

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

DETROIT BOARD OF POLICE COMMISSIONERS

SPECIAL BOARD MEETING

Closed Session

Personnel Matters

PAGE 1 TO 9

Taken at 1300 Beaubien Street, Room 328
Detroit, Michigan,
Commencing at 3:10 p.m.,
Tuesday, May 10, 2011,
Before Wendy A. Boer, CSR 3505.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

APPEARANCES :

JEROME WARFIELD, CHAIRMAN

ADELA RIVERA, VICE CHAIRPERSON

DONNELL WHITE, COMMISSIONER

GEORGE ANTHONY, EXECUTIVE SECRETARY

RALPH GODBEE, CHIEF OF POLICE

5/10/2011

Page 3

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Detroit, Michigan
Tuesday, May 10, 2011
About 3:10 p.m.

CHAIRMAN WARFIELD: Good afternoon, ladies and gentlemen. Welcome to the Board of Police Commissioners special closed session meeting regarding some personnel matters. My name is Jerome Warfield, Chairman of the Board of Police Commissioners. Serving with us today is the Vice Chairman for the Board of Police Commissioners, Commissioner Adela Rivera, Commissioner Mr. Donnell White. Also we have with us the Chief of Police. Chief, good to have you, sir, Ralph Godbee. And I'm going to ask if our Board Secretary, Mr. George Anthony, will move us on from here.

SECRETARY ANTHONY: Through the Chair, George Anthony for the record. There has been a request for a closed door session pursuant to the Open Meetings Act under Michigan law. As a public body, your meetings are subject to the Open Meetings Act or the OMA. The OMA defines a meeting as the convening of a public body at which a quorum is present for the purpose of deliberating towards or rendering a decision on a public policy. That's MCL 15.262(b).

The OMA, however, does allow a public body to

1 call a closed session, one limited to the public body
2 and its invitees for specific purposes. Only
3 deliberations may be conducted in closed session. All
4 decisions must be made at a meeting open to the public.
5 While in the closed session, the Board makes no
6 decisions. That must be done on the record.

7 On Thursday, May 5th, 2011, you will be
8 presented with a suspension without pay recommendation.
9 I think that should be Thursday, May 10th, which is
10 today's date -- Tuesday, excuse me, May 10th, you will
11 be presented with a suspension without pay
12 recommendation for Police Officers George Loynes, and
13 I'll spell that, L-o-y-n-e-s, Badge 982; Leonard Ball,
14 Badge 973; Jamil, J-a-m-i-l, Martin, Badge 5008; and
15 Henry Jackson, Badge 3829.

16 Through their representative, DPOA Attorney
17 John L. Goldpaugh, these officers have requested a
18 closed session for the purpose of contesting the
19 suspension without pay recommendation. The closed
20 session will be called pursuant to MCL 15.268(a) of the
21 Open Meetings Act, which states in part, Section 8(a),
22 "Personnel matters. A public body may meet in a closed
23 session to consider the suspension of or hear charges
24 brought against an employee. A simple majority vote or
25 quorum of three is required to close a session for this

1 purpose." The presence of a quorum, sir, allows you to
2 close the session.

3 COMMISSIONER RIVERA: Motion to convene to
4 closed session.

5 COMMISSIONER WHITE: Support.

6 CHAIRMAN WARFIELD: It's been properly moved
7 and supported that we go into closed session. All those
8 in favor?

9 COMMISSIONERS: Aye.

10 CHAIRMAN WARFIELD: All those opposed? Motion
11 carries. We will now go into closed session.

12

13

14 (At 3:15 p.m., the Board of Police
15 Commissioners convened in closed session until 4:35
16 p.m.)

17

18 CHAIRMAN WARFIELD: We are back in open
19 session. I'm going to ask if Mr. Anthony would put us
20 back into open session. Thank you.

21 SECRETARY ANTHONY: Mr. Chair, George Anthony.
22 For the record, I think it's appropriate that before we
23 come back from closed session to open session that a
24 motion be made to come into open session.

25 COMMISSIONER WHITE: So moved.

1 COMMISSIONER RIVERA: Second.

2 CHAIRMAN WARFIELD: It's been properly moved
3 and supported that we move from closed session back into
4 open session. All those in favor?

5 COMMISSIONERS: Aye.

6 CHAIRMAN WARFIELD: All those opposed? Motion
7 carried. Yes, sir?

8 SECRETARY ANTHONY: Mr. Chair George Anthony.
9 Through the Chair, you have heard in closed session, you
10 have heard the suspension without pay recommendations
11 for Officer George Loynes and Officer Leonard Ball as
12 well as two other cases were motioned or were called up.
13 I will go individually by the cases.

14 The first case, Officer George Loynes, Badge
15 982. You have heard that case in closed session. And
16 unless contravened by this Board, the suspension without
17 pay recommendation of the Chief will stand.

18 COMMISSIONER RIVERA: Contravened.

19 CHAIRMAN WARFIELD: Sir, there is
20 contravention in that case.

21 SECRETARY ANTHONY: Thank you. On the second
22 case, you have heard the case of Police Officer Leonard
23 Ball, Badge 973, in closed session. And unless
24 contravened by this Board, that suspension will stand,
25 suspension without pay will stand.

1 COMMISSIONER RIVERA: I want to contravene on
2 this one as well.

3 CHAIRMAN WARFIELD: Sir, there is
4 contravention.

5 SECRETARY ANTHONY: And finally, there was --
6 you have heard in closed session the case involving
7 Officer Jamil Martin, Badge 5008. I should indicate
8 that that case also included another officer, and that
9 case was not heard. I believe you have further comments
10 with regards to Jamil Martin's case.

11 CHAIRMAN WARFIELD: Yes, sir. Thank you,
12 Mr. Anthony. It became apparent to us that the
13 paperwork on those cases did not match. So, we will
14 reschedule those two cases and hear them at a later date
15 once we know that the paperwork in those cases are
16 matching. I also want to indicate that we need all four
17 Commissioners to weigh in on suspensions without pay in
18 an effort for them to go in or not to go into effect as
19 well. So, I just want to put that there for the record.
20 Anything else, Mr. Secretary?

21 SECRETARY ANTHONY: No. That concludes my --

22 CHAIRMAN WARFIELD: We certainly want to thank
23 you all again for taking time out of your schedules to
24 come here for this special meeting. At this time, I'll
25 entertain a motion to adjourn the meeting. I'm sorry.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

STATE OF MICHIGAN)
) SS
COUNTY OF MACOMB)

I HEREBY CERTIFY that I reported
stenographically the foregoing proceedings and testimony
under oath at the time and place hereinbefore set forth;
that thereafter the same was reduced to computer
transcription under my supervision; and that this is a
full, true, complete and correct transcription of said
proceedings.



Wendy A. Boer

Wendy A. Boer,
CSR 3505

A

Act 3:18, 20 4:21
Adela 2:7 3:11
adjourn 7:25 8:11
adjourning 8:15
afternoon 3:5
allow 3:25
allows 5:1
Anthony 2:11 3:14
 3:16, 17 5:19, 21
 5:21 6:8, 8, 21
 7:5, 12, 21 8:1, 5
apparent 7:12
APPEARANCES 2:2
appreciate 8:7
appropriate 5:22
Attorney 4:16
aye 5:9 6:5 8:16
 8:17

B

back 5:18, 20, 23
 6:3
Badge 4:13, 14, 14
 4:15 6:14, 23 7:7
Ball 4:13 6:11, 23
Beaubien 1:18
believe 7:9
Board 1:1, 6 3:6, 9
 3:10, 14 4:5 5:14
 6:16, 24
body 3:19, 21, 25
 4:1, 22
Boer 1:22 9:18
brought 4:24

C

call 4:1
called 4:20 6:12
 8:6
calling 8:5
carried 6:7 8:19
carries 5:11
case 6:14, 15, 20, 22
 6:22 7:6, 8, 9, 10
cases 6:12, 13 7:13
 7:14, 15
certainly 7:22
CERTIFICATE 9:1
CERTIFY 9:8
Chair 3:16 5:21
 6:8, 9
Chairman 2:5 3:5, 8
 3:10 5:6, 10, 18
 6:2, 6, 19 7:3, 11
 7:22 8:9, 14, 18
CHAIRPERSON 2:7

charges 4:23
Chief 2:13 3:12, 13
 6:17
close 4:25 5:2
closed 1:7 3:7, 18
 4:1, 3, 5, 18, 19, 22
 5:4, 7, 11, 15, 23
 6:3, 9, 15, 23 7:6
come 5:23, 24 7:24
Commencing 1:20
comments 7:9
Commissioner 2:9
 3:11, 11 5:3, 5, 25
 6:1, 18 7:1 8:12
 8:13
Commissioners 1:1
 3:6, 9, 10 5:9, 15
 6:5 7:17 8:8, 17
complete 9:13
computer 9:11
concluded 8:20
concludes 7:21
conducted 4:3
consider 4:23
contesting 4:18
contravene 7:1
contravened 6:16
 6:18, 24
contravention 6:20
 7:4
convene 5:3
convened 5:15
convening 3:21
correct 8:4 9:13
correction 8:2
counsel 8:2
COUNTY 9:6
CSR 1:22 9:19

D

date 4:10 7:14
decision 3:23
decisions 4:4, 6
defines 3:21
deliberating 3:23
deliberations 4:3
Detroit 1:1, 19 3:1
Donnell 2:9 3:11
door 3:18
DPOA 4:16

E

effect 7:18
effort 7:18
employee 4:24
entertain 7:25
 8:10
excuse 4:10 8:4

EXECUTIVE 2:11**F**

favor 5:8 6:4 8:15
finally 7:5
first 6:14
foregoing 9:9
forth 9:10
four 7:16
full 9:13
further 7:9

G

gentlemen 3:6
George 2:11 3:14
 3:16 4:12 5:21
 6:8, 11, 14
go 5:7, 11 6:13
 7:18, 18
Godbee 2:13 3:13
going 3:14 5:19
Goldpaugh 4:17 8:4
 8:5, 6, 7
good 3:5, 13

H

hear 4:23 7:14
heard 6:9, 10, 15, 22
 7:6, 9
Henry 4:15
hereinbefore 9:10

I

included 7:8
indicate 7:7, 16
individually 6:13
initials 8:6
invitees 4:2
involving 7:6

J

J 8:7
Jackson 4:15
Jamil 4:14 7:7, 10
Jerome 2:5 3:8
John 4:17 8:5, 6, 7
J-a-m-i-l 4:14

K

know 7:15

L

L 4:17 8:6
ladies 3:5
law 3:19
Leonard 4:13 6:11
 6:22

limited 4:1

Loynes 4:12 6:11
 6:14
L-o-y-n-e-s 4:13

M

MACOMB 9:6
majority 4:24
Martin 4:14 7:7
Martin's 7:10
match 7:13
matching 7:16
matters 1:8 3:8
 4:22
MCL 3:24 4:20
meet 4:22
meeting 1:6 3:7, 21
 4:4 7:24, 25 8:11
meetings 3:18, 19
 3:20 4:21
Michigan 1:19 3:1
 3:19 9:4
motion 5:3, 10, 24
 6:6 7:25 8:11, 18
motioned 6:12
move 3:15 6:3
moved 5:6, 25 6:2
 8:12, 14

N

name 3:8
need 7:16

O

oath 9:10
officer 6:11, 11, 14
 6:22 7:7, 8
officers 4:12, 17
OMA 3:20, 20, 25
once 7:15
open 3:18, 20 4:4
 4:21 5:18, 20, 23
 5:24 6:4
opposed 5:10 6:6
 8:18

P

PAGE 1:16
paperwork 7:13, 15
part 4:21
pay 4:8, 11, 19 6:10
 6:17, 25 7:17
personnel 1:8 3:7
 4:22
place 9:10
please 8:15
Police 1:1 2:13
 3:6, 9, 10, 12 4:12

5:14 6:22
policy 3:24
presence 5:1
present 3:22
presented 4:8, 11
problem 8:9
proceedings 8:20
 9:9, 14
properly 5:6 6:2
 8:14
public 3:19, 21, 23
 3:25 4:1, 4, 22
purpose 3:22 4:18
 5:1
purposes 4:2
pursuant 3:18 4:20
put 5:19 7:19
p.m 1:20 3:3 5:14
 5:16 8:21

Q

quorum 3:22 4:25
 5:1

R

Ralph 2:13 3:13
recommendation 4:8
 4:12, 19 6:17
recommendations
 6:10
record 3:17 4:6
 5:22 7:19 8:3, 10
reduced 9:11
regarding 3:7
regards 7:10
rendering 3:23
reported 9:8
REPORTER 9:1
representative
 4:16
request 3:17
requested 4:17 8:2
required 4:25
reschedule 7:14
Rivera 2:7 3:11
 5:3 6:1, 18 7:1
 8:13
Room 1:18

S

schedules 7:23
second 6:1, 21 8:13
seconded 8:15
Secretary 2:11
 3:14, 16 5:21 6:8
 6:21 7:5, 20, 21
 8:1
Section 4:21

Serving 3:9
session 1:7 3:7, 18
 4:1, 3, 5, 18, 20, 23
 4:25 5:2, 4, 7, 11
 5:15, 19, 20, 23, 23
 5:24 6:3, 4, 9, 15
 6:23 7:6
set 9:10
simple 4:24
sir 3:13 5:1 6:7
 6:19 7:3, 11
sorry 7:25
special 1:6 3:7
 7:24
specific 4:2
spell 4:13
SS 9:5
stand 6:17, 24, 25
STATE 9:4
states 4:21
stenographically
 9:9
straight 8:10
Street 1:18
subject 3:20
supervision 9:12
Support 5:5
supported 5:7 6:3
suspension 4:8, 11
 4:19, 23 6:10, 16
 6:24, 25
suspensions 7:17

T

Taken 1:18
testimony 9:9
thank 5:20 6:21
 7:11, 22 8:7, 8, 19
think 4:9 5:22 8:1
three 4:25
Thursday 4:7, 9
time 7:23, 24 8:10
 9:10
today 3:9
today's 4:10
transcription 9:12
 9:13
true 9:13
Tuesday 1:21 3:2
 4:10
two 6:12 7:14

V

Vice 2:7 3:10
vote 4:24

W

want 7:1, 16, 19, 22

Warfield 2:5 3:5, 8
 5:6, 10, 18 6:2, 6
 6:19 7:3, 11, 22
 8:9, 14, 18
weigh 7:17
Welcome 3:6
Wendy 1:22 9:18
We've 8:9
White 2:9 3:12 5:5
 5:25 8:12

1

1 1:16
10 1:21 3:2
10th 4:9, 10
1300 1:18
15.262 (b) 3:24
15.268 (a) 4:20

2

2011 1:21 3:2 4:7

3

3:10 1:20 3:3
3:15 5:14
328 1:18
3505 1:22 9:19
3829 4:15

4

4:35 5:15
4:40 8:20

5

5th 4:7
5008 4:14 7:7

8

8 (a) 4:21

9

9 1:16
973 4:14 6:23
982 4:13 6:15