Miller, Badge S-917.
25	That concludes the Secretary's report.



1 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you, 2 Mr. Secretary. We will table the closed session hearings until after we have concluded our oral 3 4 communications from the audience. 5 At this time we have a report from the office of the Chief, Chief Godbee. 6 7 CHIEF GODBEE: Thank you, Mr. Chair to the Board. We don't have a formal presentation 8 9 However, I would like to note for those today. 10 that may have seen on the news, there was an 11 incident where our officers were fired upon. 12 Thank God all officers are okay, there were no 13 injuries and, furthermore, the perpetrator was 14 apprehended, the weapon was recovered and the 15 person has been arraigned relative to the assault on our officers. 16 17 And if I'm not mistaken the bond was, I 18 think, \$900,000 cash bond, so we thank the Court 19 for its wisdom in setting such a high bond. 20 But all officers are okay and just as 21 usual, I would just like to commend the men and 22 women of our department for doing just a 23 tremendous job under sometimes very stressful and adverse circumstances, often times 24 25 underresourced. But within that they still find

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT DEPODENCES & VIDEO 313-567-8100

Page 10

1 a way to do an excellent job every day. 2 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you, Chief. Under New Business, we have a number of 3 4 resolutions that are before us and I'll ask if --5 SECRETARY ANTHONY: Mr. Chair, we still 6 have the standing committee reports to report 7 out, just the make mention of those cases that are the disciplinary appeal just to put it on the 8 9 record. 10 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Yes, sir. Please 11 do. 12 SECRETARY ANTHONY: Under standing 13 committee report, Mr. Chair, there is a request 14 for closed door session in a personnel matter of 15 Mr. Mark Harris and there is also a disciplinary appeal which I believe will be on the record. 16 17 The case of Police Officer Tymisha Pheasant, that is BPC Number 11-003D. 18 19 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you, 20 Mr. Secretary and since we're on the record in 21 the matter of the disciplinary appeals, should we 22 deal with that at this time? 23 SECRETARY ANTHONY: We can. 24 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Counsel? 25 MS. WASHINGTON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

HANSON RENAISSANCE hansonreporting.com

Celia Washington, attorney for the Board. 1 This 2 afternoon before the Board is a trial board 3 appeal. You'll hear oral argument in the matter 4 of Police Officer Tymisha Pheasant because there 5 are a couple of cases I need to make sure I'm 6 clear on which case you're going to be hearing 7 today. This is DAU 10-0727. Today on behalf 8 9 of the department is counsel Letitia Jones. On 10 behalf of Officer Pheasant is attorney Don 11 Stolberg. 12 Petitioner Police Officer Tymisha 13 Pheasant was charged on October 11, 2010 with the 14 following rule violation. 15 Count 1, failure to exercise care or practice economy in the use of department 16 equipment, material, forms and facilities. Just 17 18 very briefly if you'll let me put the 19 specifications on the record. 20 That she, Police Officer Tymisha 21 Pheasant, Badge 3774, currently assigned to the 22 Narcotics Enforcement Unit did on October 11, 23 2010 fail to exercise care or practice economy in the use of her department-issued equipment by 24 25 failing to properly secure her duty belt,

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COULT DECORPTED & MICRO 313-567-8100

	14
1	handcuffs, two magazines, chemical spray, holster
2	and PREP radio which resulted in them being lost
3	or stolen, this being in violation of DPD Manual
4	Series 100 Directive 102.3-7.7 City Property
5	Command 1.
6	Counsel?
7	MR. STOLBERG: Good afternoon, for the
8	record Donald Howard Stolberg on behalf of the
9	Detroit Police Officers Association and Police
10	Officer Tymisha Pheasant.
11	As has been stated, Officer Pheasant
12	was charged in connection with an on-duty
13	allegation that she failed to properly secure her
14	department equipment which later turned out to be
15	missing or stolen.
16	This included a duty belt, handcuffs,
17	two magazines, chemical spray, a holster, PREP
18	radio were stolen from an area at the Tactical
19	Mobile Unit where Officer Pheasant was assigned
20	to Crime Analysis. She worked in an office area
21	that was not open to the public.
22	She testified as did Police Officer
23	Jones in her behalf that it was common practice
24	for everyone who worked in that particular office
25	area to basically use their office as a storage

HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO A13-567-8100

Page 13

facility for their department equipment. 1 2 I believe the department is going to 3 contend that since she was assigned a locker that 4 she should have secured this property inside the 5 locker. We disagree with that based upon the past practice of officers similarly situated in 6 7 that office area, Number 1. Number 2, Officer Jones testified that 8 9 there was a history of even equipment being 10 stolen from locked lockers that were assigned to 11 particular officers. So she took the reasonable 12 care to secure her department equipment under the 13 circumstances. 14 We're asking that the trial board's 15 decision in connection with its finding of quilt be reversed, that she be found not guilty under 16 17 the circumstances, or in the alternative taking 18 into account the department's policy of 19 progressive and corrective discipline, we have to understand that at the time of this matter 20 21 Officer Pheasant had no prior disciplinary 22 history. She is an officer of 10 years in good 23 standing prior to this matter. 24 In addition to the two-day penalty 25 assessed against her by the trial board she was



Page 14

ordered to reimburse the department for the cost 1 2 of the lost equipment, which by the way is not really discipline. They could have ordered that 3 4 in any event, but if the corrective aspect of our 5 labor policy is to be respected, if you will, don't you think a simple reimbursement under the 6 7 circumstances would have sufficed to get the officer's attention? We're talking about several 8 hundred dollars. 9

So we ask, Number 1, that the decision 10 11 of the finding of guilty be reversed to not 12 guilty, or in the alternative that the keeping 13 into account the policy of progressive and corrective discipline since she had no prior 14 15 discipline that we should start at a written reprimand for something as relatively minor as 16 17 this.

18 There are numerous instances -- and it 19 happens because we're all human -- where officers 20 have even lost their firearms and they end up 21 getting a written reprimand and then reimbursing 22 the department for the cost of that weapon. 23 So in this case I think it is clear 24 that she's not guilty since she did reasonably

24 that she's not guilty since she did reasonable
25 secure the items which are located in a bag



1/19	/2012
------	-------

underneath her desk at the time they were stolen 1 2 because it wasn't lost, that's where it was. That was the evidence. 3 4 And, you know, it was obviously some kind of an inside job unfortunately because this 5 was from an area that was not open to the public. 6 7 So thank you for your consideration. 8 I'd be happy to answer any questions 9 that you may have. 10 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you. We'll 11 come back to the questions after we heard from 12 counsel. 13 MS. JONES: Commissioners, Latitia Jones on behalf of the City of Detroit Police 14 15 Department. Officer Pheasant was responsible for her equipment. No matter how it became lost or 16 17 stolen, she was assigned to it, she was 18 responsible for securing it. It wasn't secured, 19 it was somehow taken. Either she misplaced it or 20 it was taken. 21 She is then -- because of that there 22 was just cause to discipline her. Now, counsel 23 states that reimbursement is not discipline. I 24 agree with him, it is not discipline. 25 The two days that the board imposed is

hansonreporting.com

313-567-8100

HANSON

RENAISSANCE

1/	'19	/2	01	2
----	-----	----	----	---

Page 16

not unreasonable according to the disciplinary 1 2 When you come to a trial board the matrix. 3 minimum you can get is three days. 4 (COMMISSIONER WARFIELD ARRIVES). 5 MS. JONES: Now, counsel also states 6 that in the past there were -- there are people 7 who have lost their gun or people who have lost 8 maybe their handcuffs and they are only given a 9 written reprimand plus reimbursement. That is 10 true also, but that was one item. 11 In this case, the young lady lost her 12 duty belt, handcuffs, magazines, chemical spray, 13 holster, PREP radio holster, and has not 14 reimbursed the department for that. I would say 15 to you that we do have just cause to discipline based on the fact that the items are missing and 16 17 she was held responsible for them. 18 We did issue a penalty that was 19 consistent with the matrix. In actuality, it was 20 lower than what the matrix requires and I would 21 ask that you sustain the trial board findings and 22 concur with the decision that your counsel also 23 concurs with which is sustaining the trial 24 board's decision.

MR. STOLBERG: Just a brief response if



25

1 I may.

2	Thank you. First of all, I'd like to
3	address the disciplinary matrix. The department
4	would lead you to believe that that is
5	controlling. Obviously it is not controlling.
6	Counsel has conceded that it is not by the fact
7	that the trial board chose to ignore it and gave
8	her two days instead of what they think is a
9	mandatory three-day situation.
10	What they should have done is take into
11	account the fact that she had no prior discipline
12	and given her a written reprimand which would be
13	in comportment with numerous other cases
14	involving more serious losses, that being
15	firearms, that may end up on the street in the
16	wrong hands.
17	Secondly, true, there was more than one
18	item stolen in this case. However, we have to
19	remember that it was all in one bag, so it was
20	the bag was taken out and it happened to contain
21	several items so it was one transaction or
22	occurrence, it wasn't several things at different
23	times.
24	So thank you.

25 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Before we move to



1/1	9/2	012
-----	-----	-----

questions from commissioners, is Officer Pheasant 1 2 present today? 3 MR. STOLBERG: I do not see her present 4 in the hearing room. 5 COMMISSIONER WHITE: For the record let 6 it be known that she is not present. I will ask 7 if there are any questions of the commissioners. Commissioner Stewart? 8 9 COMMISSIONER STEWART: Yeah, I have 10 The responsibility of an officer was to one. 11 make sure the equipment was safe in the office, 12 you're saying by a lockup? 13 MR. STOLBERG: She was in an office area, she had her own office which she shared 14 15 with another police officer. There were other offices in that particular area, all of which was 16 17 enclosed outside public access so it was separate 18 from the public and it was the practice of 19 everyone in that particular area to secure their 20 department property in their office. 21 COMMISSIONER STEWART: So she was 22 supposed to secure hers, but -- I mean, she was 23 responsible? 24 MR. STOLBERG: Yeah, she did secure it 25 in comportment with what everyone else was doing,

> HANSON RENAISSANCE Ansonreporting.com 313-567-8100

1/	19	/2()12
----	----	-----	-----

	1
1	how they all secured their property in that
2	particular area.
3	COMMISSIONER STEWART: She was
4	responsible?
5	MR. STOLBERG: Well, she is
6	responsible, yeah.
7	COMMISSIONER STEWART: That's what I'm
8	getting to.
9	MR. STOLBERG: Right. There's a
10	every first-year law student learns this Latin
11	phrase, it's called "res ipsa loquitur" and it
12	means the thing speaks for itself.
13	And I don't think, that is they want to
14	say since the equipment is missing then it must
15	be that she did something wrong by the mere fact
16	that it's gone. But she didn't do anything
17	wrong. They still have to show that she did
18	something wrong.
19	COMMISSIONER STEWART: Well, okay, but
20	the one thing I know for a fact is a lot of stuff
21	is showing up on the streets and a lot of people
22	are getting is being sacrificed because of
23	this and I think it's got to be something done.
24	I'm responsible for some of the
25	equipment I have from the department too and I



Page 20

1 make sure I pay attention to that. 2 Some of these things get on the streets 3 and then we have accidents happen. I mean, it 4 could have been worse, so that's the question I 5 ask and to say somebody else did it in the office and stuff, point fingers, I think you got to go 6 7 right back. Now, one more question I had was what 8 9 was the procedure for if the equipment come up 10 missing, she paid for it and she gets penalized? 11 What is the proper procedure. 12 MR. STOLBERG: Well, the department can 13 order -- outside the disciplinary process can order a member to reimburse certain things 14 15 including missing equipment. The person could also be subject to discipline, but they have to 16 17 show some negligence on the officer's part. 18 Under the circumstances -- and I'm not 19 saying just -- you know, the childish excuse, 20 just because everybody else did it -- but the 21 fact remains that that was the practice including 22 the commander or the inspector that was assigned 23 in that particular area. Evidence was also 24 presented at the trial board that the inspector 25 was securing, so to speak, his equipment in his

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

Page 21

1 office as was everyone. 2 COMMISSIONER STEWART: Now, what is the 3 discipline for that? 4 MR. STOLBERG: Usually it results in a reprimand if they can show some violation, and by 5 6 the way, that makes an excellent point. The 7 rules do not define how exactly or specifically 8 property should be secured. 9 COMMISSIONER STEWART: But she was 10 responsible? 11 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Commissioner 12 Stewart, I think she had another response to your 13 earlier question. 14 MS. JONES: Just to enlighten you, 15 although counsel says that the room was locked, no one else's equipment -- it wasn't broken into. 16 17 No one else's equipment was taken. We don't know 18 specifically whether it was stolen or if she 19 misplaced it. And it really doesn't matter because the bottom line is she was assigned it, 20 21 she was responsible for it, it came up where she 22 didn't have it. 23 COMMISSIONER STEWART: Now, what is the 24 discipline part? I didn't understand, what is it 25 suspension or can you --



MS. JONES: Right now she has -- the 1 2 board decided she should get a two-day 3 suspension, plus reimburse the department for the 4 equipment. 5 COMMISSIONER STEWART: Is that some kind of maximum? 6 7 MS. JONES: No, the maximum could be dismissal, but --8 COMMISSIONER STEWART: That's what I'm 9 10 trying to find out. 11 MS. JONES: But the minimum, as he 12 said, would be a written reprimand. The minimum 13 discipline would be written reprimand, then there 14 is anywhere up to five days for first offense. 15 When it gets to the trial board level, generally the first offense, according to the matrix, is 16 17 three to five days. The board for whatever reason decided 18 that two days was sufficient. 19 20 COMMISSIONER STEWART: Okav. 21 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you, Commissioner Stewart. Commissioner Warfield? 22 23 COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: I'm good. 24 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Commissioner 25 Taylor?



1 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: I do not have any 2 questions. 3 COMMISSIONER WHITE: I do have a 4 question as it relates to the proper protocol as 5 it relates, is there anywhere in the officer's 6 manual that talks to the nature of securing their 7 equipment and what exactly that is? 8 MR. STOLBERG: Just broadly, but 9 nothing specific about how it's to be done. 10 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Do we have that 11 reading? 12 MR. STOLBERG: I think it's actually 13 right in the specification of the charge would 14 cite that particular manual provision. 15 MS. JONES: I do not have the manual with me, sir, but he is correct in that it is 16 17 fairly broad as to how they secure their 18 equipment, but they are responsible for their 19 equipment. 20 MR. STOLBERG: And I think 21 reimbursement might be appropriate under the 22 circumstances. Again, you know, in tough 23 economic times we're talking about hundreds of dollars to reimburse for this equipment and then 24 25 to give her a two-day penalty when she hadn't had

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

any prior discipline? 1 2 It should start at a written reprimand for relatively minor offenses which this would be 3 4 among them and, remember, there was no firearm lost or stolen in this case so we don't have to 5 worry about a firearm landing on the streets in 6 7 the wrong hands. MS. JONES: I would just add that I 8 9 would ask that you concur with your attorney. 10 She has reviewed it and she also feels that two 11 days was appropriate. Thank you. 12 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Counsel? 13 Thank you, Mr. Chair. MS. WASHINGTON: 14 If you will allow me just very briefly, you 15 should have before you the recommendation that I prepared. I'd just like to highlight a couple of 16 17 comments and then just offer my recommendation. 18 The trial board based its disciplinary decision on a number of factors, four of them 19 20 I've listed for you. 21 One, past disciplinary history, the 22 discipline matrix, progressive discipline 23 standard and reasonableness. 24 Prior to this incident Officer Pheasant 25 had -- at the time of the hearing I should say

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

she had no prior disciplinary history. The trial board's penalty was progressive inasmuch as it was a first offense and was within the guidelines.

According to the matrix as it pertains 5 to a matter before the trial board for first 6 7 offense the penalty ranges from three to five days. In this case the trial board only issued a 8 9 two-day suspension. Basically based upon my 10 review of the transcript of the hearing the trial board did offer careful deliberation and offered 11 12 or fashioned a punishment in this case because of 13 the gravity of the charges, because the equipment that was missing. 14

15 It's my recommendation that the trial 16 board's findings be upheld in their entirety, but 17 further recommended that Officer Pheasant be 18 ordered to reimburse the department for the 19 missing equipment.

20 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Counsel, for a 21 point of clarity, I'm uncertain as it relates to 22 the -- and I think Commissioner Stewart's 23 questions alluded to it earlier. As it relates 24 to the disciplinary progression, I heard the 25 minimum is a written reprimand, but I've also

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

1	heard a three to five day minimum at the trial
2	board.
3	What is the difference between those
4	two scenarios?
5	MS. WASHINGTON: I would let counsel
6	Jones speak or actually
7	MR. STOLBERG: Money. We talk about
8	loss of days, we're talking about loss of money.
9	MS. WASHINGTON: But if I'm
10	understanding the commissioner's question it's
11	more to what would warrant a reprimand as opposed
12	to a five-day.
13	MS. JONES: This particular officer
14	waived to a trial board. At a commander's
15	hearing, had she gone to a commander's hearing
16	the most she would have gotten was three days,
17	written reprimand to three days.
18	At the trial board level so there's
19	two tracks for discipline. There's the
20	commander's hearing and there's the trial board
21	level. At the commander's level per the
22	collective bargaining agreement they can only get
23	they can only get up to three days per charge.
24	There can only be two charges at a
25	commander's hearing. So the maximum they could

HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

1	ever get at a commander's hearing would be the
2	six days.

Whereas at a trial board that's where 3 4 evidence and testimony comes in, the minimum should be, according to the matrix, three days. 5 But for whatever reason, and I don't know how 6 7 they deliberated, the board elected to go under what the matrix said and gave her two days. 8 9 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Understandable. 10 So if you waive your right to the commander's 11 hearing you lose the low end which is written 12 reprimand to three days. If you go straight to 13 the trial board, you put yourself in a three to five-day range? 14 15 MS. JONES: You run that risk. COMMISSIONER WHITE: Understand. 16 17 MR. STOLBERG: I'm sorry, just real 18 briefly, that doesn't seem fair to me for an 19 officer to elect to go to a trial board and have 20 an adversarial hearing and to be subject to a 21 greater penalty than they would have if they had 22 elected to go to a non-adversarial proceeding. 23 So, you know, we all have due process rights in this country. They are protected by 24 25 contract in this case. By the fact that an





1/	19)/2	201	.2
----	----	-----	-----	----

Page 28

officer shouldn't be punished for electing to 1 2 have an adversarial hearing as opposed to a commander's action. 3 4 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you. 5 Commissioners, before us is the recommendation as it relates to Police Office Tymisha Pheasant as 6 7 it relates to the charge of failure to exercise 8 care or practice economy in the use of department 9 equipment, material, form and facilities. 10 Before us is a recommendation by our 11 counsel, Ms. Celia Banks Washington, attorney

12 Celia Banks Washington, for the reasons outlined13 within our report given to us.

14 It was recommended that the trial 15 board's findings be upheld in their entirety 16 which is a suspension of two days and the 17 reimbursement of the cost of the equipment 18 misplaced. It is further recommended that 19 Officer Pheasant be ordered to reimburse the 20 department for the missing equipment.

21 Unless it is contravened -- before us 22 is the proper information and the Chair will 23 entertain a motion to accept or deny the 24 recommendation of counsel Celia Banks Washington. 25 COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Sir, I move



1	that we accept the recommendation coming from
2	counsel Washington concerning this matter.
3	COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Second.
4	COMMISSIONER WHITE: It's been properly
5	moved and supported. Any discussion?
6	Under discussion, through the Chief,
7	Chief I do think this is a clarifying moment that
8	there may be a need to strengthen that language
9	as related to what exactly "secure" may mean to
10	remove any ambiguity in future dates.
11	I heard clearly a wide variety of
12	different measures that may be used in terms of
13	securing. I would hope that some aren't being
14	punished for a practice that others are
15	continuing to do on an ongoing basis.
16	I think that's a clarifying moment for
17	us to strengthen that policy as we move forward.
18	Any other discussions? Seeing none, all those in
19	favor?
20	COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
21	COMMISSIONER WHITE: Opposed? Thank
22	you. The personnel is in closed session?
23	SECRETARY ANTHONY: That's correct.
24	COMMISSIONER WHITE: Under New
25	Business, I'll ask if Commissioner Taylor can



Page 30

1	lead us in our reading of resolutions for
2	retirement of Commander Debra Fair and the
3	retirement of Commander Shereece Fleming-Freeman
4	and also I'll stop you there.
5	I'll ask if Commissioner Warfield can
6	read our grants for us today.
7	I apologize. We will table the reading
8	of those resolutions to our next scheduled
9	meeting for the Board of Police Commissioners.
10	As such, I'll ask if Commissioner Taylor can lead
11	us in the readings of grants brought forward to
12	this body today.
13	COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Subject: Request
14	to apply for the "Protecting Public Health,
15	Safety, and the Economy from Counterfeit Goods
16	and Product Piracy: The Intellectual Property
17	Theft Enforcement program FY 2012 Competitive
18	Grant" from the United States Department of
19	Justice.
20	The United States Department of
21	Justice, Office of Justice Programs, Bureau of
22	Justice Assistance, is seeking applications for
23	funding under the "Protecting Public Health,
24	Safety, and the Economy from Counterfeit Goods
25	and Product Piracy: The Intellectual Property

HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

1/	19	/2(012
----	----	-----	-----

Theft Enforcement Program FY 2012 Competitive 1 2 Grant Announcement." 3 Local governments are eligible to apply 4 for up to \$200,000 with no cash match for a 5 12-month project period. The specific focus of this program is 6 7 criminal investigation, prosecution, prevention and education as it relates to intellectual 8 9 property theft enforcement. Specifically, this 10 solicitation will fund efforts to: 1. Enforce criminal laws related to 11 12 intellectual property theft including the 13 reimbursement of expenses incurred in performing theft enforcement operations such as overtime 14 15 payments and storage fees for seized evidence. Educate the public to prevent, 16 2. 17 deter and identify criminal violations of 18 intellectual property laws. 3. Establish or expand existing task 19 20 forces to conduct investigations and forensic 21 analysis of evidence in matters involving 22 criminal laws related to intellectual property 23 theft. 24 4. Assist state, local and tribal law 25 enforcement officers and prosecutors in acquiring

RENAISSANCE hansonreporting.com

313-567-8100

HANSON

Page 32

computer and other equipment to conduct 1 2 investigations and forensic analysis of evidence in matters involving criminal laws related to 3 4 intellectual property theft. 5 5. Provide training and technical assistance and services in the prevention and 6 7 enforcement (including prosecution) of intellectual property and closely related crime, 8 9 including where such crimes are perpetrated via 10 electronic means. 11 The Detroit Police Department's 12 Criminal Investigations Bureau has been provided 13 with the application instructions and is currently developing a program to fit the 14 15 quidelines of the grant. CIB, with assistance from Grants and Contracts, will submit an 16 17 application seeking the maximum amount of 18 \$200,000. 19 In the event that approval is granted 20 to apply and the award is received, Commander 21 Robert Ennis of Criminal Investigations will 22 serve as the project director. The deadline for 23 this application is March 2, 2012. 24 I am requesting the Board's permission 25 to apply for the funding and seek approval of the

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

Honorable Detroit City Council. 1 2 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you, 3 Commissioner Taylor. 4 Commissioners, as relates to the 5 request to apply for the Protecting Public Health, Safety and Economy from Counterfeit Goods 6 7 and Product Piracy, the Intellectual Property Theft Enforcement Program for Fiscal Year 2012 8 9 Competitive Grant from the United States 10 Department of Justice what is your pleasure? COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Sir, I move 11 12 that the department apply to -- be given 13 permission to apply for the grant. 14 COMMISSIONER STEWART: Second. 15 COMMISSIONER WHITE: It's been property moved and supported. Any discussion? Seeing 16 17 none, all those in favor? 18 COMMISSIONERS: Aye. COMMISSIONER WHITE: Commissioner 19 20 Taylor, that was a lengthy one, I'll ask if 21 Commissioner Warfield can take you off the hook 22 and read our next grant. 23 COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Permission to 24 accept a 2012 competitive grant from the Michigan 25 Commission On Law Enforcement Standards

1 (M.C.O.L.E.S.) 2 In August of 2011 Michigan Commission 3 On Law Enforcement Standards accepted competitive 4 grant applications for the 2012 training year, 5 January 1, 2012 through December 31, 2012. The Detroit Police Department's Grants 6 7 and Contracts submitted an application and was awarded \$17,000 from M.C.O.L.E.S. 8 9 The total grant budget is \$22,667. 75 10 percent will be funded by M.C.O.L.E.S. and 25 11 percent or \$5,667 will be funded by the City of 12 Detroit. 13 The Detroit Police Department will meet the matching requirement by devoting academy 14 15 staff hours (salary and fringes) to the project's implementation. Second Deputy Chief Tina 16 17 Tolliver of Budget Operations has stated that the 18 25 percent matching funds are available. The 19 appropriation number for this grant is 13380. 20 Commander Duane Love of the Training Center will 21 serve as the project director for the grant. 22 The "Detroit Police Department 2012 23 In-Service Training" program will provide four specialized training sessions to members of the 24 25 department. Two sessions will be for Homicide

HANSON RENAISSANCE hansonreporting.com

1 and Crime Scene Management. At the completion of 2 this three-day death investigation course the 3 participant will be able to develop successful 4 crime scene strategies that will afford them the 5 best opportunity to properly document a violent crime scene and have analyzed the very probative 6 7 evidence that will eventually lead them down the path of truth. 8

9 Concentration is on the crime scene and 10 the ability for the homicide detective to 11 recognize various crime scene indicators coupled 12 with victimology that will make it much easier to 13 establish a proper motive.

14 Successful prosecution always begins at 15 the initial crime scene. The recognition of physical evidence and its documentation, 16 17 collection and analysis are key to an accurate and reliable reconstruction. The course also 18 19 teaches and stresses the importance of proper 20 crime scene protocol that will ensure the 21 thorough process and documentation of any 22 homicide scene, which often is followed by arrest 23 of the offender and successful prosecution. 24 The final two sessions will be for 25 Homicide Scene Management for Patrol. At the



1/	'19	/2	01	2
----	-----	----	----	---

Page 36

completion of this course the participant will 1 2 demonstrate the ability to handle and approach a homicide or violent crime scene prior to a 3 4 arrival of scene investigators. 5 Mistakes can be made at these types of scenes which can have a damaging ripple effect 6 7 throughout the entire investigation. Managing the scene of a homicide and of avoiding too much 8 traffic and cross-contamination while at the same 9 10 time establishing safe boundaries that will 11 encompass all of the physical evidence are 12 essential duties. Crime scene management begins 13 with the arrival of the first officer on the 14 scene and continues with the homicide 15 investigators. Officers have certain responsibilities at various levels of a homicide 16 17 investigation as it applies to the scene. The 18 most important often overlooked are the 19 responsibilities of Patrol.

20 Know what to do before critical errors 21 and possibly the loss of vital evidence takes 22 place. It's always been a simple rule in 23 homicide investigation, how the initial scene is 24 handled by Patrol has a profound effect on the 25 entire investigation.

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

1	This one-day class is designed to
2	benefit those in Patrol so that they may
3	understand what the role they play not only in
4	the initial securing of a homicide scene, but
5	also provides them with a good understanding of
6	physical evidence recognition, preservation and
7	documentation.
8	Upon your approval, the Detroit City
9	Council will be requested to adopt a resolution
10	supporting the acceptance.
11	COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you,
12	Commissioner Warfield. Commissioners, as it
13	relates to the permission to accept a 2012
14	competitive grant from the Michigan Commission On
15	Law Enforcement Standards (M.C.O.L.E.S.) what is
16	your pleasure?
17	COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: I move that we
18	accept for the grant to apply for the grant
19	accept the grant.
20	COMMISSIONER STEWART: Second.
21	COMMISSIONER WHITE: It's been properly
22	moved and seconded. Any discussion? Seeing
23	none, all those in favor?
24	COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
25	COMMISSIONER WHITE: Opposed? Thank



Page 38

1	you. Chief, I want to commend you for your
2	efforts in the climate of diminishing resources
3	and your efforts to continue to seek and secure
4	grant funding to further the work of the
5	department.
6	CHIEF GODBEE: Thank you, sir.
7	COMMISSIONER WHITE: Under Old
8	Business, the chair will entertain any proposed
9	amendments to the towing rules. Seeing none, we
10	will move on to announcements.
11	Please be mindful that the next Board
12	of Police Commissioners meeting will be held
13	Thursday, January 26, 2012 at 3 PM. The meeting
14	will he held here at police headquarters, 1300
15	Beaubien, Room 328-A.
16	At this time, the Board will entertain
17	oral communications from the audience. If you
18	wish to address the Board, we ask that you come,
19	please state your name, your first and last name
20	and for the record and the benefit of the
21	reporter please spell your first and last names.
22	Also we have a time of two minutes, if
23	you could be mindful of the time as we have a
24	number of closed-session hearings today, it would
25	definitely be appreciated.

HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 1313-567-8100

Any comments? Any comments? Welcome. 1 2 MS. WESTMORELAND-KING: My name is Irene Westmoreland-King and I'm here with what I 3 4 thought was a very simple thing, but it's turning 5 out not to be the case. I'm trying -- I had an accident in 6 7 December and the officer came, gave me his name, a report number and told me that after 10 days I 8 9 could get in touch with the Report Unit, which I 10 did. When I did so they claimed that they could 11 not find the report under the number that I had. 12 I would have thought it was a mistake that I 13 made, but he made -- he gave me the number and 14 his name and all, so it couldn't have been a 15 mistake. Finally, they sent me around to the 16 17 front of the building which is where they said his superintendent was. They couldn't find it 18 either. So they said, "Well, he's in court so 19 20 you'll have to call another day and reach him and find out what's wrong." 21 22 I called for the next four days and 23 each time I left my name and phone number, but 24 never received a call. 25 CHIEF GODBEE: Ma'am, if you will see



1	Sgt. Harris, he's from my staff. He will get
2	your information and you don't have to track your
3	officer down, we will make sure that you get the
4	requisite follow-up and we'll get you a copy of
5	the accident report.
6	If something happened in translation
7	with the accident report, we'll make sure that
8	it's recreated, but you will have that before the
9	end of business tomorrow.
10	MS. WESTMORELAND-KING: All right.
11	CHIEF GODBEE: Sgt. Harris, will you
12	raise your hand, please? Ma'am, if you see
13	Sgt. Harris, we'll take care of that for you.
14	MS. WESTMORELAND-KING: Thank you.
15	COMMISSIONER WHITE: And, Ms. King,
16	does the copy of the report handle all of the
17	concerns that you had in that matter?
18	MS. WASHINGTON-kING: I imagine so. I
19	don't know, I haven't seen it and they claim they
20	didn't have it, so I don't know and I've never
21	been able to get in touch with the officer.
22	COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you for
23	coming today. Thank you, Chief.
24	Good afternoon.
25	MR. LUNN: Hello again, good afternoon.



My name is Dana Lunn. Real quick, I'm going to 1 2 try to make these two minutes -- hopefully I can 3 get more -- again, I done went down, I done did 4 my fingerprints, don't know where to turn them in 5 at. I did the fingerprints at -- off the Boulevard. Don't know where to turn them in at. 6 7 The Reserve, they told me to take them right down 8 to Frank Murphy to get my clearance on everything 9 where they can expunge everything. 10 And the second thing, do this real 11 quick since I don't have but two minutes, I took 12 my daughter down to 36th District Court, got 13 everything cleared up. 14 All she did was have the license 15 The Officer Harwood, he still came in problem. there chewing his tobacco, spitting it in a 16 17 container and it still shows on the video he did 18 not approach my daughter it wasn't even a minute. 19 And he did not ask my daughter for 20 registration, proof of insurance or anything. 21 All that was thrown out. I would like to have my 22 ex-wife car back, so why should I have to pay or 23 she have to pay for the car? The car is still 24 wherever it is in the pound because we should not 25 have to pay for a car that was in front of my

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

1 house still. 2 Why is that? And we would like -instead of me making a spectacle or a big thing 3 4 about it, we'd like to have that car back because he did not ask for all that and that was 5 thrown out, everything was thrown out. They just 6 7 charged her for not having the license and 8 everything, so that was thrown out. That was on the 13th. 9 10 And the Number 3, why is the officers, 11 the radar cops, pulling up on people that was at 12 a store? I was dropping a friend off from work 13 because I'm on medical right now. He just pulled 14 and disco'd me and I hadn't had my keys in my car 15 or anything. I'm trying to help the city and I'm 16 17 getting disco'd just for being at a liquor store? 18 I wasn't even drinking or anything. And I told him I had a firearm, that's the procedure to do, 19 20 and he didn't check me for my gun or anything. 21 He said, "Let me see the bottle." 22 What is that? Why are you checking the 23 good citizens instead of the bad guys? Check 24 those boys with their breeches hanging down 25 instead of me. I get checked more than anybody,

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

1/	19,	/20	12
----	-----	-----	----

1 it's like they checking me period and I'm trying 2 to help the citizens of Detroit, the people of 3 Detroit.

4 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you, 5 Mr. Lunn. I have a couple of questions for you. As it relates to -- I'm going to try to answer 6 7 your questions that you highlighted during the course of your two minutes. As it relates to 8 9 your fingerprints, your question was how to use 10 them for an expungement or was it for police 11 reserves?

MR. STOLBERG: It's for the police reserves. They say I have to get fingerprinted, so I went and got fingerprinted because all I have is a misdemeanor, like a \$90 misdemeanor, that's all I got and I have to get that expunged. So they said I had to get fingerprinted so I went and got fingerprinted.

19COMMISSIONER WHITE: Chief, is there20someone who can speak to that process of what's21needed to turn in?

22 CHIEF GODBEE: Deputy Chief Melvin 23 Turner has been dealing with the police reserves 24 answering him, so there's a specific set of 25 criteria relative to approval, so I don't want to

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

speak to that on the record, but the DC can deal 1 2 with Mr. Lunn on that. 3 COMMISSIONER WHITE: So, Mr. Lunn, on 4 that particular issue we'd ask if you speak with 5 Deputy Chief Melvin Turner following this 6 meeting. 7 The other thing I heard reference was a vehicle that was towed in front of your location? 8 9 MR. LUNN: Yes. Inspector Rivera, she 10 was supposed to have been handling that and I 11 haven't got a call back from her on that. It's 12 my ex-wife car that my daughter was driving and, 13 like I was saying, it was in front of my house and he -- my granddaughter, it was a whole big 14 15 situation of getting her to the hospital, but he was more concerned about towing the car instead 16 17 of calling the EMS and if I wanted to be a 18 butthead about it, I could have called him a 19 vulgar name. 20 COMMISSIONER WHITE: I understand. You 21 said it was Investigator Rivera? 22 MR. LUNN: She got Senior Investigator 23 Rivera on her card. 24 COMMISSIONER WHITE: So you filed a 25 formal complaint?



Page 45

1	MR. LUNN: Yes, I did and she said I
2	had to go to court and everything everything
3	was dropped and all they did was charge her for
4	the license. They didn't charge her for running
5	the stop sign or anything, all that was dropped
6	and thrown out because he never got out of the
7	car and he issued tickets for something that he
8	did not do. He did ask her for her insurance,
9	proof of registration or anything.
10	COMMISSIONER WHITE: I understand. So
11	are you clear as to the nature of your complaint
12	that was filed?
13	MR. LUNN: Yes, everything has been
14	taken care of.
15	COMMISSIONER WHITE: The other issue,
16	unfortunately as it relates to the return of your
17	vehicle
18	MR. LUNN: The officer turned it
19	around that he was going in changing shifts and
20	he turned around and just pulled right up. We
21	haven't even put I haven't put the key in the
22	ignition or anything and he disco'd me and asked
23	me. I told him that I had a weapon on me, he
24	didn't ask for my paperwork or nothing.
25	COMMISSIONER WHITE: I understand and

HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

Page 46

unfortunately, Mr. Lunn, it's hard for me to 1 2 speak to a situation that I was not at, but I'm 3 certain you are familiar with the complaint 4 process and how to file a complaint if you believe you were not treated justly by the 5 Detroit Police Department. 6 7 And to that matter I would ask that you would see Lt. Leach to your immediate left 8 9 sitting in the front row here if you would like 10 to discuss further how to file a complaint in 11 regards to any particular issue. 12 MR. LUNN: I'm just -- I just don't 13 want to keep filing complaints. I'm just saying I'm just trying to help the city of Detroit, I'm 14 15 just tired of it. COMMISSIONER WHITE: Chief, did you 16 17 want to add anything to that? 18 CHIEF GODBEE: As far as the vehicle, 19 if it was impounded, if it is appropriately 20 registered and you have appropriate proof of 21 insurance there's no reason for you not to be 22 able to get that vehicle. 23 MR. LUNN: But I don't want to have to 24 pay for something that wasn't done right. 25 CHIEF GODBEE: That is not what the



Court has opined relative to the towing of your 1 2 vehicle. If your daughter was found responsible for driving without a driver's license and the 3 4 vehicle was impounded properly, there was nothing 5 improper about the impounding of the vehicle so from that standpoint you are responsible for the 6 7 fees and the longer you leave the car there the 8 more the fees are going to be. MR. STOLBERG: But he understood that 9 10 it was right in front of my house and he could have let me put it right in my -- by the law --11 12 CHIEF GODBEE: Sir, I don't want to 13 debate that, but the fact of the matter is the officer lawfully did what he was -- under policy 14 15 and issued the tickets, the ones that stuck or the one that stuck, they all would have been a 16 17 reasonable predicate for impounding of the 18 vehicle, regardless of where it was parked at. It doesn't mitigate the fact that she 19 20 was driving it without a license, so from that 21 standpoint we wouldn't have the ability to waive 22 that fee. 23 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you, 24 Mr. Lunn.

MR. LUNN: Okay, I understand, no



25

1 problem. Thank you. 2 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Any other 3 comments? Any other comments? Any other 4 comments? 5 Seeing none, at this time I would also 6 again remind you the next Board of Police 7 Commissioners meeting will be held Thursday, January 26, 2012. 8 At this time I will ask if our 9 10 Executive Secretary can please take us into 11 closed session for personnel matters regarding 12 applicant Mark Harris as well as Sgt. Malkia 13 Miller, Badge S-917. 14 SECRETARY ANTHONY: Thank you, 15 Mr. Chair. For the record, George Anthony, 16 Secretary to the Board. 17 As a public body your meetings are 18 subject to the Open Meetings Act which is the 19 OMA. The OMA defines a meeting as the convening 20 of a public body at which a quorum is present for 21 the purpose of deliberating towards or rendering 22 a decision on a public policy, MCL 15.262(b). 23 The OMA, however, does allow a public body to call a closed session, one limited to the 24 25 public body and its invitees, for specific

hansonreporting.com

313-567-8100

HANSON

RENAISSANCE

012

1/	19	/2	012	
----	----	----	-----	--

purposes. Only deliberations may be conducted in 1 2 closed session. All decisions must be made at a 3 meeting open to the public. 4 While in the closed session the Board makes no decisions, that must be done on the 5 6 record. 7 There have been two requests for closed sessions, so I'll read the one related to the 8 9 suspension without pay recommendation first. 10 On Thursday, January 19, 2012 you will 11 be presented with a suspension without pay 12 recommendation for Sgt. Malkia Miller, Badge 13 S-917. Through her representative, SLA attorney Fred Walker, Sgt. Malkia Miller has requested a 14 15 closed session for the purpose of contesting the suspension without pay recommendation. 16 17 The closed session will be called 18 pursuant to MCL 15.268(a) of the Open Meetings 19 Act which state in part, 20 "A public body may meet in a closed 21 session to consider the suspension of 22 or hear charges brought against an 23 employee. A simple majority vote or 24 quorum of three is required to close a 25 session for this purpose."

> HANSON RENAISSANCE COULT REPORTED & VIDEO 313-567-8100

1 At this point a recommendation to close 2 the session will be in order for Sqt. Malkia Miller. 3 4 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you, Mr. Secretary. Is there a motion? 5 COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Sir, I move 6 7 that we go into closed session to hear the 8 personnel matters at hand. COMMISSIONER STEWART: 9 Second. 10 COMMISSIONER WHITE: It's been properly 11 moved and supported. Any discussion? Seeing 12 none, all those in favor? 13 COMMISSIONERS: Aye. 14 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Opposed? Thank 15 you. We will return following the closed session. 16 17 SECRETARY ANTHONY: Mr. Chair, just a 18 point of clarification, there is a second closed session and that has a different basis in state 19 20 law and we need to read that into the record as 21 well. 22 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Please do. 23 SECRETARY ANTHONY: And this regards a 24 disqualified applicant Mark Harris. At the Board 25 meeting scheduled for Thursday, January 19, 2012

HANSON RENAISSANCE hansonreporting.com

unless there is an objection the Board is 1 2 scheduled to go into closed session to discuss 3 the rejected application of Mark Harris. 4 The closed session will be called 5 pursuant to MCL 15.268(h) of the Open Meetings Act which states in part, "A public body may meet 6 7 in a closed session to consider material exempt from discussion or disclosure by state or federal 8 statute." 9 10 At this point a motion to go into 11 closed session in the case of disqualified 12 applicant Mark Harris would be appropriate. 13 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Commissioners, what is your pleasure? 14 15 COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Sir, I'd move that we move into closed session to discuss the 16 17 personnel matter concerning Mark Harris as well. 18 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Second. 19 COMMISSIONER WHITE: It's been properly 20 moved and supported. Any discussion? Seeing 21 none, all those in favor? 22 COMMISSIONERS: Aye. 23 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Opposed? Thank I believe that does it. We will reconvene 24 vou. 25 following the closed sessions; thank you.

> HANSON RENAISSANCE hansonreporting.com 313-567-8100

1	(A recess was taken and a closed
2	session was held).
3	COMMISSIONER WHITE: We will convene
4	the meeting of the Board of Police Commissioners
5	dated for Thursday, January 19, 2012.
6	I certainly appreciate your indulgence
7	and your patience. And at this time I'll ask if
8	our Secretary to the Board will bring us back
9	from closed session.
10	SECRETARY ANTHONY: Thank you,
11	Mr. Chair. George Anthony for the record and
12	it's appropriate for a motion to reconvene at
13	this point to come into open session.
14	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Sir, I move
15	that we reconvene into open session from closed.
16	COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Second.
17	COMMISSIONER WHITE: It's been properly
18	moved and supported. Any discussion? Seeing
19	none, all those in favor?
20	COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
21	COMMISSIONER WHITE: Opposed? Thank
22	you. Mr. Secretary.
23	SECRETARY ANTHONY: Thank you,
24	Mr. Chair. George Anthony for the record.
25	You've heard the personnel matter of disqualified



applicant Mark Harris in closed session. 1 Ιt 2 would be appropriate for the attorney to the 3 board to come to the mic to provide her 4 recommendation. Thank you, 5 MS. WASHINGTON: 6 Mr. Secretary. Through the Chair, because this 7 matter was held in closed session I won't disclose the details or the substance of 8 9 Mr. Harris' appeal. 10 However, I have reviewed his applicant file and the documents that he has submitted. In 11 12 light of the facts as presented there's been no 13 showing that the department has abused its 14 discretion in its decision to disqualify 15 Mr. Harris from the process. Rather, the decision reached by the 16 17 department was based on the candidate's failure 18 to meet not only the department's but M.C.O.L.E.S. standards as it would relate to 19 20 integrity and good moral character. 21 So my recommendation at this point 22 would be to deny the appeal. Thank you, sir. 23 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Thank you, madam 24 counsel. Before us, Commissioners, is the 25 recommendation of counsel Washington. What is

RENAISSANCE hansonreporting.com

313-567-8100

HANSON

Page 54

1	your pleasure?
2	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: Sir,
3	considering what was discussed I would move that
4	we move on counsel Bank's recommendation with the
5	stipulation that if we could or if the department
6	somehow could reimburse Mr. Harris for the fee
7	that he had to pay to take the M.C.O.L.E.S.
8	examination, if somehow we could reimburse him
9	for that I think it would be appropriate and
10	that's my motion, that we take her recommendation
11	along with seeing how the department can
12	reimburse him.
13	COMMISSIONER WHITE: There is a motion
14	before us to deny the appeal of applicant Mark
15	Harris with the consideration that the
16	department, the Detroit Police Department, offer
17	Mr. Harris reimbursement of the costs of the
18	M.C.O.L.E.S. examination.
19	Is there support for that motion?
20	COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Second.
21	COMMISSIONER WHITE: It's been properly
22	moved and supported. Any discussion?
23	Under discussion, I did want to I'll
24	save that comment; thank you. Seeing no other
25	discussion, all those in favor?

HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO ANSON RENAISSANCE

Page 55

1	COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
2	COMMISSIONER WHITE: Opposed? Thank
3	you. Mr. Secretary.
4	SECRETARY ANTHONY: Thank you,
5	Mr. Chair. George Anthony for the record. You
6	have heard the case of Sgt. Malkia Miller, Badge
7	S-917 in closed session and unless you contravene
8	the Chief's suspension without pay recommendation
9	the suspension without pay for Sgt. Malkia Miller
10	will stand.
11	COMMISSIONER WHITE: As related to the
12	suspension without pay of Sgt. Malkia Miller,
13	Badge S-917, assigned to Management Services
14	Bureau, are there any contraventions?
15	Seeing none, the suspension without pay
16	will stand. There is no further business before
17	us as a body, please be mindful again the next
18	meeting for the Board of Police Commissioners
19	will be held Thursday, January 26, 2012 at 3 PM
20	here at police headquarters, 1300 Beaubien, Room
21	328-A.
22	At this time a motion for adjournment
23	is in order.
24	COMMISSIONER WARFIELD: So moved.
25	COMMISSIONER STEWART: Second.

HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

	Page 56
1	COMMISSIONER WHITE: It's been properly
2	moved and supported. Any discussion? Seeing
3	none, all those in favor?
4	COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
5	COMMISSIONER WHITE: Opposed? Thank
6	you, have a wonderful evening.
7	(Proceedings concluded at
8	5:27 p.m.)
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	



1	CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER
2	
3	
4	STATE OF MICHIGAN)
5) SS
6	COUNTY OF WAYNE)
7	
8	I HEREBY CERTIFY that I reported
9	stenographically the foregoing proceedings at the
10	time and place hereinbefore set forth; that
11	thereafter the same was reduced to computer
12	transcription and that this is a full, true,
13	complete and correct transcription of said
14	proceedings.
15	
16	IN ON STOR
17	Nale Im Lass
18	DALE E. ROSE,
19	CSR-0087
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	



Page 58

Α ability 35:10 36:2 47:21 **able** 35:3 40:21 46:22 **abused** 53:13 **academy** 34:14 accept 28:23 29:1 33:24 37:13,18 37:19 acceptance 37:10 accepted 34:3 **access** 18:17 accident 39:6 40:5 40:7 accidents 20:3 **account** 13:18 14:13 17:11 accountable 6:21 **accurate** 35:17 accustomed 7:6 acquiring 31:25 **act** 48:18 49:19 51:6 acting 3:25 action 28:3 actuality 16:19 **add** 24:8 46:17 **addition** 13:24 address 17:3 38:18 adjournment 55:22 adopt 37:9 adversarial 27:20 28.2 **adverse** 9:24 **afford** 35:4 afternoon 11:2 12:7 40:24,25 **agenda** 4:19,24 ago 6:7 **agree** 15:24 agreement 26:22 allegation 12:13 allegations 8:14 alleged 8:9 **allen** 4:2,14 **allow** 24:14 48:23 **alluded** 25:23 alternative 13:17 14:12 ambiguity 29:10 **ame** 4:14 amendment 4:25 amendments 38:9 **amount** 32:17 analysis 12:20 31:21 32:2 35:17 analyzed 35:6

announcement 31:2 announcements 38:10 **answer** 15:8 43:6 answering 43:24 anthony 2:3 3:16 3:17,19,20 7:16 10:5,12,23 29:23 48:14,15 50:17 50:23 52:10,11 52:23,24 55:4,5 **anybody** 42:25 apologize 30:7 appeal 5:1 10:8,16 11:3 53:9,22 54:14 **appeals** 10:21 applicant 48:12 50:24 51:12 53:1 53:10 54:14 application 32:13 32:17,23 34:7 51:3 applications 30:22 34:4 **applies** 36:17 **apply** 30:14 31:3 32:20,25 33:5,12 33:13 37:18 appreciate 52:6 appreciated 38:25 apprehended 9:14 approach 36:2 41:18 appropriate 23:21 24:11 46:20 51:12 52:12 53:2 54:9 appropriately 46:19 appropriation 34:19 **approval** 4:18 5:11 32:19,25 37:8 43:25 **approve** 4:24 approved 5:25 **area** 12:18,20,25 13:7 15:6 18:14 18:16,19 19:2 20:23 areas 8:15 **arent** 29:13 argument 11:3 arraigned 9:15 **arrest** 35:22 **arrival** 36:4,13 **arrives** 16:4

asked 45:22 **asking** 13:14 **aspect** 14:4 **assault** 9:15 **assessed** 13:25 assigned 11:21 12:19 13:3,10 15:17 20:22 21:20 55:13 **assist** 31:24 assistance 30:22 32:6,15 association 12:9 **attention** 14:8 20:1attorney 3:24 11:1 11:10 24:9 28:11 49:13 53:2 audience 9:4 38:17 **august** 34:2 **available** 34:18 avoiding 36:8 award 32:20 **awarded** 34:8 aye 5:8,18 29:20 33:18 37:24 50:13 51:22 52:20 55:1 56:4 в **back** 15:11 20:7 41:22 42:4 44:11 52:8 **bad** 42:23 badge 8:24 11:21 48:13 49:12 55:6 55:13 bag 14:25 17:19,20 **banks** 3:24 28:11 28:12,24 54:4 bargaining 26:22 **based** 13:5 16:16 24:18 25:9 53:17 basically 12:25 25:9 **basis** 29:15 50:19 beaubien 1:15 38:15 55:20 began 6:9 begins 35:14 36:12 **begun** 6:3 **behalf** 11:8,10 12:8,23 15:14 **believe** 10:16 13:2 17:4 46:5 51:24 **belt** 11:25 12:16 16:12 benefit 37:2 38:20

best 35:5 **big** 42:3 44:14 **board**1:9 3:5,10 3:12,16,21,24 6:15 8:21 9:8 11:1,2,2 13:25 15:25 16:2,21 17:7 20:24 22:2 22:15,18 24:18 25:6,8,11 26:2 26:14,18,20 27:3 27:7,13,19 30:9 38:11,16,18 48:6 48:16 49:4 50:24 51:1 52:4,8 53:3 55:18 **boards** 13:14 16:24 25:2,16 28:15 32:24 **body** 5:21 6:3 30:12 48:17,20 48:24,25 49:20 51:6 55:17 **bond** 9:17,18,19 **bottle** 42:21 **bottom** 21:20 **boulevard** 41:6 **boundaries** 36:10 **boys** 42:24 **bpc** 5:2 10:18 **breeches** 42:24 brief 16:25 briefly 11:18 24:14 27:18 **bring** 52:8 broad 23:17 broadly 23:8 broken 21:16 **brought** 30:11 49:22 **brown** 4:2 **budget** 34:9,17 **building** 39:17 **bureau** 30:21 32:12 55:14 business 10:3 29:25 38:8 40:9 55:16 **butthead** 44:18 С call 39:20,24 44:11 48:24

called 19:11 39:22

car 41:22,23,23,25

calling 44:17

candidates 53:17

44:18 49:17 51:4

HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

42:4,14 44:12,16 45:7 47:7 **card** 44:23 **care** 11:15,23 13:12 28:8 40:13 45:14 **careful** 25:11 **case** 7:8 10:17 11:6 14:23 16:11 17:18 24:5 25:8 25:12 27:25 39:5 51:11 55:6 **cases** 8:5, 5, 7, 13 10:7 11:5 17:13 **cash** 9:18 31:4 **cause** 15:22 16:15 **celia** 3:23 11:1 28:11,12,24 **center** 34:20 **certain** 20:14 36:15 46:3 **certainly** 4:8 7:4 52:6 certificate 57:1 certify 57:8 **chair** 3:20 4:11 5:10 7:17 9:7 10:5,13,25 24:13 28:22 38:8 48:15 50:17 52:11,24 53:6 55:5 chairman 3:9 chairmans 5:20 chairperson 2:4 changing 45:19 **chaplain** 4:13,14 character 53:20 charge 23:13 26:23 28:7 45:3,4 **charged** 11:13 12:12 42:7 charges 25:13 26:24 49:22 **check** 42:20,23 **checked** 42:25 checking 42:22 43:1 **chemical** 12:1,17 16:12 **chewing** 41:16 **chief** 2:13 3:25 4:1,9,10,11 5:24 6:4,11,17 8:4,23 9:6,6,7 10:2 29:6,7 34:16 38:1,6 39:25 40:11,23 43:19 43:22,22 44:5

46:16,18,25 47:12 **chiefs** 55:8 **childish** 20:19 **chose** 17:7 **church** 4:14 **cib** 32:15 circumstances 9:24 13:13,17 14:7 20:18 23:22 **cite** 23:14 citizen 7:4 8:19 citizens 7:19 42:23 43:2 **city** 6:1 12:4 15:14 33:1 34:11 37:8 42:16 46:14 **claim** 40:19 **claimed** 39:10 clarification 50:18 clarifying 29:7,16 **clarity** 25:21 **class** 37:1 **clear** 11:6 14:23 45:11 clearance 41:8 **cleared** 41:13 **clearly** 29:11 **climate** 38:2 **close** 49:24 50:1 **closed** 8:5,21 9:2 10:14 29:22 48:11,24 49:2,4 49:7,15,17,20 50:7,15,18 51:2 51:4,7,11,16,25 52:1,9,15 53:1,7 55:7 closedsession 38:24 **closely** 32:8 colleagues 3:11 collection 35:17 collective 26:22 come 7:10,13 15:11 16:2 20:9 38:18 52:13 53:3 comes 27:4 coming 29:1 40:23 command 2:11 12:5 commander 20:22 30:2,3 32:20 34:20 commanders 26:14 26:15,20,21,25 27:1,10 28:3 commend 9:21 38:1

comment 54:24 comments 24:17 39:1,1 48:3,3,4 commission 33:25 34:2 37:14 commissioner 2:5,6 2:7 3:4,8,13,14 4:7,12,17,20,21 4:22,23 5:4,5,9 5:13,14,15,19 9:1 10:2,10,19 10:24 15:10 16:4 17:25 18:5,8,9 18:21 19:3,7,19 21:2,9,11,11,23 22:5,9,20,21,22 22:22,23,24,24 23:1,3,10 24:12 25:20,22 27:9,16 28:4,25 29:3,4 29:21,24,25 30:5 30:10,13 33:2,3 33:11,14,15,19 33:19,21,23 37:11,12,17,20 37:21,25 38:7 40:15,22 43:4,19 44:3,20,24 45:10 45:15,25 46:16 47:23 48:2 50:4 50:6,9,10,14,22 51:13,15,18,19 51:23 52:3,14,16 52:17,21 53:23 54:2,13,20,21 55:2,11,24,25 56:1,5 commissioners 1:9 2:1 3:6,10,13 5:8,18 15:13 18:1,7 26:10 28:5 29:20 30:9 33:4,18 37:12,24 38:12 48:7 50:13 51:13,22 52:4,20 53:24 55:1,18 56:4 committee 5:1 10:6 10:13 **common** 12:23 communications 9:4 38:17 compared 7:22 competitive 30:17 31:1 33:9,24 34:3 37:14 complaint 7:5,19 44:25 45:11 46:3

46:4,10 complaints 5:23 6:16 7:20 8:10 8:19 46:13 complete 57:13 completes 4:6 completion 35:1 36:1 compliance 6:13,24 comportment 17:13 18:25 computer 32:1 57:11 **conceded** 17:6 concentration 35:9 **concern** 8:15 concerned 44:16 concerning 29:2 51:17 concerns 6:14 40:17 **concluded** 9:3 56:7 concludes 8:18,25 **concur** 16:22 24:9 **concurs** 16:23 conduct 31:20 32:1 conducted 49:1 congratulate 6:11 connection 12:12 13:15 consent 6:13,24 7:11 consider 49:21 51:7 consideration 15:7 54:15 considering 54:3 consistent 16:19 contain 17:20 container 41:17 contend 13:3 contesting 49:15 continue 38:3 continues 36:14 continuing 29:15 **contract** 27:25 contracts 32:16 34:7 contravene 55:7 contravened 28:21 contraventions 55:14 controlling 17:5,5 **convene** 52:3 convening 48:19 conversations 5:21 cops 42:11 **copy** 40:4,16

HANSON RENAISSANCE COURT REPORTERS & VIDEO 313-567-8100

correct 23:16 29:23 57:13 corrective 13:19 14:4,14 **cost**14:1,22 28:17 costs 54:17 couldnt 39:14,18 council 33:1 37:9 counsel 10:24 11:9 12:6 15:12,22 16:5,22 17:6 21:15 24:12 25:20 26:5 28:11 28:24 29:2 53:24 53:25 54:4 **count** 7:20 11:15 counterfeit 30:15 30:24 33:6 country 27:24 **county** 57:6 couple 11:5 24:16 43:5 **coupled** 35:11 course 35:2,18 36:1 43:8 **court** 4:4 9:18 39:19 41:12 45:2 47:1 crime 12:20 32:8 35:1,4,6,9,11,15 35:20 36:3,12 **crimes** 32:9 criminal 31:7,11 31:17,22 32:3,12 32:21 **criteria** 43:25 critical 5:25 36:20 crosscontamina... 36:9 csr0087 57:19 currently 5:25 11:21 32:14 D dale 4:4 57:18 **dalph** 3:22 damaging 36:6 dana 41:1 **darren** 4:13 dated 3:6 4:19 5:11 52:5 dates 29:10 dau 11:8 **daughter** 41:12,18 41:19 44:12 47:2 day 5:3 10:1 26:1 39:20

days 5:22 7:12 15:25 16:3 17:8 22:14,17,19 24:11 25:8 26:8 26:16,17,23 27:2 27:5,8,12 28:16 39:8,22 **dc** 44:1 deadline 32:22 **deal** 10:22 44:1 dealing 43:23 deals 5:22 death 35:2 **debate** 47:13 deborah 5:2 **debra** 30:2 december 7:19,21 7:22 8:3,8,10,13 8:19 34:5 39:7 decided 22:2,18 **decision** 13:15 14:10 16:22,24 24:19 48:22 53:14,16 decisions 49:2,5 decrease 8:1 decree 6:13,25 7:11 **define** 21:7 **defines** 48:19 definitely 38:25 **degree** 6:11 deletion 4:25 deliberated 27:7 deliberating 48:21 deliberation 25:11 deliberations 49:1 demeanor 8:16 demonstrate 36:2 deny 28:23 53:22 54:14 department 2:11 6:12 7:5 9:22 11:9,16 12:14 13:1,2,12 14:1 14:22 15:15 16:14 17:3 18:20 19:25 20:12 22:3 25:18 28:8,20 30:18,20 33:10 33:12 34:13,22 34:25 38:5 46:6 53:13,17 54:5,11 54:16,16 departmentissued 11:24 departments 13:18 32:11 34:6 53:18

deputy 34:16 43:22 44:5 designed 37:1 desk 15:1 details 53:8 **detective** 35:10 deter 31:17 **detroit** 1:9,17 2:11 3:1 7:5 12:9 15:14 32:11 33:1 34:6,12,13 34:22 37:8 43:2 43:3 46:6,14 54:16 **develop** 35:3 developing 32:14 **devoting** 34:14 **didnt** 19:16 21:22 21:24 40:20 42:20 45:4,24 difference 26:3 different 17:22 29:12 50:19 diminishing 38:2 directive 12:4 directly 5:22 director 3:22 32:22 34:21 disagree 13:5 disciplinary 10:8 10:15,21 13:21 16:1 17:3 20:13 24:18,21 25:1,24 discipline 13:19 14:3,14,15 15:22 15:23,24 16:15 17:11 20:16 21:3 21:24 22:13 24:1 24:22,22 26:19 disclose 53:8 disclosure 51:8 **discod** 42:14,17 45:22 discretion 53:14 **discuss** 46:10 51:2 51:16 discussed 54:3 discussion 5:6,16 29:5,6 33:16 37:22 50:11 51:8 51:20 52:18 54:22,23,25 56:2 discussions 29:18 dismissal 22:8 disqualified 50:24 51:11 52:25 disqualify 53:14 district 8:11,12

41:12 document 35:5 documentation 35:16,21 37:7 documents 53:11 doesnt 21:19 27:18 47:19 doing 9:22 18:25 dollars 14:9 23:24 don 11:10 donald 12:8 donnell 2:4 3:8 **dont** 9:8 14:6 19:13 21:17 24:5 27:6 40:2,19,20 41:4,6,11 43:25 46:12,23 47:12 door 8:22 10:14 **dpd** 12:3 drinking 42:18 drivers 47:3 driving 44:12 47:3 47:20 dropped 45:3,5 dropping 42:12 duane 34:20 due 27:23 duties 36:12 duty 11:25 12:16 16:12 Е earlier 21:13 25:23 easier 35:12 eastern 8:11 economic 23:23 economy 11:16,23 28:8 30:15,24 33:6 educate 31:16 education 31:8 **effect** 36:6,24 efficiently 7:3 **efforts** 31:10 38:2 38:3 **either** 15:19 39:19 **elect** 27:19 **elected** 27:7,22 electing 28:1 electronic 32:10 eligible 31:3 **elses** 21:16,17 employee 49:23 ems 44:17 **enclosed** 18:17 encompass 36:11

enforce 31:11



Page 61

enforcement 11:22 30:17 31:1,9,14 31:25 32:7 33:8 33:25 34:3 37:15 enlighten 21:14 ennis 32:21 ensure 35:20 entertain 5:10 28:23 38:8,16 entire 6:11 36:7 36:25 **entirety** 25:16 28:15 equipment 11:17,24 12:14 13:1,9,12 14:2 15:16 18:11 19:14,25 20:9,15 20:25 21:16,17 22:4 23:7,18,19 23:24 25:13,19 28:9,17,20 32:1 **errors** 36:20 essential 36:12 establish 31:19 35:13 establishing 36:10 evening 3:5 56:6 event 14:4 32:19 eventually 35:7 everybody 20:20 evidence 15:3 20:23 27:4 31:15 31:21 32:2 35:7 35:16 36:11,21 37:6 exactly 21:7 23:7 29:9 examination 54:8 54:18 excellent 10:1 21:6 **excuse** 20:19 executive 3:15 48:10 **exempt** 51:7 **exercise** 11:15,23 28:7 existing 31:19 **expand** 31:19 expeditiously 6:7 6:12 expenses 31:13 expunge 41:9 **expunged** 43:16 expungement 43:10 **exwife** 41:22 44:12 F

facilities 11:17 28:9 facility 13:1 fact 16:16 17:6,11 19:15,20 20:21 27:25 47:13,19 **factors** 24:19 facts 53:12 fail 11:23 failed 12:13 **failing** 11:25 failure 11:15 28:7 53:17 **fair** 27:18 30:2 fairly 23:17 familiar 46:3 far 46:18 fashioned 25:12 favor 5:7,17 29:19 33:17 37:23 50:12 51:21 52:19 54:25 56:3 federal 6:13,24 7:10 51:8 fee 47:22 54:6 feels 24:10 fees 31:15 47:7,8 **figures** 7:24,25 file 46:4,10 53:11 **filed** 8:5,7,10,13 44:24 45:12 **files** 7:4 **filing** 46:13 fill 6:1,8 final 35:24 finally 39:16 **find** 9:25 22:10 39:11,18,21 **finding** 13:15 14:11 findings 16:21 25:16 28:15 fingerprinted 43:13,14,17,18 fingerprints 41:4 41:5 43:9 fingers 20:6 firearm 24:4,6 42:19 firearms 14:20 17:15 **fired** 9:11 **first** 7:7,7,18 17:2 22:14,16 25:3,6 36:13 38:19,21 49:9 firstyear 19:10 fiscal 33:8

fit 32:14 five 22:14,17 25:7 26:1 **fiveday** 26:12 27:14 flemingfreeman 30:3 **focus** 31:6 **followed** 35:22 following 11:14 44:5 50:15 51:25 **followup** 40:4 force 8:16 **forces** 31:20 foregoing 57:9 forensic 31:20 32:2 **form** 28:9 formal 9:8 44:25 forms 11:17 **forth** 57:10 forward 6:9,17 7:2 29:17 30:11 found 13:16 47:2 four 24:19 34:23 39:22 **frank** 41:8 **fred** 49:14 **friend** 42:12 **fringes** 34:15 **front** 39:17 41:25 44:8,13 46:9 47:10 **full** 6:15 57:12 fund 31:10 funded 34:10,11 **funding** 30:23 32:25 38:4 funds 34:18 **further** 25:17 28:18 38:4 46:10 55:16 furthermore 9:13 **future** 29:10 fy 30:17 31:1 G generally 22:15 **george** 2:3 3:16,20 48:15 52:11,24 55:5 getting 14:21 19:8 19:22 42:17 44:15 **give** 6:21 7:4 23:25 given 4:16 16:8

17:12 28:13

313-567-8100

HANSON RENAISSANCE hansonreporting.com

33:12 **go** 6:9 7:9 20:6 27:7,12,19,22 45:2 50:7 51:2 51:10 god 9:12 godbee 2:13 4:9,11 8:23 9:6,7 38:6 39:25 40:11 43:22 46:18,25 47:12 going 11:6 13:2 41:1 43:6 45:19 47:8 **good** 3:4 12:7 13:22 22:23 37:5 40:24,25 42:23 53:20 goods 30:15,24 33:6 gotten 26:16 governments 31:3 granddaughter 44:14 grant 30:18 31:2 32:15 33:9,13,22 33:24 34:4,9,19 34:21 37:14,18 37:18,19 38:4 granted 32:19 grants 30:6,11 32:16 34:6 gravity 25:13 greater 27:21 greatness 7:12 guidelines 25:4 32:15 guilt 13:15 guilty 13:16 14:11 14:12,24 **gun** 16:7 42:20 guys 42:23 н hadnt 23:25 42:14 hand 40:12 50:8 handcuffs 12:1,16 16:8,12

handle 36:2 40:16 handled 36:24 handling 5:23 6:16 44:10 hands 17:16 24:7 hanging 42:24 hanson 4:4 happen 20:3 happened 17:20 40:6

happens 14:19 happy 15:8 **hard** 46:1 harris 10:15 40:1 40:11,13 48:12 50:24 51:3,12,17 53:1,9,15 54:6 54:15,17 harwood 41:15 havent 40:19 44:11 45:21,21 headquarters 38:14 55:20 health 30:14,23 33:6 hear 7:1 11:3 49:22 50:7 heard 15:11 25:24 26:1 29:11 44:7 52:25 55:6 hearing 11:6 18:4 24:25 25:10 26:15,15,20,25 27:1,11,20 28:2 hearings 9:3 38:24 held 16:17 38:12 38:14 48:7 52:2 53:7 55:19 hello 40:25 help 42:16 43:2 46:14 hereinbefore 57:10 hes 39:19 40:1 **high** 9:19 highlight 24:16 highlighted 43:7 **history** 13:9,22 24:21 25:1 **hold** 6:20 holster 12:1,17 16:13,13 **homicide** 34:25 35:10,22,25 36:3 36:8,14,16,23 37:4 honorable 33:1 hook 33:21 hope 29:13 hopefully 41:2 **hospital** 44:15 hours 34:15 house 42:1 44:13 47:10 **howard** 12:8 human 3:23 14:19 **hundred** 14:9 hundreds 23:23

Ι id15:8 17:2 24:16 51:15 **identify** 31:17 **ignition** 45:22 ignore 17:7 **ill** 10:4 29:25 30:4,5,10 33:20 49:8 52:7 54:23 **im** 3:11 9:17 11:5 19:7,24 20:18 22:9,23 25:21 26:9 27:17 39:3 39:6 41:1 42:13 42:16,16 43:1,6 46:2,12,13,14,14 **imagine** 40:18 immediate 46:8 implementation 34:16 importance 35:19 important 36:18 **imposed** 15:25 impounded 46:19 47:4 impounding 47:5,17 improper 47:5 inasmuch 25:2 incident 9:11 24:24 include 3:22 included 8:15 12:16 **including** 20:15,21 31:12 32:7,9 increase 7:23 **incurred** 31:13 indicators 35:11 individuals 6:21 indulgence 52:6 information 7:1 28:22 40:2 initial 35:15 36:23 37:4 injuries 9:13 innovative 6:19 inservice 34:23 inside 13:4 15:5 inspector 20:22,24 44:9 instances 14:18 instructions 32:13 insurance 41:20 45:8 46:21 integrity 53:20 intellectual 30:16 30:25 31:8,12,18 31:22 32:4,8

33:7 interview 6:4 interviews 6:8 introduce 3:17 introduction 4:6 investigation 7:8 31:7 35:2 36:7 36:17,23,25 investigations 8:4 31:20 32:2,12,21 investigator 4:1,1 5:24 6:2,5,18 8:4 44:21,22 investigators 36:4 36:15 **invitees** 48:25 **invocation** 4:15,16 **involved** 8:8,10 involving 17:14 31:21 32:3 **ipsa** 19:11 **irene** 39:3 issue 16:18 44:4 45:15 46:11 issued 25:8 45:7 47:15 item 16:10 17:18 items 14:25 16:16 17:21 ive 24:20 25:25 40:20 J january 1:13 3:2,7 4:19 5:12 34:5 38:13 48:8 49:10 50:25 52:5 55:19 jerome 2:5 **jessica** 2:7 3:14 **iob** 9:23 10:1 15:5 joined 3:11 jones 11:9 12:23 13:8 15:13,14 16:5 21:14 22:1 22:7,11 23:15 24:8 26:6,13 27:15 journey 7:10 jr 2:13 justice 30:19,21 30:21,22 33:10 justly 46:5 к **keep** 46:13 **keeping** 14:12 key 35:17 45:21 **keys** 42:14

kind 15:5 22:6 **king** 40:15 know 5:24 6:6 15:4 19:20 20:19 21:17 23:22 27:6 27:23 36:20 40:19,20 41:4,6 **known** 8:9 18:6 L **labor** 14:5 lady 16:11 **landing** 24:6 language 29:8 latin 19:10 latitia 15:13 law 19:10 31:24 33:25 34:3 37:15 47:11 50:20 **lawfully** 47:14 **laws** 31:11,18,22 32:3 leach 3:25 46:8 **lead** 4:15 17:4 30:1,10 35:7 **leading** 8:9,14 **learns** 19:10 **leave** 47:7 **left** 3:14 39:23 46:8 **lengthy** 33:20 **letitia** 11:9 **letter** 5:25 **level** 22:15 26:18 26:21,21 levels 36:16 license 41:14 42:7 45:4 47:3,20 light 53:12 **limited** 48:24 line 21:20 **liquor** 42:17 **listed** 24:20 **local** 31:3,24 located 14:25 location 44:8 locked 13:10 21:15 **locker** 13:3,5 lockers 13:10 lockup 18:12 **longer** 47:7 **look** 7:2 **loquitur** 19:11 lose 27:11 **loss** 26:8,8 36:21 **losses** 17:14 **lost**12:2 14:2,20 15:2,16 16:7,7



Page 63

16:11 24:5 **lot** 19:20,21 **love** 34:20 low 27:11 **lower** 16:20 lt3:25 46:8 **lunn** 40:25 41:1 43:5 44:2,3,9,22 45:1,13,18 46:1 46:12,23 47:24 47:25 М maam 39:25 40:12 madam 53:23 magazines 12:1,17 16.12 maintain 6:23 **majority** 49:23 making 42:3 malkia 8:24 48:12 49:12,14 50:2 55:6,9,12 management 35:1,25 36:12 55:13 manager 4:2 managing 36:7 mandatory 17:9 manual 12:3 23:6 23:14,15 march 32:23 mark 10:15 48:12 50:24 51:3,12,17 53:1 54:14 match 31:4 **matching** 34:14,18 **material** 11:17 28:9 51:7 matrix 16:2,19,20 17:3 22:16 24:22 25:5 27:5,8 **matter** 8:20,23 10:14,21 11:3 13:20,23 15:16 21:19 25:6 29:2 40:17 46:7 47:13 51:17 52:25 53:7 matters 31:21 32:3 48:11 50:8 **maximum** 22:6,7 26:25 32:17 mcl 48:22 49:18 51:5 mean 18:22 20:3 29:9 means 19:12 32:10 measures 29:12 medical 42:13

meet 34:13 49:20 51:6 53:18 **meeting** 1:11 3:6 30:9 38:12,13 44:6 48:7,19 49:3 50:25 52:4 55:18 **meetings** 48:17,18 49:18 51:5 **melvin** 43:22 44:5 member 20:14 members 3:21 34:24 men 9:21 **mention** 10:7 mere 19:15 mic 53:3 michigan 1:17 3:1 33:24 34:2 37:14 57:4 miller 8:24 48:13 49:12,14 50:3 55:6,9,12 mindful 38:11,23 55:17 minimum 16:3 22:11 22:12 25:25 26:1 27:4 minor 14:16 24:3 **minute** 41:18 minutes 5:11 38:22 41:2,11 43:8 misdemeanor 43:15 43:15 misplaced 15:19 21:19 28:18 missing 12:15 16:16 19:14 20:10,15 25:14 25:19 28:20 mistake 39:12,15 mistaken 9:17 mistakes 36:5 mitigate 47:19 mobile 12:19 moment 29:7,16 money 26:7,8 **monthly** 7:20,22 months 6:7 7:13 moral 53:20 motion 4:18,25 5:11 28:23 50:5 51:10 52:12 54:10,13,19 55:22 **motive** 35:13 move 6:16 7:2,14 17:25 28:25 29:17 33:11

37:17 38:10 50:6 51:15,16 52:14 54:3,4 moved 4:20,23 5:4 5:6,13,16 29:5 33:16 37:22 50:11 51:20 52:18 54:22 55:24 56:2 moving 6:12 **murphy** 41:8 N name 3:8 38:19,19 39:2,7,14,23 41:1 44:19 names 38:21 narcotics 11:22 nature 7:8 23:6 45:11 need 11:5 29:8 50:20 needed 6:23 43:21 **needs** 5:25 negligence 20:17 **never** 39:24 40:20 45:6 **new**10:3 29:24 **news** 9:10 nonadversarial 27:22 northeastern 8:11 **note** 4:8 5:20 6:10 9:9 **number** 10:3,18 13:7,8 14:10 24:19 34:19 38:24 39:8,11,13 39:23 42:10 numerous 14:18 17:13 0 objection 51:1 obviously 15:4 17:5 occurrence 17:22 october 11:13,22 offender 35:23 offense 22:14,16 25:3,7 offenses 24:3 offer 24:17 25:11 54:16 offered 25:11 office 4:1,2 5:23 6:17 7:3 8:3 9:6 12:20,24,25 13:7

18:11,13,14,20 20:5 21:1 28:6 30:21 officer 5:2 10:17 11:4,10,12,20 12:10,11,19,22 13:8,21,22 15:15 18:1,10,15 24:24 25:17 26:13 27:19 28:1,19 36:13 39:7 40:3 40:21 41:15 45:18 47:14 officers 8:9 9:11 9:12,16,20 12:9 13:6,11 14:8,19 20:17 23:5 31:25 36:15 42:10 offices 18:16 okay 9:12,20 19:19 22:20 47:25 **old** 38:7 oma 48:19,19,23 onduty 12:12 **oneday** 37:1 ones 47:15 ongoing 29:15 open 6:2 8:4 12:21 15:6 48:18 49:3 49:18 51:5 52:13 52:15 operations 31:14 34:17 opined 47:1 opportunity 35:5 opposed 5:9 26:11 28:2 29:21 37:25 50:14 51:23 52:21 55:2 56:5 oral 9:3 11:3 38:17 order 7:3 20:13,14 50:2 55:23 ordered 14:1,3 25:18 28:19 outlined 28:12 outside 18:17 20:13 overlooked 36:18 **overtime** 31:14 Ρ

paid 20:10 paperwork 45:24 parked 47:18 part 20:17 21:24 49:19 51:6 participant 35:3

51:5

put10:8 11:18

36:1 particular 12:24 13:11 18:16,19 19:2 20:23 23:14 26:13 44:4 46:11 **path** 35:8 patience 52:7 patrol 35:25 36:19 36:24 37:2 pay 8:22 20:1 41:22,23,25 46:24 49:9,11,16 54:7 55:8,9,12 55:15 payments 31:15 penalized 20:10 **penalty** 13:24 16:18 23:25 25:2 25:7 27:21 **people** 16:6,7 19:21 42:11 43:2 percent 7:23 8:1,8 8:11,12,12,15,16 8:16,17 34:10,11 34:18 performing 31:13 period 31:5 43:1 permission 32:24 33:13,23 37:13 perpetrated 32:9 perpetrator 9:13 person 9:15 20:15 personal 6:22 personnel 3:23 10:14 29:22 48:11 50:8 51:17 52:25 pertains 25:5 petitioner 11:12 pheasant 10:17 11:4,10,13,21 12:10,11,19 13:21 15:15 18:1 24:24 25:17 28:6 28:19 **phone** 39:23 phrase 19:11 **physical** 35:16 36:11 37:6 **pinson** 4:13,14 **piracy** 30:16,25 33:7 **place** 6:20 36:22 57:10 **play** 37:3 **please** 3:17 7:9 10:10 38:11,19 38:21 40:12

48:10 50:22 55:17 pleasure 3:9 33:10 37:16 51:14 54:1 **plus** 16:9 22:3 **pm**1:13 38:13 55:19 point 20:6 21:6 25:21 50:1,18 51:10 52:13 53:21 police 1:9 2:11 3:6,10,12,23 5:2 7:5 10:17 11:4 11:12,20 12:9,9 12:22 15:14 18:15 28:6 30:9 32:11 34:6,13,22 38:12,14 43:10 43:12,23 46:6 48:6 52:4 54:16 55:18,20 **policy** 13:18 14:5 14:13 29:17 47:14 48:22 position 6:4,6 positions 6:2,8 possibly 36:21 **pound** 41:24 practice 11:16,23 12:23 13:6 18:18 20:21 28:8 29:14 precinct 8:12 predicate 47:17 preliminary 6:3 prep 12:2,17 16:13 **prepared** 24:16 presence 4:9 present 18:2,3,6 48:20 presentation 9:8 presented 20:24 49:11 53:12 preservation 37:6 **prevent** 31:16 prevention 31:7 32:6 **prior** 13:21,23 14:14 17:11 24:1 24:24 25:1 36:3 probative 35:6 problem 41:15 48:1 procedure 8:15 20:9,11 42:19 proceeding 27:22 proceedings 4:3 56:7 57:9,14 process 6:4 20:13

27:23 35:21 43:20 46:4 53:15 **product** 30:16,25 33:7 profound 36:24 program 30:17 31:1 31:6 32:14 33:8 34:23 programs 30:21 progression 25:24 progressive 13:19 14:13 24:22 25:2 project 31:5 32:22 34:21 projects 34:15 proof 41:20 45:9 46:20 proper 20:11 23:4 28:22 35:13,19 **properly** 4:22 5:5 5:15 11:25 12:13 29:4 35:5 37:21 47:4 50:10 51:19 52:17 54:21 56:1 property 12:4 13:4 18:20 19:1 21:8 30:16,25 31:9,12 31:18,22 32:4,8 33:7,15 proposed 38:8 prosecution 31:7 32:7 35:14,23 prosecutors 31:25 protected 27:24 protecting 30:14 30:23 33:5 protocol 23:4 35:20 provide 32:5 34:23 53:3 **provided** 32:12 provides 37:5 provision 23:14 **public** 12:21 15:6 18:17,18 30:14 30:23 31:16 33:5 48:17,20,22,23 48:25 49:3,20 51:6 pulled 42:13 45:20 **pulling** 42:11 punished 28:1 29:14punishment 25:12 **purpose** 48:21 49:15,25 purposes 49:1 **pursuant** 49:18

27:13 45:21,21 47:11 putting 6:19 Q question 20:4,8 21:13 23:4 26:10 43:9 questions 15:8,11 18:1,7 23:2 25:23 43:5,7 quick 41:1,11 quinn 4:3 **quorum** 48:20 49:24 R **radar** 42:11 radio 12:2,18 16:13 **raise** 40:12 **ralph**2:13 4:9 **range** 27:14 **ranges** 25:7 **rate** 7:7,8 reach 39:20 **reached** 53:16 read 30:6 33:22 49:8 50:20 reading 23:11 30:1 30:7 readings 30:11 real 27:17 41:1,10 really 14:3 21:19 **reason** 22:18 27:6 46.21 reasonable 13:11 47:17 reasonableness 24:23 reasonably 14:24 **reasons** 28:12 **received** 7:19,21 8:21 32:20 39:24 **recess** 52:1 recognition 35:15 37:6 recognize 35:11 recommendation 8:23 24:15,17 25:15 28:5,10,24 29:1 49:9,12,16 50:1 53:4,21,25 54:4,10 55:8 recommended 25:17 28:14,18 reconstruction



Page 65

35:18 **reconvene** 51:24 52:12,15 **record** 3:20 10:9 10:16,20 11:19 12:8 18:5 38:20 44:1 48:15 49:6 50:20 52:11,24 55:5 recording 4:3 recovered 9:14 recreated 40:8**reduced** 57:11 reference 44:7 regarding 48:11 regardless 47:18 **regards** 46:11 50:23 registered 46:20 registration 41:20 45:9 regular 1:11 reimburse 14:1 20:14 22:3 23:24 25:18 28:19 54:6 54:8,12 reimbursed 16:14 reimbursement 14:6 15:23 16:9 23:21 28:17 31:13 54:17 reimbursing 14:21 rejected 51:3 **relate** 53:19 related 29:9 31:11 31:22 32:3,8 49:8 55:11 **relates** 23:4,5 25:21,23 28:6,7 31:8 33:4 37:13 43:6,8 45:16 **relative** 9:15 43:25 47:1 relatively 14:16 24:3 **reliable** 35:18 remains 20:21 **remember** 17:19 24:4 **remind** 48:6 **remove** 29:10 rendering 48:21 **report** 5:20 7:15 7:18,18 8:18,25 9:5 10:6,13 28:13 39:8,9,11 40:5,7,16 reported 57:8

reporter 38:21 57:1 **reporting** 4:4 **reports** 5:1 10:6 representative 49:13 representing 3:15 represents 7:23 8:1 **reprimand** 14:16,21 16:9 17:12 21:5 22:12,13 24:2 25:25 26:11,17 27:12 request 8:21 10:13 30:13 33:5 requested 37:9 49:14 requesting 32:24 requests 49:7 required 49:24 requirement 34:14 requires 16:20 requisite 40:4 **res** 19:11 **reserve** 41:7 **reserves** 43:11,13 43:23 resolution 37:9 resolutions 10:4 30:1,8 resources 3:23 38:2 respected 14:5 **response** 7:7 16:25 21:12 responsibilities 36:16,19 responsibility 6:15 18:10 responsible 15:15 15:18 16:17 18:23 19:4,6,24 21:10,21 23:18 47:2,6 restructure 7:2 **resulted** 12:2 results 21:4 retirement 30:2,3 return 45:16 50:15 **reversed** 13:16 14:11 **review** 25:10 **reviewed** 24:10 53:10 **right** 3:14 19:9 20:7 22:1 23:13 27:10 40:10 41:7

42:13 45:20 46:24 47:10,11 **rights** 27:24 **ripple** 36:6 **risk** 27:15 **rivera** 44:9,21,23 robert 4:2 32:21 **role** 37:3 **room** 1:15 18:4 21:15 38:15 55:20 **rose** 4:4 57:18 **row** 46:9 **rule** 11:14 36:22 **rules** 21:7 38:9 **run** 27:15 running 45:4 s **s917**8:24 48:13 49:13 55:7,13 sacrificed 19:22 **safe** 18:11 36:10 **safety** 30:15,24 33:6 **salary** 34:15 **save** 54:24 saving 18:12 20:19 44:13 46:13 says 21:15 scenarios 26:4 scene 35:1,4,6,9 35:11,15,20,22 35:25 36:3,4,8 36:12,14,17,23 37:4 scenes 36:6 scheduled 30:8 50:25 51:2 **second** 4:21 5:14 8:20 29:3 33:14 34:16 37:20 41:10 50:9,18 51:18 52:16 54:20 55:25 **seconded** 37:22 secondly 17:17 secretary 2:3 3:15 3:19,21 4:8 7:16 9:2 10:5,12,20 10:23 29:23 48:10,14,16 50:5 50:17,23 52:8,10 52:22,23 53:6 55:3,4 **secretarys** 7:15,18 8:25 secure 11:25 12:13

13:12 14:25 18:19,22,24 23:17 29:9 38:3 **secured** 13:4 15:18 19:1 21:8 securing 15:18 20:25 23:6 29:13 37:4 **see** 18:3 39:25 40:12 42:21 46:8 **seeing** 5:7,16 29:18 33:16 37:22 38:9 48:5 50:11 51:20 52:18 54:11,24 55:15 56:2 seek 32:25 38:3 **seeking** 30:22 32:17 **seen** 9:10 40:19 seized 31:15 **senior** 44:22 **sent** 39:16 **separate** 18:17 **series** 12:4 **serious** 17:14 **serve** 32:22 34:21 **service** 4:5 7:6 8:16 services 32:6 55:13 serving 3:9 **session** 8:22 9:2 10:14 29:22 48:11,24 49:2,4 49:15,17,21,25 50:2,7,16,19 51:2,4,7,11,16 52:2,9,13,15 53:1,7 55:7 **sessions** 34:24,25 35:24 49:8 51:25 set 43:24 57:10 setting 9:19 **sgt** 4:2 8:24 40:1 40:11,13 48:12 49:12,14 50:2 55:6,9,12 **share** 6:14 7:12 **shared** 18:14 **shereece** 30:3 **shes** 14:24 shifts 45:19 shouldnt 28:1 **show** 19:17 20:17 21:5 **showing** 19:21 53:13



Page 66

sign 45:5 similarly 13:6 simple 14:6 36:22 39:4 49:23 sir 4:17 10:10 23:16 28:25 33:11 38:6 47:12 50:6 51:15 52:14 53:22 54:2 sitting 46:9 situated 13:6 situation 17:9 44:15 46:2 six 27:2 **sla** 49:13 solicitation 31:10 somebody 20:5 sorry 27:17 **sp** 4:13 **speak** 20:25 26:6 43:20 44:1,4 46:2 **speaks** 19:12 specialized 34:24 **specific** 23:9 31:6 43:24 48:25 specifically 21:7 21:18 31:9 specification 23:13 specifications 11:19 spectacle 42:3 **spell** 38:21 **spitting** 41:16 **spray** 12:1,17 16:12 **ss** 57:5 staff 2:11 3:15,18 3:21 34:15 40:1 **stand** 55:10,16 standard 24:23 standards 33:25 34:3 37:15 53:19 **standing** 5:1 10:6 10:12 13:23 standpoint 47:6,21 **start**14:15 24:2 **state** 31:24 38:19 49:19 50:19 51:8 57:4 stated 12:11 34:17 **states** 15:23 16:5 30:18,20 33:9 51:6 **statute** 51:9 **stay** 7:9 stenographically

57:9 stewart 2:6 3:13 4:20,23 5:4,14 18:8,9,21 19:3,7 19:19 21:2,9,12 21:23 22:5,9,20 22:22 33:14 37:20 50:9 55:25 **stewarts** 25:22 stinson 5:2 stipulation 54:5 stolberg 11:11 12:7,8 16:25 18:3,13,24 19:5 19:9 20:12 21:4 23:8,12,20 26:7 27:17 43:12 47:9 stolen 12:3,15,18 13:10 15:1,17 17:18 21:18 24:5 **stop** 30:4 45:5 **storage** 12:25 31:15 store 42:12,17 straight 27:12 strategies 6:20 35:4 **street** 17:15 streets 19:21 20:2 24:6 strengthen 29:8,17 **stresses** 35:19 stressful 9:23 stuck 47:15,16 **student** 19:10 stuff 19:20 20:6 **subject** 20:16 27:20 30:13 48:18 **submit** 32:16 **submitted** 6:1 34:7 53:11 substance 53:8 successful 35:3,14 35:23 sufficed 14:7 sufficient 22:19 superintendent 39:18 support 6:22 54:19 supported 4:23 5:6 5:16 29:5 33:16 50:11 51:20 52:18 54:22 56:2 supporting 37:10 supposed 18:22 44:10 sure 6:23 11:5

HANSON RENAISSANCE

18:11 20:1 40:3 40:7 suspension 8:22 21:25 22:3 25:9 28:16 49:9,11,16 49:21 55:8,9,12 55:15 sustain 16:21 sustaining 16:23 т table 9:2 30:7 **tabled** 5:3 tactical 12:18 take 6:15 17:10 33:21 40:13 41:7 48:10 54:7,10 taken 15:19,20 17:20 21:17 45:14 52:1 takes 36:21 **talk** 26:7 talking 14:8 23:23 26:8 talks 23:6 task 31:19 taylor 2:7 3:14 4:21 5:13 22:25 23:1 29:3,25 30:10,13 33:3,20 37:17 51:18 52:16 54:20 teaches 35:19 technical 6:22 32:5 **temple** 4:14 terms 29:12 testified 12:22 13:8 testimony 27:4 thank 3:19 4:7,9 4:11,17 5:9 7:16 9:1,7,12,18 10:2 10:19,25 15:7,10 17:2,24 22:21 24:11,13 28:4 29:21 33:2 37:11 37:25 38:6 40:14 40:22,23 43:4 47:23 48:1,14 50:4,14 51:23,25 52:10,21,23 53:5 53:22,23 54:24 55:2,4 56:5 thats 15:2 19:7 20:4 22:9 27:3 29:16,23 42:19 43:16 54:10

hansonreporting.com

313-567-8100

theft 30:17 31:1,9 31:12,14,23 32:4 33:8 theres 19:9 26:18 26:19,20 43:24 46:21 53:12 thing 19:12,20 39:4 41:10 42:3 44:7 **things** 7:3,17 17:22 20:2,14 **think** 7:11 9:18 14:6,23 17:8 19:13,23 20:6 21:12 23:12,20 25:22 29:7,16 54:9 **thorough** 35:21 **thought** 39:4,12 three 16:3 22:17 25:7 26:1,16,17 26:23 27:5,12,13 49:24 threeday 17:9 35:2 thrown 41:21 42:6 42:6,8 45:6 thursday 1:13 3:2 3:7 4:19 5:12 38:13 48:7 49:10 50:25 52:5 55:19 tickets 45:7 47:15 time 4:12,18 5:10 7:14 9:5 10:22 13:20 15:1 24:25 36:10 38:16,22 38:23 39:23 48:5 48:9 52:7 55:22 57:10 times 9:24 17:23 23:23 **timothy** 3:25 **tina** 34:16 tired 46:15 **tobacco** 41:16 today 3:11 4:10 9:9 11:7,8 18:2 30:6,12 38:24 40:23 told 39:8 41:7 42:18 45:23 tolliver 34:17 tomorrow 40:9 toney 2:6 3:13 tools 6:22 total 34:9 touch 39:9 40:21 tough 23:22 towed 44:8

Page 67

Y

towing 38:9 44:16	2
47:1	unc
track 40:2	uni
tracks 26:19	4
<pre>traffic 36:9 training 32:5 34:4</pre>	uni 1
34:20,23,24	uni
transaction 17:21	3
transcript 25:10	unk
transcription	uni
57:12 , 13	upł
translation $40:6$	use
treated 46:5	2
tremendous 9:23	usı
trial 11:2 13:14	usı
13:25 16:2,21,23	
17:7 20:24 22:15 24:18 25:1,6,8	vac
25:10,15 26:1,14	vac
26:18,20 27:3,13	vai
27:19 28:14	vai
tribal 31:24	3
true 16:10 17:17	veł
57:12	4
truth 35:8 try 41:2 43:6	.4
trying 22:10 39:6	vic vic
42:16 43:1 46:14	vic
turn 41:4,6 43:21	vic
turned 12:14 45:18	1
45:20	vic
turner 43:23 44:5	vic
turning 39:4	vit
<pre>two 7:17 12:1,17 15:25 17:8 22:19</pre>	vot
24:10 26:4,19,24	vul
27:8 28:16 34:25	
35:24 38:22 41:2	wai
41:11 43:8 49:7	wai
twoday 13:24 22:2	wal
23:25 25:9	war
tymisha 10:17 11:4	4
11:12,20 12:10 28:6	4
types 36:5	5
	war wai
U	2
uncertain 25:21	3
underneath $15:1$	3
underresourced	5
9:25 understand 13:20	waı
21:24 27:16 37:3	was 1
44:20 45:10,25	2
47:25	2
understandable	5
27:9	was
understanding	4

	I
26:10 37:5 understood 47:9 unfortunately 15:5 45:16 46:1 unit 8:9 11:22 12:19 39:9 united 30:18,20 33:9 unknown 8:8 unreasonable 16:1 upheld 25:16 28:15 use 11:16,24 12:25 28:8 43:9 usual 9:21	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
usually 21:4	Ī
v	v
<pre>vacant 6:1 vacated 6:6 variety 29:11 various 35:11 36:16 vehicle 44:8 45:17 46:18,22 47:2,4 47:5,18 vicechairman 3:12 victimology 35:12 video 41:17 violation 11:14 12:3 21:5 violations 31:17</pre>	
violent 35:5 36:3 vital 36:21 vote 49:23 vulgar 44:19	
W	v
<pre>waive 27:10 47:21 waived 26:14 walker 49:14 want 19:13 38:1 43:25 46:13,17 46:23 47:12 54:23 wanted 44:17 warfield 2:5 16:4 22:22,23 28:25 30:5 33:11,21,23 37:12 50:6 51:15 52:14 54:2 55:24 warrant 26:11</pre>	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
washington 3:24	
10:25 11:1 24:13 26:5,9 28:11,12 28:24 29:2 53:5 53:25 washingtonking 40:18	-
10.10	-

wasnt15:2,18
17:22 21:16
41:18 42:18 46:24
watson 3:22
way 10:1 14:2 21:6
wayne 57:6 ways 6:19
weapon 9:14 14:22
45:23
wed 42:4 44:4
welcome 3:5 39:1 went 41:3 43:14,18
westmorelandking
39:2,3 40:10,14
whats 39:21 43:20 white 2:4 3:4,8
4:7,12,17,22 5:5
5:9,15,19 9:1
10:2,10,19,24 15:10 17:25 18:5
21:11 22:21,24
23:3,10 24:12
25:20 27:9,16
28:4 29:4,21,24 33:2,15,19 37:11
37:21,25 38:7
40:15,22 43:4,19 44:3,20,24 45:10
44:3,20,24 45:10
45:15,25 46:16 47:23 48:2 50:4
50:10,14,22
50:10,14,22 51:13,19,23 52:3
52:17,21 53:23 54:13,21 55:2,11
56:1,5
whos 3:25 4:3
wide 29:11 wisdom 9:19
wish 38:18
women 9:22
wonderful 56:6
wont 53:7 work 38:4 42:12
worked 12:20,24
working 6:7
worry 24:6 worse 20:4
wouldnt 47:21
written 14:15,21
16:9 17:12 22:12
22:13 24:2 25:25 26:17 27:11
wrong17:16 19:15 19:17,18 24:7
19:17,18 24:7
39:21
X

yeah 18:9,24 19:6 **year** 33:8 34:4 **years** 13:22 yeartodate 7:24,25youll 7:1 11:3,18 39:20 **young** 16:11 youre 11:6 18:12 youve 52:25 \mathbf{Z} 0 **00**1:13 000 9:18 31:4 32:18 34:8 1 **1**7:25 8:1,5,6 11:15 12:5 13:7 14:10 31:11 34:5 **10**8:17 13:22 39:8 **100** 12:4 **100727** 11:8 **102** 12:4 **11**8:11 11:13,22 **11002d** 5:2 **11003d**10:18 **115** 7:22 **123**7:21 8:7,13 **12month** 31:5 **1300** 1:15 38:14 55:20 **13380** 34:19 **13th** 42:9 **15** 48:22 49:18 51:5 **17** 34:8 **189**8:14 **19**1:13 3:2,7 4:19 49:10 50:25 52:5 2 **2**13:8 31:16 32:23 **200** 31:4 32:18 2010 7:22,25 11:13 11:23 2011 7:19,21,23,24 8:2,3,8,10,14,19 34:2 20121:13 3:2,7 4:19 5:12 30:17 31:1 32:23 33:8 33:24 34:4,5,5 34:22 37:13 38:13 48:8 49:10



Page 6	58
--------	----

50:25 52:5 55:19 21 8:16 22 34:9
23 3:3 25 34:10,18 26 38:13 48:8 55:19
262 48:22 268 49:18 51:5 27 56:8
3
3 1:13 3:3 31:19 38:13 42:10 55:19
30 8:15,16 31 34:5 328a 1:15 38:15
55:21 33 8:8 36th 41:12
37 12:4 3774 11:21
4
4 31:24
5
5
5 5:12 8:1 32:5 34:11 56:8 508 8:6
5 5:12 8:1 32:5 34:11 56:8
5 5:12 8:1 32:5 34:11 56:8 508 8:6 584 7:25 8:5 6
5 5:12 8:1 32:5 34:11 56:8 508 8:6 584 7:25 8:5
5 5:12 8:1 32:5 34:11 56:8 508 8:6 584 7:25 8:5 6 667 34:9,11 669 8:1
5 5:12 8:1 32:5 34:11 56:8 508 8:6 584 7:25 8:5 6 667 34:9,11 669 8:1 683 8:5
5 5:12 8:1 32:5 34:11 56:8 508 8:6 584 7:25 8:5 6 667 34:9,11 669 8:1 683 8:5 7 7 7:23 8:12 12:4 72 5:22
5 5:12 8:1 32:5 34:11 56:8 508 8:6 584 7:25 8:5 6 667 34:9,11 669 8:1 683 8:5 7 77:23 8:12 12:4 72 5:22 75 34:9
5 5:12 8:1 32:5 34:11 56:8 508 8:6 584 7:25 8:5 6 667 34:9,11 669 8:1 683 8:5 7 77:23 8:12 12:4 72 5:22 75 34:9 8
5 5:12 8:1 32:5 34:11 56:8 508 8:6 584 7:25 8:5 6 667 34:9,11 669 8:1 683 8:5 7 77:23 8:12 12:4 72 5:22 75 34:9 8 8:12,12

